

Project 530740- TEMPUS-1-2012-1-DK-TEMPUS-SMGR

Enhancing the University Autonomy in Moldova (EUniAM)

www.euniam.aau.dk

Comparative Analysis of University Human Resources in Lithuania, Scotland, Sweden, Denmark and Romania

Prepared by: **Daniela Pojar**

"Alecu Russo" State University Balti

EUniAM Task Force Mission Team

"This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This publication reflects the views only of the authors, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein."

CONTENT

1. PRELIMINARY NOTE	1
2. METHODOLOGY	2
3. CASE STUDY: AUTONOMY OF HUMAN RESOURCES BY COUNTRIES	3
3.1. Lithuania	3
3.2. Scotland	18
3.3. Sweden	37
3.4. Denmark	49
3.5. Romania	59
3.6. Conclusions	80
4. COMPARATIVE STUDY: BENCHMARKING	81
4.1. Freedom /ability to decide on recruitment and employment procedures	84
4.2. Freedom of institutions to decide on the promotion of staff	86
4.3. Freedom to decide on the workload	88
4.4. Freedom to decide on salary system	89
4.5. Freedom to decide on the employment contracts termination method	90
4.6. Conclusions	90
5. FINAL CONCLUSIONS	91
REFERENCES	93
ANNEXES	95

1. Preliminary note

The Human resources (staffing) autonomy is one of the four pillars of university autonomy, materialized in the right of the institutions to set their own recruitment procedures, to develop their own salary (pay) system based on performance indicators specific to each institution of higher education and to decide on the procedures for promoting staff, etc. Human resources (staffing) autonomy as defined in the Declaration of European Universities (2007) presumes the freedom of universities to recruit and select qualified human resources, their responsibility for contracting work, determining salaries and salary increments depending on the value of human potential.

The purpose of this study is to conduct a comparative analysis of human resources (staffing) autonomy in five European countries whose experience and best practices will serve as basis for drafting proposals to amend the existing legal framework in our country. Experience retrieved from these universities will contribute significantly to strengthening university autonomy in the Republic of Moldova.

In this context, all dimensions of human resources autonomy across five European countries will be examined by analyzing a series of regulatory acts, both those issued by universities, as well as those issued by external authorities.

2. Methodology

To achieve the objectives of the study a desk-top research was initially carried out. Analyzing the current research on the comparative study of university autonomy in EU countries (University Autonomy in Europe I (2009) by Thomas Estermann and Terhi Hakki, University Autonomy in Europe II, the Scorecard (2012), by Thomas Estermann, Terhi Hakki and Monika Steinel) and based on the experience gained in preparing the consolidated report on the current situation of university autonomy in higher education institutions of Moldova, criteria (and sub-criteria) were identified that are used to describe human resources (staffing) autonomy of universities.

The first stage was dedicated to the development and improvement of autonomy indicators and to the description of elements which, in terms of higher education institutions, represent certain restrictions. As a result of this phase, Annex 1_Data_collection_template was developed – a template for collecting the data needed for the study.

The second stage was dedicated to collecting and analyzing data derived from regulatory acts which, directly or indirectly, regulate the system of higher education institutions, statutes and other relevant acts of project partner universities in the EU countries.

To ensure clarity and comparability of the results and to get a broader picture of national trends, scope and constraints regarding the institutional autonomy, study visits were conducted at project partner universities in EU countries in the third stage. The results of

stages two and three are shown in Annexes 2_Data_colection-analisys_template, containing analysis of information collected by countries.

As mentioned, this comparative study is developed based on the criteria and sub-criteria, prezented in the table below, which, in our opinion, are characterizing extensively all aspects of human resources autonomy.

Criterion	Sub-criterion	Explanation /Comments	
		(if necessary)	
1. Freedom /ability to decide on recruitment and employment procedures	Bodies responsible for recruitment and employment procedures	Competence of the bodies	
	Recruitment and employment methods and procedures. Approval /confirmation of recruitment /employment	External employment approval	
	Types of employment and employment contracts	Period of employment	
	Conditions for appointment to posts in higher education. Academic career	Description of positions and unification of applied procedures	
	Staff of the institutions	Methodology and approval	
2. Freedom of institutons to decide on the promotion of staff	Evaluation of staff	Procedures, internal and external evaluation	
	Students' role in the promotion of academic staff	Evaluation of academic staff by students	
	Academic mobility of teachers and internationalization policies	Guarantees and compensations for the academic staff	
	Rights and freedoms of higher education staff	University autonomy versus Academic freedom. Sabbatical leave /academic leave	
	Invited academic staff. Honorary titles awarding	Procedures	
3. Freedom to decide on the workload	Structure of teaching /academic workload	Quantification of activities. Their share	
	Working hours. Obligations of higher education institutions' staff	Anual volume of working hours. Functional obligations	
4. Freedom to decide on the salary system	Salary structure. Incentive payments	Fixed pay. Variable pay. Minimal and maximum limits	
	Bodies empowered to set salaries	Internal and external bodies	

	Grounds	for	termination	of	Methods and procedures
5. Freedom to decide on the	employmen	t cont	racts, specific	for	
termination of employment	higher educ	ation			
contracts	Termination of employment contracts with managerial staff				Grounds and competences
	with manag	CITAI SU	am		

Case Study, benchmarking analysis, is presented in Chapter IV. The criteria and sub-criteria respectively (Table I) served as basis for carrying out benchmarking analysis. For this purpose the template for benchmarking analysis has been developed (Table 3 Consolidated Report). Benchmarking analysis of data is presented in Table 2 (Chapter IV).

3. Case Study: Autonomy of Human Resources by Countries

3.1. Lithuania

3.1.1. Freedom /ability to decide on recruitment and employment procedures

Law on Higher Education and Research (no. XI-242 of 30 April 2009) of the Republic of Lithuania states that the mission of higher education and research is to ensure the country's public, cultural and economic prosperity. Relevant policies developed at the country level guarantees the quality of the entire system by involving the best academic staff in teaching and research activities. In this regard, the right /freedom of higher education institutions to decide on the procedures of recruitment and employment of the best performing employees, depending on the institutional strategy, is recognized. At the same time, each higher education institution is obliged to respect the fundamental rights and freedoms of employees, guaranteed by the legislative acts containing labour law rules. Internal regulations with respect to labour relations should be developed in strict accordance with the general regulations of the labour law. Freedom of higher education institutions to decide on recruitment and employment procedures is correlated with the general principles of the labor law: neither higher education institution, regarless of how much autonomy it has, should establish internal regulations pertaining to employment and recruitment which would contravene the Labour Code of the Republic of Lithuania.

3.1.1.1. Bodies responsible for recruitment and employment procedures

Law on Higher Education and Research lays down general rules for the proper functioning of higher education institutions. Art. 20 of the Law establishes the Council of Higher Education Institution as higher governing body of the institution. The legislature has invested the Council with the following rights, related to the employment procedures:

- a) Develop procedures and employment criteria for the position of rector of the higher education institution, as well as procedures and grounds for his/her dismissal;
- b) Elaborate selection criteria and principles of employment of higher education institutions' staff.

The Statute of Mykolo Romeris University, published in the original version in the Official Gazette of the Republic of Lithuania on 23.07.2009 (last amendment of 26.07.2012), empowers the Council with the following rights:

- Setting the procedure of organisation of the University Rector elections through open competition;
- Electing, appointing to the office and dismissing from it the Rector;
- Setting the principles of selection and employment of the University staff.

From what was reported it emerges the idea that human resource autonomy, in terms of the right of the institution to set its own recruitment procedures and criteria for employment, is one large. The hiring of any employee of an institution of higher education is not confirmed /approved by any external authority; approval/confirmation for managerial positions is not required either. For example, the procedure for the employment of the Rector of higher education institutions is described broadly in art. 22 of the Law on Higher Education and Research. Similarly, Section III of the Statute of Mykolo Romeris University of Vilnius describes in detail this procedure. The Council, the supreme management body of higher education institution, is the authority empowered to establish the rules and procedures for the elections of the Rector. The Council announces an open competition to fill the position of Rector. The Rector is considered to be elected, if at least three-fifths of the Council members have voted in his favour. To be able to participate in the contest for the position of rector the candidate must meet the following conditions: hold a scientific degree or be a person recognized in the field of arts (available for higher education institutions in the artistic field), with experience in teaching and management. The Statute of Mykolo Romeris University provides a detailed description of the competition. If no candidate received the required number of votes in the first round then another round of elections will be announced additionally which will include only the top two candidates who obtained the majority of votes. After announcing the results of competition, the Chairman of the Council or any other person authorised by the Council will sign, on behalf of the University, an employment contract with the elected Rector for the duration of his term of office. The Rector's term of office is five years. The same person may be elected Rector of the University for not more than two terms of office in succession and not earlier than after an interval of five years since the end of the last term of office, if the last term of office was the second consecutive term.

A very important detail that deserves to be highlighted is that no external authority shall confirm the election of the rector, the institution is absolutely atonomous in fulfilling its right to recruit and elect the executive manager. Despite the fact that the Law on Higher Education and Research describes the procedure of election, unifying it for all institutions in the country, each institution is free to decide definitively on the optimal candidate.

The Rector, in turn, has certain responsibilities related to achieving freedom /ability of the institution to decide on the procedures for recruitment/employment as follows:

• Issuing administrative orders binding to staff;

- Recruiting and dismissing university employees;
- Submitting to the Senate for approval the candidatures of Vice Rectors, University Chancellor, Faculty Deans, Department Heads and Institute Directors;
- Approving Faculty Deputy Deans on the recommendation of the Deans;
- Defining the functions and powers of the Vice Rectors and Chancellor.

The Rector may delegate part of his functions to the Vice Rectors and the Chancellor by an order. The Rector shall be substituted by a person authorised by the decision of the Council in case of his long-term absence.

3.1.1.2. Recruitment and employment methods and procedures. Approval /confirmation of recruitment /employment

Employment of academic staff takes place in strict accordance with the regulations stipulated in the Law on Higher Education and Research, and with the internal regulations of higher education institutions. Mykolo Romeris University has developed a series of internal administrative acts, including the Statute and Strategic Development Plan of the University, which refers to the recruitment and employment procedures for staff.

The procedure for announcing vacancies is open, both for teaching and research staff, and for administrative staff, as well. Decision about announcing the contest is taken by the rector of higher education institution. Under the law, in terms of three months remaining until the expiration of the employment contract of a member of the academic staff of higher education and research institution, a contest will be announced based on the principle of open competition order to occupy such positions. The competition is open to persons within the educational institution, as well as from the outside. The announcement about the launch of a competition for a position must be published on the websites of the institution and the Research Council of Lithuania, as well as in Lithuanian and, where appropriate, international media.

The competition procedure for filling vacant teaching positions is described in the Regulation on recruitment, assessment and certification procedures for academic and research staff of Mykolo Romeris University. The bodies, responsible for the organization of the contest, are the Salary and Employment Committee for secondary academic and research positions (in the case of secondary didactic staff) and the Salary and Employment Committee for senior academic and research positions (in the case of senior didactic staff)). At least 1/3 of the Committee members should be from outside the academic community and, at least, one international expert must be involved when recruiting candidates for the positions of professor and senior researcher.

When referring to filling up certain management positions such as vice-rector, dean, head of department, then the following recruitment procedure will be applied: vacancies of vice-rectors and deans are advertised in the newspaper. There is a selection of candidates based on CV; the rector selects the best candidates and presents the candidate to the Faculty (in the

case of deans). Subsequently, the Rector will submit to the Senate for approval the candidatures of Vice-Rector, Chancellor, Deans and Heads of Departments. Also on the recommendation of Deans the Rector will approve Deputy Deans' applications. Academic activity of Deans is supplementary work to the basic managerial position. The Dean can have up to 0.5 teaching load. This limitation of teaching activity also refers to other persons who hold administrative positions.

In Lithuania legislation sets restrictions to the right of access to certain positions in higher education institutions for those persons who have been convicted of certain deeds, which are incompatible with scientific-didactic activity, or have certain restrictions to filling up certain administrative positions.

3.1.1.3. Types of employment and employment contracts

Scientific-didactic positions will be filled as basic positions through a contest; as a first step, an individual employment contract will be signed for a period of five years, then after the second consecutive period, the individual employment contract will be concluded for an undetermined period. The competition will be launched by Rector's decision. After accepting candidatures for the contest, dossier evaluation will be conducted in accordance with the procedure established by various laws and regulations. Mykolo Romeris University has constituted the Recruitment Committee by Senate decision, which assesses the applications of participants in the contest. This Committee will not assess dossiers of candidates to post-doctoral fellowships. No less than one third of the members of the Recruitment Committee should be people who do not work at the University. When the contest for the position of professor is announced, at least one international expert should be involved in the Recruitment Committee.

A person, who intends to work part-time at the university, will indicate his position (type of work) at the place of full-time employment or other jobs, where he works part-time, in the application for participation in the competition.

All employment related disputes shall be settled by the Committee for Labour Disputes Settlement out of court.

3.1.1.4. Conditions for appointment to positions in higher education. Academic career

The Law on Higher Education establishes minimum conditions for appointment to scientific-didactic posts in higher education institutions, laying down that the institution has the right to set its own criteria, which cannot be lower than those set out in the Law. In accordance with the legal provisions the following criteria are established for the appointment to scientific-didactic positions, as follows:

• The position of university professor can be held by a scholar or an outstanding personality in the artistic field (valid for higher education institutions of arts). The scholar who will hold the position of university professor will coordinate the activities of other academic staff, will teach students, lead research and development activities, making the results public;

- The position of associate professor can be held by a scholar or an outstanding personality in the artistic field (valid for higher education institutions of arts), who will teach students, lead research and development activities, making the results public;
- The position of lecturer can be filled by a researcher or a person who holds, at least, the Master's degree or its equivalent. During employment, the lecturer will be responsible for teaching students and will undertake methodological work;
- For candidates to the position of assistant professor it is mandatory to hold the Master's degree or its equivalent. The job of assistant professor will be oriented towards the students' practical training activities. At the same time he will assist research and development works.

The establishment of minimum conditions for appointment to scientific-didactic positions by the higher education framework-law comes to support the idea that university human resources autonomy should be correlated with the principle of public accountability of the institution, the University being free to select its staff, to establish its own criteria (which shall not be lower than those established by law), but selection should be among the best candidates or the State, being aware of the role of University in society, establishes rules that will lead to the fact that the option of higher education institutions will be in favour of the best performing candidates.

Internal regulations of Mykolo Romeris University establish the conditions of filling a certain position.

Decision of the University Senate of 22.12.2005 establishes the minimum requirements which the candidate to an academic position must meet (teaching and research) within the institution. For example, to hold the position of associate professor, after obtaining a PhD degree, the candidate must meet one of the following conditions, at least:

- to publish a significant scientific monograph, a study, an original fundamental or theoretical scientific research, published by the University or by another recognized publisher;
- to have published scientific articles and have developed methodical guides;
- to publish a scientific paper, a manual and a scientific article;
- to publish various materials or achieve significant applied research and have published at least one scientific article.

The procedure for granting scientific-didactic titles of associate professor and university professor.

By Decision of the Senate Mykolo Romeris University of 12 May 2008 it was established that the scientific-didactic titles mentioned above are awarded to university lecturers by the

Senate, at the proposal of the Faculty Councils, if the candidate meets the following conditions:

- to work in the position of university professor/associate professor for 5 years with a teaching load of not less than 0.25 unit;
- to be certified (attested) at the end of employment, according to internal procedures developed by the Senate;
- to hold scientific degree;
- to meet the requirements for the position of university professor /associate professor.

Awarding of scientific-didactic title may be decided by the Senate earlier than 5 years if the person meets all the requirements listed above, but not earlier than 2 years.

It should also be noted that staff of higher education institutions do not have the status of civil servant, this provision includes only managerial positions: Rector, Vice-rector, Chancellor, Dean, etc.

3.1.1.5. Staff of the institutions

University staff consists of teaching and research staff, administrative staff and other staff responsible for the daily operations of the University. Labour relations, social guarantees, rights and obligations of the employees and the University are established by laws, the Statute of the University and other normative acts issued by the competent authorities, and other acts adopted by the governing bodies of the University.

In Lithuania there is no methodology, both at national and institutional level, which would establish criteria under which the required number of teaching or administrative positions is approved. As noted by Mykolo Romeris University officials when there is a degree programme in place, the necessary number of teaching positions is determined depending on the subjects taught. Also, it is not necessary that staff of higher education institutions must be approved by an external authority; the institution receives budget funding per student, which forms a joint budget of the institution along with other sources of income.

According to Government Decree (no. 402 of 13.05.2009) on establishing norms for estimating the cost of studies for places funded by the state budget, there are 7 types of formulas to calculate the number of teaching staff demanded, correlated to the number of students. In accordance with this methodology, one teaching position (one unit staff) is necessary for an average of 20 students and an administrative- technical position is demanded for an average of 25 students. These are the criteria underlying budgetary financing, otherwise, as previously mentioned, the staff positions' development is the prerogative of higher education institutions.

Conclusions through the Government-University interface

Art. 7 of the Law on Higher Education and Research defines how autonomy of higher education institutions is achieved, correlated with public accountability of higher education institutions. Generally, university autonomy of human resources is achieved by the institution prerogative to decide on establishing its own structure, its own internal working methods, staffing, rights, obligations and conditions of payment system for the work done, terms of filling a certain position, setting certain performance indicators for employees, taking into account the legislation in force.

It is this provision that draws the intersection in the relationship between the **Government and University.** Exercising the freedom of higher education institution to decide on the recruitment and employment of staff should not limit the rights and freedoms guaranteed to employees and employers through various legislative acts. Art. 11 of the Labour Code of the Republic of Lithuania states that in case of occurrence of certain contradictions between the institution's internal regulations and the provisions of the Labour Code, the provisions of the last act will apply. However paragraph 2 of the Labour Code states that where internal documents contain provisions with more favourable rules for the employee these will apply. So, the institution has the right to develop its own procedures, to set its own criteria of employment to the extent that they do not contravene the rules of the labour law.

3.1.4. Freedom of institutions to decide on the promotion of staff

This criterion of university autonomy in the area of human resources materializes in the right of higher education institution to decide on providing career development of staff by shifting to a higher professional degree, position or level.

3.1.2.1. Evaluation of staff

Staff assessment procedures are part of the quality assurance system of each institution and shall be in accordance with the Law of Higher Education and Research. These procedures are developed by each institution and the evaluation itself is carried out by internal university structures empowered with this law by the University Council and the Senate.

In particular, Mykolo Romeris University has two units responsible for the evaluation and certification of personnel, depending on the position held by the employee under evaluation. The initiation of certification /assessment procedure is done by the Rector, at the proposal of Deans, Directors of institutes /research centers.

Assessment could be done:

- periodically, which can be applied in relation to the staff employed under employment agreements concluded for an indefinite period;
- intermediary, which applies to staff employed for a period of 5 years, mid-term;
- extraordinarily that apply in the event of any potential risk that an employee will not meet the qualification requirements needed for the position holder; unqualified execution of work obligations or failure in adhering to the values of higher education institution.

Evaluation /certification involves an analysis and examination of the compliance of results achieved by the academic staff with the qualification requirements, loyalty to the values of the University, contribution to teaching, creativity, as well as the results obtained in research. The assessment takes into account both the results and the new perspectives. In this respect, various relevant documents (certificates of scientific papers accepted for printing, new monographs written, development of new curricula, etc.) will be presented.

Each person who is subject to evaluation will be announced by the Department of Human Resources on the date, time and place where the evaluation will take place by e-mail at least two weeks before the event. If the employee is not able to be present for some objective reasons or in case of refusal to participate in the evaluation meeting, the procedure can take place in his absence. The period of employment under evaluation is 2 years, or 5 years when assessing employees with an employment agreement with a duration of 5 years; in case of extraordinary evaluation it will be taken into account the period from the last assessment to the current evaluation date.

Also, those employees, who have been on maternity leave or/and on leave for child care until the age of three years, will be not subject to evaluation and a dispensation of time will be given to them to improve their portfolios.

The result of employee's periodic evaluation will be certified, certified with honours and non-certified. Based on these results, the Evaluation Committee will make proposals on the teacher's salary and can decide whether the employee meets or not the conditions for access to a higher position.

If extraordinary evaluation, the result will be: certified or uncertified.

The evaluation result will be recorded in the minutes of the meeting, which will include conclusions and reasons regarding the taken decision. The minutes shall be signed by the Chairman of the Evaluation Committee, and in his absence by the Chairman of the sitting. For the final outcome of the evaluation procedure unanimity is not required, but only a simple majority. In all cases secrecy of the vote will be ensured. The employee will be notified upon signature on the minutes of the evaluation meeting. It is considered that the employee is familiar with the assessment results, even in case of his absence from the meeting of the Evaluation Committee.

If non-certification of employee occurs, the employment agreement will be terminated under this ground, in accordance with the legal provisions in force.

In case the employee does not agree with the result of the evaluation, it is entitled to apply to the Committee for settlement of labour disputes, citing procedural violations, within three days from the date when the employee became acquainted upon signature with the minutes of the evaluation meeting. Committee for settlement of labour disputes will hold a meeting to resolve the complaint no later than 7 days from its submission. Committee's decision on the rejection or acceptance of the complaint is taken within 14 days since the complaint was submitted. If the complaint is admitted, the employee will be re-evaluated. The Evaluation

Committee will adopt a new decision within 5 working days. A new complaint against a new decision of the Evaluation Committee shall be submitted only to the competent court.

3.1.2.2. Students' role in the promotion of academic staff

Generally, according to the Law of Higher Education and Research of the Republic of Lithuania, students have the right to choose the teacher to attend a particular subject if the subject is taught by more teachers.

Students in Lithuania are entitled under applicable law, to assess the quality of teaching and curricular support used by a particular teacher.

For example, at Mykolo Romeris University it is customary on-line evaluation of the content and teaching methods by students throughout the study year. At the end of the academic year data is counted. This assessment is essential for determining the quality indicators in the university, having a significant impact on the quality of the teaching process. The Deans and the Rector meet regularly with representatives of the students to discuss the problems encountered in the learning process and to find common solutions to solve them.

If a student believes that his rights have been violated in a certain way, he can appeal to higher education institution administration to defend them. In this respect, the law requires that every institution of higher education establishes a Committee for the settlement of disputes that arise between students and staff of higher education institution. Membership Committee will be established on the principle of parity, being composed of an equal number of representatives of the administration of higher education institution and an equal number of representatives of student organizations. Committee's procedure is regulated by the Statute of the higher education institution.

Complaints submitted by students will be examined within one month. Committee's meetings are considered valid if at least 2/3 of its members meet. Decisions will be validated if they are taken by simple majority vote of the Committee. The Committee's decision, which is the final one, will be presented to the student in writing.

3.1.2.3. Academic mobility of teachers and internationalization policies

Staff mobility is encouraged, internationalization being a strategic priority of the Lithuanian higher education. In this respect, universities are free to establish their own procedures for achieving mobility. Mykolo Romeris University does not operate suspension of employment agreements for the mobility period, regardless of how long it is. Full salary is maintained during three months and, after this period, only 30 percent of salary is maintained. In this sense, higher education institutions are free to establish their own procedures and rules that are part of their strategic priority, as well as taking into account the economic and financial situation of each institution.

Similarly, there is no legal impediment to academic staff from outside Lithuania to work in higher education institutions under the same conditions as nationals of Lithuania.

3.1.2.4. Rights and freedoms of higher education staff

The law grants to the staff of higher education institutions and research the following rights:

- to participate in competitions for obtaining grants and funds for research and to use these resources according to their destination;
- to participate in competitions for postdoctoral fellowships in Lithuania and abroad;
- to obtain information from state institutions that is necessary to conduct research work. Where such information is declared to be state secrets or is considered information with official status, it will be provided and applied according to the existing legislation;
- to formulate proposals for the amendment of a normative act and participate in the development of internal regulations of higher education institution;
- to become a member of various associations and trade unions in the country and abroad;
- to work independently or join various research and creation groups;
- to publish their scientific work independently.

As for the right of academic and research staff to holidays, they receive annual leave with extended length; thus, art. 167 of the Lithuanian Labour Code stipulates that employees whose work involves more psycho-emotional effort benefit from extended annual leave lasting 58 days. Art. 178 of the same law governs the categories of additional leaves, making reference to the creation leave (sabbatical leave). Art. 182 of the same law defines this notion, stating that this type of leave is granted for the completion of a thesis, writing of scientific papers, etc., the length and conditions of granting being governed by the internal regulations of the institution. The Law on Higher Education and Research provides that for every five years of academic activity, members of academic staff can be released from scientific and didactic work for a period of one year to improve their qualifications. During this period the employee will be paid the average salary.

3.1.2.5. Invited academic staff. Honorary titles awarding

Higher education institutions have the right to invite academic and research staff from abroad to work in the university, under employment agreements concluded for a determined period not exceeding a 2 years term. Recruitment of these employees is a simplified procedure, preceded only by the invitation of the administration of the institution, without initiating any competition.

Higher education institutions are entitled under the legislation to award the following honorary titles: Research Associate and Professor Emeritus.

The title "Research Associate" is awarded to a scientist (researcher) who once worked in the higher education institution, but currently, working under an employment agreement in

another higher education institution. With prior approval of the University Senate, the Research Associate can return to the university without the need for a competition and hold the above-named position until the end of the employment agreement. The period during which the Research Associate worked in another university is considered work period and should be included in the calculation of the employment period.

The honorary title "Professor Emeritus" is awarded by the University Senate to a professor who has performed outstanding academic activity in the higher education institution. Professor Emeritus has the right to participate in the academic and research activities of the institution. The holder of this position is paid a monthly Professor Emeritus salary, paid from the University funds established particularly for this purpose.

Conclusions through the Government – University interface

Law on Higher Education and Research establishes minimum conditions necessary for the evaluation of academic staff. For the realization of university freedom in setting its own criteria and procedures for staff evaluation, Mykolo Romeris University has developed its own Regulation. State intervention in this area is minimal, given that performance indicators underlying the institutional accreditation involve a serious and rigorous evaluation of staff.

3.1.3. Freedom to decide on the workload

Freedom to decide on labour norming lies in the higher education institution right to decide on the distribution of working time, work norms, accurate determination of work tasks that should be carried out by a member of the academic community.

3.1.3.1. Structure of teaching /academic workload

As mentioned, workload of academic staff consists of teaching and research. For the intended teaching activities, 100% salary is guaranteed, for research which represents about 40% of the workload, payment will be made depending on whether the staff have carried out all research activities that are part of this normative work (scientific publications in certain journals, participation in scientific conferences and forums etc.) planned for different categories of academic staff. If not all activities have been carried out, research activity will be paid proportionally to the work done.

3.1.3.2. Working hours. Obligations of higher education institutions' staff

Working time is the period of time that employees of higher education institution, in accordance with the regulations, use to fulfil labour obligations. Since teaching and research involve an increased psycho-emotional effort, the legislator has established the reduced duration of working time. For non-teaching staff of higher education institutions, the normal working time is 40 hours weekly. According to internal regulations of Mykolo Romeris University the annual normal academic workload (unit) is allocated for 1000 hours, of which 400 hours are for research and 600 hours are for teaching. The hours for teaching include also a volume of administrative workload which should be carried out by each scientific and didactic employee. When referring to contact hours, then the situation is outlined as follows:

professors – 160 hours; associate professors – 240 hours; lecturers – 280 hours and assistant lecturers will fulfil a volume of 320 hours.

According to the Law on Higher Education and Research, the general responsibility of the Lithuanian academic community is to comply with the tasks and obligations under the individual employment agreement, to fulfil work obligations set out in the job descriptions, qualitatively and quantitatively.

Generally each higher education institution has its own Code of Ethics, which rules should be observed by all members of the academic community.

3.1.4. Freedom /ability of universities to decide on the salary system

The freedom of higher education institution to decide on the labour remuneration system is manifested by its right to decide on the salary system, bonuses, setting various salary increases depending on the complexity of work performed and the volume of works carried out by an employee.

For example, certain procedures for ranking university faculties and staff were established within Mykolo Romeris University in order to make staff motivation mechanisms more efficient, to improve the quality of teaching and research and to make staff assessment more impartial. Academic staff rating is done by the departments and monitored by the faculties.

Practically, carried out activities are given a score as:

- training and methodological activities 40%;
- scientific publications 40%¹;
- other research activities (without publications), organizational work and participation in project management -10%;
- civic activities 10%.

Rating procedure takes place as follows:

- each member of the academic staff fills in an online questionnaire, which is approved by the Head of Department. After counting annual results, each teacher can check personal outcomes and can compare them at departmental, faculty and university levels;
- the same methodology is applied to establish the rating of university faculties. Counting of annual results brings a score to the faculty, grading it on a certain place in the university rating, based on the above mentioned criteria;
- rating results are discussed at departmental and faculty levels, and at general assembly of the university, where the weaknesses and strengths of a particular teacher, a particular department or faculty are highlighted; recommendations and directions for improvements, and activities to be completed in the coming years are set;

• supplements to wages shall be reviewed annually, based on the results of academic staff rating.

Mykolo Romeris University policies on the remuneration of performed labour are geared towards highlighting personal merit and individual results of each employee.

3.1.4.1. Salary structure. Incentive payments

Referring to the salary structure it should be noted that both activities, teaching and research, are remunerated in Lithuania.

If we talk about the salary structure then it consists of a fixed part and a variable one. The fixed part of the salary is the same for similar academic positions and does not depend on the scientific degree or length of service of a particular employee; therefore salary is not negotiable, the salary scale being not applicable to a particular position. Salary is distinct only for different academic positions, e.g. the salary of the professor is different from the salary of the lecturer. The state guarantees the minimum wage for any employee of the higher education institution, but does not limit the maximum amount of wages that can be received.

For further accomplishments there will be set additional salary payments. In this regard, the employees will be assessed; moreover, an evaluation every five years is compulsory for those members of the academic staff who have employment agreements concluded for an indefinite period.

Mykolo Romeris University of Vilnius has developed internal administrative regulations relating to the remuneration of staff working in the institution.

According to the Regulation on the salary system of Mykolo Romeris University, approved by the University Council Decision, salary structure differs depending on the category of staff.

Remuneration of teaching and research staff

Their salary consists of a fixed part (comprising funds transferred from the state budget - price of studies, University's own funds, the funds transferred from the Research Council of Lithuania, including European funds), a variable part and a lump sum, the last being paid exclusively to the teaching staff.

The fixed part of the salary is paid for the monthly fulfilled workload, according to the labour obligations of the employee. The fixed part is identical for identical functions.

The variable part consists of the following salary bonuses and pay supplements:

• leadership bonuses and allowances, paid as percentage amount of the wage function (e.g. up to 25% for the President of the Senate, between 15-30% for the heads of departments (this amount is set up according to the number of positions), up to 15% for the deputy heads of departments, up to 20% for programme directors);

- salary supplements for labour intensity, determined for deans and depending on the faculty outcomes, without limitation of their amount;
- salary supplements for carrying out labour obligations of temporarily absent employees up to 50%;
- salary supplements for additional work carried out up to 100%;
- salary supplements for complexity of the tasks performed up to 100%;
- salary supplements for joint study programmes with a higher education institution outside Lithuania;
- salary supplement for the development, submission and implementation of a new study program;
- salary supplement for performance in teaching and research;
- salary supplement for young professionals employed full-time up to 100% of the position salary;
- loyalty bonus, which can range from 10 % to 25% depending on years of service to the university;

The lump sum is awarded exclusively to academic staff employed as a teacher for the following accomplishments: for supervising PhD students, who defend their thesis ahead of schedule; for labour accomplishments during a calendar year, etc.

Remuneration of non-teaching staff

The salary structure for non-teaching staff is consisting of a fixed part and a variable one. The variable part may be granted in the following cases:

- Performance salary supplement up to 100%;
- salary supplement for additional work;
- salary supplement for young professionals;
- management supplements, etc.

Remuneration of administrative staff is done according to the same methodology; the Rector, Vice-rectors and Chancellor shall have the same salary supplements as other employees.

3.1.4.2. Bodies empowered to set salaries

Responsibility for establishing the system of remuneration and methodology rests solely with the higher education institution. The University Council is responsible for the management, use and disposition of funds for the remuneration of employees of the institution. As previously mentioned, higher education institution does not submit the staff structure to any authority for approval. The university draws up its annual revenues and expenditures budget, which comprises expenses for labour remuneration. Funding for education coming from the Lithuanian government is used for various needs of the institution including those related to staff salaries. Correctness and lawfulness of the use of funds intended for labour remuneration is reviewed by the Lithuanian state financial bodies. It should be noted that verification is not aimed at determining whether certain salaries were set of a certain amount, but to determine whether the provisions of the internal administrative regulations of higher education institution have been observed.

However, this freedom, as component of human resources autonomy, is limited by the State, which affirms that every employer must comply with the principle of fairness in paying wages, which is manifested by the fact that the institution must ensure equal pay for similar work activities. Another provision of the Labour Code of the Republic of Lithuania, which draws as well the point of intersection of **GOVERNMENT – UNIVERSITY** interface, is the provision that any institution, including higher education ones, must guarantee as priority the payment of wages before any other claims of the institution.

3.1.5. Freedom to decide on the employment contracts termination

In Lithuania the termination of employment agreements of higher education institutions staff is done in strict accordance with the requirements of the Labour Code of Lithuania.

3.1.5.1. Grounds for termination of employment contracts, specific for higher education

The grounds for termination of employment contracts concluded with the staff of higher education institutions are in strict accordance with the law. In particular, agreements are considered terminated if the period for which they have been concluded expired, if the employee has died and at the initiative of either party. Obviously, dismissal as a way to terminate the employment contract is an expression of the fundamental right to work, the person being free to work in any institution. Termination of employment relationships at the initiative of the higher education institution can take place where the employee neglects his work obligations or there is a legal order prohibition to perform some activities (art. 128-130 Lithuanian Labour Code).

A specific reason for the higher education institution is the case of non-attestation or non-certification of the employee; in this case, the employment contract shall terminate under this grounds, in accordance with the legal provisions in force. Here, the interaction with higher education institution freedom occurs regarding the decision on the termination of employment relationships: when there are performance indicators established in accordance with the institution regulations and the employee does not meet the requirements for a position, the employer is entitled to terminate labour relations, emphasizing the quality and performance of employed staff.

3.1.5.2. Termination of employment contracts with managerial staff

Rector's period of office is five years. With the expiry of that period the employment agreement with the Rector ceases. As the Rector forms the management team, including

Vice-rectors and the Chancellor, the termination of their employment agreements occurs simultaneously with that of the rector.

If the annual activity report submitted by the Rector to the University Council is not approved by the majority of Council members, the rector can be removed from office by a majority vote of the Council members.

Conclusions through the Government – University interface

Stability of employment relationships, being a fundamental principle of the right to work, is guaranteed by the Lithuanian State. Universities are required to act within the law, being autonomous to establish criteria underlying the employee's performance evaluation and a possible non-certification /non-attestation of staff would serve as grounds for the termination of employment agreement.

3.2. Scotland

3.2.1. Freedom /ability to decide on recruitment and employment procedures

Scottish higher education system is regulated by a series of complex regulations established basically in papal decrees, statutes, royal charters and other regulations. Whatever type of regulatory enactment containing regulating principles of the higher education system, universities are autonomous and independent institutions, non-profit, having a collective governing body which, jointly with the Rector (head of the higher education institution), is responsible for the operations and strategy of the institution, correct and consistent use of financial resources. State interference in the field of higher education is very low, the last enjoying full autonomy in terms of human resources.

3.2.1.1. Bodies responsible for recruitment and employment procedures

In accordance with the Scottish Code for Good HE Governance [1], the executive management is carried out by the University Court, which among other tasks is entitled, inter alia, to employ the Principle (rector), as executive manager of the institution, as well as to monitor the work carried out by him.

As well, the Court, after consultation with the University Senate is entitled to employ the Chancellor of the institution.

In particular the Court has the following responsibilities regarding human resources:

- It is the body responsible for the employment of the university staff and for drafting normative acts related to employment procedures;
- It is responsible for the employment of the Principle and Vice-Chancellor of the university, having the right to determine the conditions of employment and the main

contractual clauses, and during their activity is responsible for the monitoring of their work performance;

• It is responsible for the employment of the Executive Manager and for the monitoring of the way how he/she separates the line of public responsibility to the Court from the university administration, and for the fulfilment of managerial obligations within the institution.

The University of Strathclyde set up the Staff Committee responsible for the procedures and strategies related to human resources. Apart from the fact that the Committee is responsible for developing human resources policies and strategies, it shall have the role of supervisor to what extent human resources related activities are compliant with the legislation.

Generally the Staff Committee is responsible for:

- a) implementing human resources strategies and their adjustment to the overall strategy of the university;
- b) optimal selection of staff policies and procedures for the recruitment, evaluation and maintenance of competent human resources;
- c) adjusting recruitment procedures to the legal and labour market needs;
- d) periodic review of personnel procedures in order to ensure their sustainability and relevance.

The Committee is composed of: Vice-principal/Deputy Principal ex officio Convener, Principal ex officio, Deputy Convener of Court (Staff) ex officio, One further lay member of Court, Two Senior members of staff with staff management experience appointed by Senate, Chief Financial Officer ex officio, Director of Human Resources ex officio, and Secretary of the Governing Body, and elected members are: a representative of the Court and two members of senior management appointed by the Senate.

3.2.1.2. Recruitment and employment procedures. Approval /confirmation of recruitment /employment

In Scotland all higher education institutions are free to decide on the recruitment procedures, developing their own rules associated with this procedure. Regarding the University of Starthclyde, there are a number of exhaustive internal applicable regulations, as there are no external recruitment procedures. In accordance with these procedures, University of Starthclyde comprises the following categories of staff:

Senior Officers of the University (the Principal, the Vice-Principal, the Chief Operating Officer, the Chief Financial Officer, executive deans, etc

Teaching staff (teaching activities);

Academic staff (academic, research, teaching and knowledge exchange);

Support staff (administrative and professional services, technical and operational services).

The University of Strathclyde manages a wide range of policies and procedures designed to ensure the employment of staff within the university. They are designed to provide methodological and practical support to managers and staff regarding the university vision and university position to staff working activity.

Being the subject of social dialogue and consultation between the parties of the employment relationships, procedures can be modified or supplemented, due to the changes in the labour laws or the implementation of best practices in human resources management, and change of the university vision and mission.

Employment of staff varies depending on the category of staff. There is no external authority confirming employment or approving the appointment, not even in the case of managerial positions. The recruitment procedure begins by filling in an application form called RECRUITMENT SCHEDULE, by the recruiting manager and officer in charge of the Department of Human Resources. Above-mentioned document contains details about the vacant position, advertising information about the vacancy, etc.

Before declaring vacant a position it is necessary to justify all economic issues. After filling in all necessary documents, job descriptions are developed with complete description of the tasks required to be performed under the internal rules.

All vacancies will be advertised both nationally and internationally, in order to select the best performing candidate. The period of validity of the announcement depends on the nature of the job declared vacant. However, the University of Starthclyde places information about vacancies on the jobs.ac.uk site and on the the University of Starthclyde website. Publication of the announcement about the vacancy in the newspaper is not mandatory and depends on the nature of vacancy, priority being online posting of the notice about the vacancy.

When a potential candidate from outside the UK is expected to participate in the recruitment, the notice about the vacancy will be placed on the site, 28 days before the selection procedure, in accordance with the requirements of the UK Border Agency. Such a procedure is used when it is necessary to employ staff with special skills. It is binding that the announcement contains information about the salary.

The announcement is prepared by the head of the department where the potential employee will work, but it requires also the approval of the representative of the Human Resources Department. The text must be concise but clear enough for the potential candidate to be able to formulate an opinion on whether he/she fits or not the vacant position.

3.2.1.3. Types of employment and employment contracts

Employment contracts in higher education institutions of Scotland may be concluded for a determined period or for an indeterminate period. Under UK legislation on Labour Law there is an agreement at national level, establishing the probationary period in order to verify the

professional skills of the new employees. Each employee is given the right to establish their own methodology on probation.

To meet the requirements of a modern autonomous university the University of Strathclyde has developed its own methodology regarding the probationary period. The reason for the established methodology is the need to determine if the potential employee will be able to make a long lasting academic career taking into account the departmental and institutional strategy. The probationary period allows full-time employees to demonstrate that they are able to fulfill the tasks as a member of the academic community. As well, it is recognized the institution's responsibility for staff career development during the probationary period and the assistance needed by each full-time employee to comply with the institutional standards. Generally, the university will contribute to:

- increasing the efficiency of the newly hired employee;
- identifying and developing the needs for training;
- complying with the requirements of the job;
- understanding the job objectives and regular evaluation of job performance.

Actual duration of probationary period is stated in the employment contract of each employee. Its length will differ depending on the position held and the duration of the employment contract. The duration will depend on the complexity and the impact of the probationary period on the development of the new employee and his correspondence with the rigors of the job. Usually the probationary period takes 6 to 36 months. During the probationary period, the full-time employee will be provided with assistance offered by the Head of department and the Dean. A mentor throughout the probationary period is appointed for each employee in order to provide the necessary support. The mentor will be an experienced member of the academic community, in the activity area of the employee during the probationary period. Together they will draw up a plan of activities necessary to be achieved by the newly hired employee and the mentor will assist with the diligence required by an appropriate mentor.

During the probationary period, regular performance evaluation will be carried out and all necessary measures will be taken to improve performance. The employee subjected to the probationary period will be continuously monitored by the Head of the given unit. During this time the employee is obliged to acquire a minimum of 30 credits by attending the training courses made available by the university, including the psycho-pedagogical module.

At the end of probationary period the employee will be evaluated by a specially constituted committee, based on the following criteria: teaching, research and administration. The evaluation results will be essential for further activity of the employee. In case of unsatisfactory results of the probationary period, the employment contract will cease based on this ground, observing the rigors of the law. The employee is guaranteed the right to appeal against the decision of the evaluation committee.

The employment contracts of staff enrolled in doctoral studies.

If we talk about the conclusion of the employment relationships for the length of doctoral studies, it is necessary to emphasize that research during doctoral studies involves a special effort since it would not leave free space for employment activities with partial regime. However, it is not uncommon for a PhD student to work part-time, especially to carry out teaching activities. In some disciplines doctoral students assist professors during laboratory activities.

The specific criteria to be met by the doctoral student limit the working time length that he must devote to labour activities. Six hours weekly is the maximum time that can be allocated to such activities because a person who undertakes doctoral studies is not allowed to work fulltime.

Conclusion of contracts with employees' spouses or with their relatives. Conflict of interest.

Within the University of Strathclyde there are no impediments to the employment of relatives or spouses of members of the academic community. As an expression of human resources autonomy, the university will employ the most powerful person on criteria of equal opportunities for employment and performance of the selected candidate. However, it is welcome to avoid situations where conflict of interest may occur.

Measures to be taken:

- All employments shall be conducted in accordance with the procedures approved by the University;
- All positions will be open for competition, and information about these positions will be published according to the recruitment requirements;
- No member of the academic community, whose relative or spouse participate in the contest to fill a position at the University, will be involved in any of the following activities:
- Selection of candidates
- Submission of recommendations
- o Participation in the interviews
- o Contacting the candidate for any reason
- o Decision making on employing the candidate.

If a member of the academic community knows about the fact that a relative/spouse intends to enter into an employment relationship with the university, the first will inform the leaders of the Human Resources Department in writing before starting the recruitment procedures. These rules are applicable to all members of the academic community whatever form of contract and its duration.

The employment contracts of the university management.

When referring to the procedures used to sign labour contracts with the rectors of higher education institutions in Scotland, it should be noted that the same procedure is applicable to all higher education institutions, by applying the following criteria:

- Hiring is done by the executive body, and is preceded by a careful selection of candidates. Contract terms are determined by the Executive Body, as well.
- Appointment is based on the criteria of transparency specifying that the person taking the job should prove specific abilities and skills to interact with the non-academic environment.

Similarly it is worth mentioning that rectors are not public servants.

Employment of the Vice Rector, the Chancellor and the Deans is decided by the University, no external authority confirms or approves their employment. The Rector has the right to form the management team, based on the criteria of professionalism, transparency and absence of the conflict of interest.

The Head of Department is employed for a period of 3 years. Employment is based on the interview, promoted by a panel consisting of 6 members, usually the dean and other university managers.

The Head of Department is responsible for maintaining and promoting the efficiency of the department, being the department representative to the executive body. The Head of Department takes advantage of a management allowance, and 50% of its work is dedicated to the management and administrative activities. After termination of employment relationships, he shall receive a paid leave, making one month for each worked year in this position, but not more than 6 months. Employment of the Vice Deans will follow the same procedure; their workload is 50% teaching and 50% management activities.

Senior Officers of the University

The *Vice-rector (Vice-Principal)* shall exercise such functions and responsibilities, as the Court shall deem fit. Remuneration of job is established by the same body. During the absence of the Principal, the Vice-Principal shall undertake any such functions and duties of the Principal as the Principal or the Court may delegate to him/her. The Vice-Principal shall normally hold office for a period of five years (unless otherwise determined by the Appointment Committee or the Court).

The *Chief Operating Officer* shall be appointed as pursuant to the Charter and Statutes and shall, under the direction of the Principal, be responsible for the administration of the University and for providing secretarial services to the Court and the Senate.

The *Chief Financial Officer*, under the direction of the Principal, shall be responsible for the financial management of the University and the strategic management of the Professional

Service functions of the University, including the Department of finance, estates and human resources.

Deans The executive management of each faculty is carried out by the Dean. The Dean will be responsible for day-by-day activity of the faculty, being the Executive manager, and will contribute to the Faculty development, according to the overall development strategy of the University.

3.2.1.4. Conditions for appointment to posts in higher education. Academic career

To ensure relevant staffing, each institution in Scotland divides the working staff in four large groups so called JOB FAMILIES, a mechanism similar to the Classification of Occupations and Trades of the Republic of Moldova. This classification provides a means of grouping together jobs that have similar characteristics, the use of which may assist in career development, job description and further information, and taking into account the development and training needs.

The University, in consultation with the unions, has developed four groups of staff to represent its positions for key work. Framework Agreement was approved by the National Confederation of Trade Unions jointly with all higher education institutions. All higher education institutions are obliged to adopt the principles laid down in the Framework Agreement, to ensure that issues related to wages, job evaluation and concept of equal pay for work of equal value to be addressed uniformly by all institutions reflecting equal opportunities in terms of development and career.

The University, in consultation with the unions, has developed four groups of staff as follows:

- 1. Training and Research Staff. The role of this group is entirely focused primarily on research and teaching. Activities carried out combine elements of research, teaching and administration or management; however, the nature of the contribution to diverse types of activities will vary. Some activities will be oriented more towards research, while others will tend to focus on management, teaching and/or administration activities. The top levels of this group will require recognition, at the national and international levels, and a significant impact on the discipline taught and conducted research.
- 2. Management and Administrative Staff. Members of this group are involved in the management and/or administrative activities, and provide support services to academics and students and sometimes to the general public. Their functions entail office or administrative work, development and implementation of policies and processes by providing expert advice. It is necessary for understanding the university systems and processes. The top level will require specialized knowledge or professional skills. The top levels will require the combination of professional qualification and managerial experience, and will involve an important role in managing positions within the institution.
- **3. Technical and Assimilated Staff.** The role of this group is to provide technical support including the areas of information technology, research and teaching activities.

Support will be provided both to the academic staff and students by performing different measurements, tests, lab tests, providing technical information for teaching activity, etc. The top level requires advanced skills in managerial technical field for relevant technical maintenance.

4. Operational Staff. The role of this group is the management of maintenance services and facilities of higher education institutions. It will be concerned with the management of maintenance services of estates, student dormitories, canteens etc. regardless of real estate ownership.

Although in terms of grouping the staff working in higher education institutions in these four major groups which is mandatory and uniform for all higher education institutions, these job families are very autonomous in terms of establishing the necessary conditions for access to the jobs in the institution, because of the group specification. In this regard, the managers shall develop the job description which depicts the conditions necessary for academic career development.

The **Lecturers** are persons who perform teaching and research, develop the necessary methodological materials and conduct student assessment.

Requirements for filling job vacancies:

- Be holder of scientific degree (Ph.D. or equivalent) in the appropriate field.
- Be interested in research activity in the field related to the department strategy.
- Have a number of studies published in reviews of competitive level.
- Have ability to manage research funding, including the necessary experience to contribute to this funding.
- Have relevant teaching experience at undergraduate and graduate levels.
- Be able to work in a team and lead the team when necessary.
- Possess interpersonal communication capabilities with the ability to listen to and select conclusive information being able to deliver the needed information to the audience.

Additional requirements:

- Member of professional associations (including the Higher Education Academy).
- Experience in inter-multidisciplinary research.
- Experience in conducting research, teaching and teams.
- Experience in student assessment activities.
- Experience in curriculum development.

• Experience in knowledge transfer activities.

SENIOR LECTURERS and ASSOTIATED PROFESSORS are persons who coordinate research programs nationally /internationally, lead the design and development of some study programs, professional activities and knowledge transfer, as well as administrative activities assigned by the Heads of Department.

Requirements for filling job vacancies:

- Be holder of scientific degree (Ph.D. or equivalent) in the appropriate field.
- Be interested in research activity in the field related to the department strategy.
- A number of publications in top level editions, demonstrating standards of excellence in research and growing national reputation.
- Have ability to manage research funding, including the necesary experience to contribute to this funding.
- Relevant teaching experience at undergraduate and graduate level, including experience in the development and management of study programs.
- Ability to hold a leadership role in an academic team, to motivate and manage staff, demonstrating experience in leading teams of less experienced staff as well as students involved in research activities.
- Interpersonal communication skills with the ability to listen to and select conclusive information, being able to communicate to the audience the information required.
- Only for lecturers: To be a person with a recognized reputation in the field at national and international level.

Additional requirements:

- Member of professional associations (including the Higher Education Academy).
- Necessary skills of project management: staff planning, budgeting, funds management.
- Experience in inter-multidisciplinary research.
- Experience in knowledge transfer activities.

PROFESSORS are persons recognized as experts and leaders in the management of international research programs, endorse and develop curricula and educational standards, lead knowledge transfer activities and contribute to the development of the department strategically.

Requirements for filling job vacancies:

- Be holder of scientific degree (Ph.D. or equivalent) in the appropriate field.
- Be interested in research activity in the field related to the department strategy.
- Significant publications and research recognised at international level.
- Leader and expert in the field of activity internationally recognized.
- Ability to attract research funding for a specified period.
- Ability to establish a research group international leader, and successfully manage and promote research activities of the group on the international arena.
- Experience in inter-multidisciplinary research.
- Relevant teaching experience at undergraduate and graduate level, including experience in supervising students' research activities.
- Necessary skills of project management: staff planning, budgeting, funds and human resources management.
- Strategic thinking skills and ability to contribute to the development of the department to which it belongs.
- Excellent interpersonal communication skills with the ability to listen to and select conclusive information, being able to communicate to the audience the information required.

Additional requirements:

- Member of professional associations (including the Higher Education Academy).
- Experience in coordinating the development and delivery of a variety of study programs.
- Establishing links with business, civil society, government and representatives of professional associations.

Conclusions through the Government – University interface

All higher education institutions in Scotland are independent and autonomous public institutions, enjoying a large level of autonomy in terms of their freedom to decide on recruitment and employment procedures.

All higher education institutions in Scotland have management teams - groups of employees with managerial responsibilities working together with the rector. Sometimes these groups have the status of groups of decision, and sometimes they act as informal working groups.

The Rector performs leadership management of the institution, but also has the leading position in relation to the academic staff and students. For rectors, managerial tasks are of triple nature - representation, management and protocol. It is important that all these aspects

of the Rector's role to be recognized by the whole community. During this period of higher education development in Scotland, the Rector's role in the institution is one of the executive managers, using the language borrowed from business.

Discussing the role of the Rector and the management team it is good to mention the high level of autonomy they enjoy. The Rector is employed by the executive body of the institution (Court), being not necessary to approve or confirm this commitment. Thus, all political interference in the internal affairs of universities is avoided.

Employment of other members of the management team is based on absolutely transparent procedures, e.g. selecting CV, conducting interviews and selecting the best performing candidate. Scottish universities practice has shown that this is an absolutely democratic and effective procedure that enables the most efficient managerial act. Therefore we say that the state or rather the Ministry of Education of Scotland is not involved in the procedures used by universities in terms of recruitment and employment of top level staff.

The only interference of the state in this area is the establishment of JOB FAMILIES in higher education institutions, following a framework agreement signed with the National Confederation of Trade Unions. To unify the many positions that exist in the higher education system an analysis of jobs in the sector was carried out on the basis of 14 criteria, called HERA (Higher Education Role Analysis). HERA is an abbreviation which translated from English means Higher Education Role Analysis and is a job evaluation system, which was designed and developed by ECC in collaboration with higher education institutions (over 100 have established a consortium together with the representatives of the National Confederation of Trade Unions), in particular for use by higher education institutions. HERA has been recognized by the Committee on Equal Opportunities as a job evaluation system of non-discriminatory employment. Most higher education institutions in the UK, including Scotland, have adopted HERA as their job evaluation system of work.

This evaluation system of positions can provide:

- A fair, equitable and transparent process to compare the relative dimension of a specific work position.
- Consistency and parity within the University.
- Application of the principle of equal pay for work of equal value.
- Promoting equity and equality in general.

HERA is an analytical job evaluation system of work-based factors. It aims to assess the relative value of roles for a job position in a consistent and fair manner. HERA focuses on wider aspects rather than on individual tasks, relying on analysis of fourteen elements covering a range of duties and responsibilities. Each item is scored, the scores for each element is weighted appropriately, and then added together to give a total score for each item. Total score indicates the relative dimension of the item.

Concrete description of work tasks for a concrete position is at the discretion of institutions. Each institution has developed their own job descriptions, setting the criteria for filling up a vacant position that is part of a particular group of positions (JOB FAMILIES).

Implementation of HERA system crosses the point of intersection in the relationship between **GOVERNMENT** and **UNIVERSITY**. The freedom of higher education institution to decide on the recruitment and employment procedures of staff must not impede with the principle of non-discrimination and equal opportunities.

3.2.2. Freedom of instituitons to decide on the promotion of staff

This criterion of university autonomy in human resources materializes in the right of higher education institution to decide on staff career evolution by moving to a higher degree, position or professional level, including through the assessment procedures.

3.2.2.1. Evaluation and promotion of staff

Career promotion of staff in Scottish universities is carried out according to internal procedures. Promotion to a higher position is carried out on a competitive basis, after a preliminary verification. At the University of Strathclyde internal regulations are applied with regard to procedures for employees' promotion, applicable in two promoting situations as follows: transition from level A Lecturer to level B Lecturer (situations in which promotion does not amend the held position, but transition to higher level of pay) and promotion to higher academic positions.

Level A Lecturers are academic staff with minimum teaching experience, employed with probationary period. If the employee is fulfilling conscientiously his/her work obligations, the Head of Department will submit a demarche to the Committee for the Evaluation of the probationary period within the faculty to examine the possibility to modify the employee's actual salary. The employee concerned shall submit a CV, detailing the activities carried out. The Evaluation Committee will assess the applicant's file, to decide on the promotion. Candidate's profile must meet the requirements listed in the job description describing the position of level B Lecturer. Depending on the level of suitability of the candidate it will be decided to allow or not promotion.

With regard to career promotion of the academic staff, it should be noted that the procedures were merged and the same regulations are used for both senior lecturer position and for the positions of associate professor and professor.

The structure responsible for the promotion of academic staff is the Academic Professional Appointments Panel (APAP), hereinafter Commission.

The Commission will meet twice a year, in March and September, to examine the dossiers submitted for promotion.

The dossier submitted by the candidate for promotion shall contain the following documents:

Updated CV of the candidate;

- Last candidate's self-assessment report;
- A letter of recommendation from the Head of Department;
- A cover letter from the candidate;
- Contact details of external evaluators.

The file is presented by the Head of Department to the Dean. The Dean, along with two Deputy Deans, will carefully examine the file and where it meets the conditions for jobs, they will submit them to the Academic Professional Appointments Panel. In case the file was rejected the decision should be reasoned, indicating the specific measures to be taken. For the appointment of external evaluators, the Head of human resources will propose the names of candidates to the Rector and the Dean will notify them in writing, the last having one month to decide on the candidature proposed for promotion.

The promotion procedure will be conducted in the following stages:

- 1. Submission of a justification letter from the Head of Department to the Dean.
- 2. Presentation by the Faculty of supporting notes indicating that the application must be submitted to the Academic Professional Appointments Panel.
- 3. Drawing up supporting notes by indicating that the opinion of external expert was taken into account in the situation when the promotion is accepted, otherwise an explanatory note will be presented which shows that promotion was not accepted and the reasons for such a decision.
- 4. Presentation of the final decision to the human resources department.

If the file is rejected the candidate will be informed in writing and the Dean shall be notified about the decision verbally. The candidate has the right to submit the file folder repeatedly after the expiry of a period of two years.

At the same time, higher education institutions have developed policies that reflect compliance with the equal opportunities in terms of remuneration, promotion and career development of employees.

If the candidate does not agree with the Commission's decision the procedure for contesting the results is established. The appeal shall be in writing and shall be submitted to the Human Resources Department. The reasons underlying the complaint can only be procedural. The objector shall file all necessary evidence to support its position. The Appeal Commission will include members of the Court and Senate. It is not acceptable that the Appeal Commission is joined by colleagues from the department where the objector works. Depending on the evidence presented, the Appeal Commission can decide whether to allow the complaint or to reject it. In the situation when procedural infringements have occurred as a result of ambiguous interpretations of procedures proposals will be formulated on the review of promotion procedures. The Commission's decision is final and binding.

3.2.2.1. Right to rest and leisure of higher education institutions' staff. Research leave

Higher education institutions in Scotland have developed a series of policies on the enforcement of staff's rights. These policies aim at including the right to rest by providing ordinary as well as additional annual leave.

The duration of annual leave is 31 days which the staff can take in the result of negotiations with the supervisor. For part-time staff, the leave will be calculated proportionately. According to the calculation each month is 2.5 days, starting from 1 October. In addition to the annual leave, the staff of institutions also benefit from 11 days of holiday. On these days educational institutions are closed. Regarding staff on fixed-term employment contract they are advised to use the annual leave until the end of the employment contract.

Research leave and professional leave

This type of leave may be taken by academic staff to facilitate some research, the purpose of which is to publish the results. Type of publication, as well as how research is conducted may vary depending on the specific field of activity of the person.

Terms of eligibility and duration of leave:

- full-time or part-time employed staff, which is working at least 4 years at the institution;
- while calculating seniority giving entitlement to leave, periods of employment during which the employee benefited from professional and/or unpaid leave are not taken into account:
- commencement and completion of the leave period will correspond, usually, to the time of commencement and completion of the semester in the higher education institution.

During his leave, the employee shall retain all salary rights. During this period the employee may perform research activities in all higher education institutions, research centers, libraries etc. During this period the employee is released from all job obligations, including administrative ones. If heads of department benefit of this leave, during their absence an interim head will be assigned. During professional leave the beneficiary must not perform any activity that involves teaching related to direct contact with students.

Within 3 months after completion of the period for which leave was granted the beneficiary shall submit a report on the results of research.

3.2.2.3. Invited academic staff. Honorary titles awarding

Higher education institutions in Scotland are entitled to invite meritorious academic staff from outside the institution to conduct activities at the host institution. They can be paid salaries by their home institution, but may not be remunerated for performed activity at the host institution.

Invitation procedure will be initiated by the Head of Department where the invited person will work. At the request of invitation a motivation letter will be attached explaining the necessity to invite this person and his/her CV. In the rare cases when the invited professor will be paid, this will be indicated, including the funding source. The package of documents is submitted to the Human Resources Department.

Higher education institutions in Scotland may grant the honorary title of Professor Emeritus under the following conditions:

Deans will discuss with the Heads of Department the possibility of granting Professor Emeritus title to a professor who has reached the retirement age. The written recommendation will elucidate as much as possible the extent to which continued employment will affect beneficially strategic priorities of the institution. The recommendation will be submitted to the Human Resources Department, which will verify the conditions of its form and then submit it for review to the Commission for academic appointments. The Commission will decide on the recommendation, and its decision will be delivered to the Senate for consideration. If a favorable response from the Senate, the decision shall be approved by the University Court.

The information on the approval of awarding the honorary title will be passed to the Human Resources Department, which will inform about the decision the employee, following the concluding of necessary documents.

Conclusions through the Government – University interface

Development and promotion of staff aims at career and potential development of each employee in terms of new knowledge, personal skills and competencies and understanding the University's mission and priorities outlined in its Strategic Plan. Generally it refers to a variety of learning methods both within and beyond the institution; it is a continuous process that aims to assist the employee in the following fields:

- Increasing the performance of each employee
- Identifying and developing the potential of each employee
- Reacting positively to change, uncertainty and conflict
- Increasing the level of satisfaction with the position held
- Improving confidence in their own abilities, motivation and initiative.

State intervention in this area is very small; each higher education institution is entitled to establish their own assessment procedures, higher education institutions pledging to ensure that the principle of equal opportunities is respected and not allowing any discrimination on grounds of racial or anational belonging, ethnic origin, sex or disability, age, religion, sexual orientation or marital status.

3.2.3. Freedom to decide on workload

Freedom to decide on labor norming lies in the higher education institution's right to decide on the distribution of working time and workload.

3.2.3.1. Structure of teaching /academic workload

Workload of academic staff consists of teaching, research, knowledge transfer and fulfilling administrative activities. The share of a type of activity in all standard workload is determined by the Head of Department, who assesses the skills of each employee and organizes activities within the department in such a way as to have a reasonable balance between all members of the department.

3.2.3.2. Working hours

Working time is allocated for carrying out labour obligations described in the job description. Normal duration of work time in higher education institutions in Scotland is 35 hours per week performed within 5 working days, usually from Monday to Saturday.

For staff other than the academic staff, the work program is set between 9 and 17 o'clock. However, after negotiations with the Head of Department, the work program may suffer some changes, on condition that full working hours are fulfilled. Academic staff has the right to perform activity in several ways, but it is preferable that contact with students is done within the established work program. Contact with students outside the university and outside the working hours require prior approval from the Head of Department and may include additional salary.

3.2.3.3. Obligations of higher education institutions' staff. Employee's responsibilities

Work requirements for the staff of Scottish higher education institutions are established in the job description annexed to the employment contract. Splitting and description of tasks for academic staff is done on the following types of activities: research, teaching and methodological activity, knowledge transfer and administrative work. Every employee is obliged to contribute to the development and achievement of objectives of the the University. Mainly, a member of the academic community has to accomplish the following tasks:

- to perform work tasks according to the job description, standards and performance indicators established by the university;
- maintain a safe working environment, including work safety and health;
- to carry out research and methodological work complying to international standards.

If the employee fails to fulfill work tasks, an internal procedure is established that applies to all categories of staff. The institution reserves the right to initiate specific disciplinary proceedings for the offense committed.

The following actions/inactions of the academic staff are considered facts that contradict the academic community membership:

- causing damage to the image of higher education institution;
- use of higher education institution property for other purposes;
- loss of confidence;
- conviction for committing an act which is incompatible with the activity of the higher education institution.

Each institution has approved a Code of Ethics in research activity, which defines the objectives of each institution in research and the regulations that must be followed by the academic community when carrying out research. Violation of these rules leads to disciplinary procedures. The internal regulations contain enumeration of facts which are considered violations of work obligations, among them are committing acts of harassment at the workplace, of corruption, misuse of university property, etc.

Conclusions through the Government – University interface

Higher education institutions are absolutely autonomous in terms of freedom to decide on the workload; each position in higher education is clearly described in the job description and 35 hours weekly are allocated to fulfill job tasks, the institutions establish the work program depending on the specific activity of each employee.

3.2.4. Freedom /ability of institutions to decide on the salary system

This component of human resources autonomy means the right of universities to set their own pay system respecting the principle of transparency and accountability of public funds management.

3.1.4.1. Salary structure

The remuneration of personnel of higher education institutions in Scotland takes place under HERA system that analyzes Job Families to ensure equal pay for equal work. Each institution is required to adopt its salary policy, which will contain provisions on transparency in wage setting.

In general, salaries are different from one position to another, and within the position of Lecturer there are two levels of pay. Moving from one level to another takes place after attestation.

Academic staff performs specific activity and is paid depending on the group of Job Family that may be of three types:

- teaching activities: 40% teaching, 40% development of courses, 20% innovations;
- research activities: 40% research, 40% knowledge transfer, 20% knowledge transfer;

• teaching and research activities: 40% – teaching, 40% – research, 20% – public activities.

Teaching staff remuneration is done based on their performance and according to the national payroll scale. Negotiations on the payroll and other issues related to the academic staff activity is achieved by negotiation between the **University and College Union.**

3.2.4.2. Bodies empowered to set salaries

In higher education institutions of Scotland there are structures responsible for staff remuneration. Usually, these are Staff Remuneration Committees. These structures have the following responsibilities:

- approval of terms regarding the Rector's salary and his job responsibilities;
- approval of terms regarding university management remuneration and responsibilities;
- approval of terms regarding Deans and Heads of operational services remuneration and their responsibilities;
- annual performance evaluation of the aforementioned employees and determination of wage adjustments that need to be made;
- confirming the termination of the employment relationships and the retirement of the employees concerned;
- adjustment of wage internal conditions to national regulations, especially to the union agreements;
- presentation of the reports to the Court, if appropriate.

The Remuneration Committee is composed of: the Chairman of the Court, the Court Treasurer, two Deputy Chairmen of the Court, Chair of the Court Audit Committee, the Principal head of the institution and the Director of Human Resources. In the situation when the Remuneration Committee considers proposals on the remuneration of the Rector and Director of Human Resources Department, they will not participate in the discussions.

Conclusions through the Government - University interface

The salary system is entirely internal. There is no external authority confirming the remuneration system. The higher education institution is free to set its own salary system and staff rewarding. Internal payroll system is based on the principle of "equal pay for work activities of the same type", organized under HERA system. Salaries established for a certain category of employees are displayed on the websites of universities, anyone having access to information. Salary varies from one position to another, depending on the Job Family to which the given position belongs. Within the same position there are also differences, depending on seniority, the classification requested to carry out certain activities, etc.

Professor Ferdinand von Prodzinsky states in his *Review of HE Governance in Scotland* that the remuneration system of rectors is public information, but the calculation and the reasons for granting certain salary increases are not public. Nor is public the information about the incentives and why they are granted to the staff holding leadership positions in higher education institutions. Taking into account the public debate concerning incentives to the staff holding leadership positions, he recommends that universities abandon the system of incentives granted or at least ensure transparency.

3.2.5. Freedom to decide on the termination of employment contracts

The employment contracts of the staff of higher education institutions in Scotland can terminate by law or at the initiative of either party. Higher education institutions have well-developed policies, and the grounds for termination are regulated under the general rules of labour law.

3.2.5.1. Grounds for termination of employment contracts, specific for higher education

Due to the fact that common employment contracts concluded for a fixed period are something usual for higher education, as grounds for termination of employment contracts is the expiry of the specific period for which the contract was concluded. This happens both when there is a specific and fixed date for ending the contract, as well as when an employee is hired to carry out the work obligations of another employee who is temporarily absent.

Another case of terminating the employment contract is staff reductions, operating when the workload decreases, there is a modification and redistribution of work tasks etc.

Termination of employment contracts for disciplinary reasons may occur when the employee violates labour discipline, does not fulfill qualitative and quantitative work obligations or when there are personnel actions that are incompatible with the teaching activity, and the reasons that underlie such decisions are described in the disciplinary proceedings applicable in the institution. As well, breach of rules stipulated in the Code of Ethics of the researcher may lead to termination of employment.

3.2.5.1. Termination of employment contracts with managerial staff

The Court is the executive body of the university, with managerial responsibilities, in charge of the procedures concerning the termination of labour relations with staff. The Rector, being employed by the Selection Committee of the Court, will be monitored throughout its activity by the Court. It should be noted that in the frame of higher education system, the position of Rector, as we know it, is occupied by the person named the Principal. The notion of Rector in higher education system of Scotland is an honorary position, which has no managerial role, but more for promoting the image of the university. The position called RECTOR is preserved in 4 universities, namely, the known ancient universities.

Remuneration Committee within higher education institutions establishes the work tasks that should be achieved by the Rector; the same Committee is responsible for monitoring the way the performance indicators are performed. The Committee reports data about the Rector's

activity to the Court, and if the last fails to fulfil the tasks assigned, the Court may initiate the procedures of his/her dismissal, the intervention of any external authority is not necessary.

Conclusions through the Government-University interface

Scottish institutions have developed policies regarding the principle of fairness and equality in the workplace. Neither staff reduction nor dismissal for disciplinary reasons shall be carried out on discriminatory criteria. Approval and strict compliance with such policies, traces the point of intersection between the right of the institution to be autonomous and its obligation to ensure that the principle of stability, fairness, equity, equality and non-discrimination in the workplace is respected.

3.3. Sweden

3.3.1. Freedom /ability to decide on recruitment and employment procedures

An analysis of the laws governing labour relations in Swedish higher education shows that all institutions are free /autonomous as regards the right to set their own recruitment procedures, taking into account the objectives of each institution.

That is the case of the Royal Institute of Technology (KTH) in Stockholm, which has developed its own internal procedures relating to the recruitment of required staff. KTH opportunities to maintain the position of a successful technical university, nationally and internationally, largely depends on its employees. The goal of Human resource policies at KTH is to gain from the professional skills of its employees in the best way possible. Implementation of this policy is a strategic issue that is the responsibility of all employees, or KTH is a university where people from different backgrounds and with different experiences work together for a common goal: to manage, to renew and to transmit knowledge. High levels of quality and ethics, a free and open exchange of ideas and opinions – this is the essence of the KTH personnel policies at all levels. In this context, KTH is an employer which will stimulate the desire to achieve personal development and to accept human responsibility.

3.3.1.1. Bodies responsible for recruitment and employment procedures

Swedish universities are part of the public sector. Higher Education Act and Higher Education Ordinance are the main laws governing the system. Swedish Constitution and the Law on public sector employment stipulate that personnel employment in the sector should be done on criteria based on the skills and knowledge of employees. According to statistics, in Sweden, in the last decade there was a substantial increase in the number of employees of higher education institutions. This increase is largely due to increase in the funding for higher education system.

There are two categories of employees of higher education institutions: employees conducting research and teaching activity and also there are employees not engaged in such

activities. The first category of employees involves basically, professors, senior lecturers, researchers, lecturers (with different types of employment contracts). Work activity of this staff is governed mainly by the Law on Higher Education, but the Law has undergone some changes since entry into force of the Law on University Autonomy. However the regulation of work activity of certain categories of employees such as professors and lecturers can be found in the Higher Education Act, and the Higher Education Ordinance has introduced the regulation of higher education employees with employment contracts for a determined period.

Fundamental normative acts regulating the activity of higher education institutions in Sweden does not contain provisions relating to the bodies responsible for the recruitment procedure. Each higher education institution has the right to develop their own regulations. For example, under the internal rules of the Royal Institute of Technology Stockholm - KTH, schools/departments are responsible for recruitment and employment in their field of activity, and the Faculty Councils are responsible for the preparation of procedural documents together with the Human Resources Department. Employment of Dean falls within the competence of the Rector.

To assess and to select the best performing candidates the Employment Committee is set up within the Faculty Council. Members of the Committee will be selected in such a way as to be able to evaluate both research as well as teaching activity.

Employment Committee submits to the Rector the proposal on the employment of professors, and the proposal on the employment of associate professors and assistant professors shall be submitted to the Dean. Decision regarding the employment of professors is taken by the rector, and decision on the employment of associate professors, assistant professors and lecturers is taken by the Heads of schools where the employee will work. If the Dean's opinion differs from that of the Employment Committee, hiring decision will be taken on by the Rector.

3.3.1.2. Recruitment and employment methods and procedures. Approval /confirmation of recruitment /employment

Vacant teaching positions are advertised in the press, except for adjunct professor, visiting professor and in case of direct nomination. Professor functions will be announced in a Swedish newspaper published daily. The contents of all the ads that appear in the media, including the Internet will be coordinated with Human Resources Department.

The announcement shall contain the following information about the candidate's profile:

- Field of study;
- Description of the field;
- Description of the basic responsibilities;
- Qualification required;

- The evaluation criteria and their weightings;
- In specifying the conditions of employment for assistant professor position the terms of promotion to the position of associate professor will be indicated.

Exceptions to the commitment procedure:

- When the exercise of certain functions requires special skills, they will be specified in a separate document;
- Faculty Council and the Employment Committee will decide on job specific skills required to be stated in the announcement;
- In some cases, the rector may decide on deviation from the procedure of employment, if any justified reasons for deviation.

Decision on the completion of employment procedures is taken by those who initiated it. Decision concerning the completion is final and cannot be subject to appeal. The employee will be notified in writing about the decision on employment.

Documents used in recruitment procedures will be archived and kept for two years after the entry into force of the decision on hiring.

3.3.1.3. Types of employment and employment contracts

Swedish universities are part of the public sector. Higher Education Act and Higher Education Ordinance are the main laws governing the system. Swedish Constitution and the Law on public sector employment stipulate that staff employment must be made on criteria based on employees's skills and knowledge.

According to statistic data in the last decade there was a substantial increase in the number of employees in the higher education sector. This is due to increase in the sector financing.

According to Swedish law employees of higher education are divided into staff conducting research and training and administrative staff. The first category of employees involves, in particular, professors, senior lecturers, researchers and lecturers with different types of employment contracts. Responsibilities and rights of such staff are regulated by the Higher Education Act, but they have undergone changes, with the expansion of university autonomy. Currently, the Higher Education Act regulates the general conditions that the holder of position must meet. A legislative novelty of this Act is the introduction of the concept of fixed-term employment contract in higher education institutions.

The general rule is the conclusion of employment contracts for undetermined term. Contracts will be concluded after the hiring decision is final and cannot be subject to any appeal. The contract will specify the position and employment field, as well as the job description. The Rector of the university decides on the essential contractual clauses.

Rector, together with the Director of Human Resources will determine the amount of labor remuneration, taking into account the employment negotiations with each candidate. Information about wages and terms of employment will be presented by the Head of human resources. For the positions of professor, assistant professor and lecturer, salaries will be determined taking into account the opinion of the school in which the employee will work. The Rector decides on the methodology of development of employment contracts.

Given the employment negotiations the Rector will decide on the salary of professors, but the amount and mode of payment of salary supplements and allowances will be determined by the Head of Human Resources Department. The wages for associate professors, assistant professors and lecturers are decided by the Dean or by a person delegated by him. In this case, the employment negotiations will be taken into account, too.

3.3.1.4. Conditions for appointment to posts in higher education. Academic career

Recruitment and professional development in higher education institutions have mapped some strategic objectives. One objective is to focus on recruiting young staff wishing to grow in their careers. Another objective is the employment of skilled teaching and research staff; attention will be paid to research. Therefore to accede to academic career, staff of higher education institutions in Sweden must perform teaching and research activities. In this respect the institutions invest in staff potential by providing them opportunities for career development, promoting research excellence.

The objective of academic career in higher education institutions in Sweden is to recruit persons who obtained doctor's degree, to employ them by higher education institutions and to provide them opportunities for lasting development in academic career both in teaching as well as research. According to Higher Education Act academic career stages are: associate senior lecturer, senior lecturer and professor.

Academic career begins with an employment contract for a fixed period for the position of associate senior lecturer. The main selection criterion is to hold PhD degree or be a scientific expert in the field of activity. After a period of activity in this position, any person can claim to career advancement. In this regard, the employee will be evaluated if he/she meets the requirements for the position of Senior Lecturer. In case of compliance to the requirements for the position, the person will sign an employment contract for an undetermined term for the position of Senior Lecturer; the last, in turn, can be promoted to the position of professor if he/she meets the criteria for the vacant position.

Conditions for employing academic staff

To occupy certain posts in Swedish higher education institutions it is necessary to meet certain qualification requirements. The degree of compliance with these requirements is a prerequisite for a specific employee to be hired. The general requirements are stipulated in Higher Education Act but each institution has the right to set their own additional requirements. Besides additional requirements, each institution develops evaluation criteria that determine how well a candidate meets the qualification requirements submitted (eg.

Academic quality of the Doctoral thesis) or in some cases the candidates hold certain qualifications that are not necessary to occupy the position, but gives advantages over other candidates (eg. Doctor's degree is the qualification requirement and the quality of the thesis is the evaluation criterion).

The evaluation criterion is a selection tool and is used to decide between two or more qualified candidates. For example, management skills of the employee as well as its availability to conduct civic duties could be the evaluation criterion.

Conditions to undertake positions within the academic career

- <u>Associate Senior Lecturer</u> will conduct teaching activities with the opportunity to carry out research activities. To occupy this position it is necessary to hold a doctoral degree;
- <u>Senior Lecturer</u> must have experience in teaching and hold the doctoral degree or the equivalent of expert research position. As a criterion for assessing the candidate profile will serve his experience in teaching and type of experience. Teaching skills will be demonstrated through teaching activities at cycle I and II and will be well documented;
- <u>Professor</u> will demonstrate competence in research and teaching. Evaluation criteria will target candidate's activity both in terms of quantity and quality. Teaching skills will be assessed by teaching activity at cycle I, cycle II and cycle III.

Both the institution and the departments, because of the specific research activity and profile, have the right to establish own conditions and criteria for evaluation.

Conditions for employing staff outside the academic career

- <u>Lecturer</u> is the employee who performs teaching and assimilated activities. Teaching will be delivered generally to cycle I and does not require research skills. The candidate to the position of lecturer must have teaching experience and hold bachelor degree in the field. Employment period is usually one determined;
- <u>Adjunct professor</u> is the employee who is an expert in a specific University field and will be employed for a fixed period. Usually these are persons employed on part-time basis. Their main activity is carried out in the business environment or public sector;
- <u>Visiting Professor</u> is employed in order to use the experience of a person in the activity field of a department. Qualification requirements are the same as those submitted for the position of professor.

Conclusions through the Government – University interface

The main laws governing the system of higher education are Higher Education Act and Higher Education Ordinance. These normative acts establish in principle general conditions that must be met by personnel employed at higher education institutions. It should be noted that both documents refer only to academic staff that participate directly in the teaching-

research-knowledge transfer. KTH professors are public sector employees and the appointment of teaching staff is the exercise of public authority.

Namely this provision draws the intersection point in the **Government – University** relationship. Certain general provisions regarding employment of teaching staff can be found in the general labour legislation. The Swedish Constitution states that administrative authorities operation is based on the equality of all before the law and that the authorities should act objectively and impartially. It also states that at employment in the public sector, the selection of a candidate shall be carried out based only on merit and knowledge criteria. Transparency of the appointment procedure is guaranteed by the principle of public access to official documents.

According to statistics, higher education institutions employees represent ¼ of public sector employees. According to information available at KTH, it aims to create an institution of excellence through investment in development of strong research environments in important areas. To achieve success, KTH must ensure recruitment of teaching staff in certain sectors considered of prime importance to the society. KTH has created a career system in order to attract prominent personalities.

In order to achieve these aims, KTH adopted a personnel policy that rewards teachers that take responsibility for education and research as well as for the relations of KTH with the outside world. This responsibility makes the connection with the role and qualifications of the employee, being an important part of the overall evaluation of recruitment and promotion. Higher education institution freedom to decide on personnel recruitment and employment procedures should not limit the rights and freedoms guaranteed to employees and employers through various legislative acts.

3.3.2. Freedom of institutions to decide on the promotion of staff

This criterion of university autonomy in the field of human resources materializes in the right of higher education institution to decide on ensuring career evolution of personnel by promotion to a higher rank, position or professional level.

3.3.2.1. Procedures for staff evaluation and promotion

Under Swedish legislation in effect in the sector of higher education every employee has the right to be promoted during his careers being entitled to apply for a higher position if meeting the job requirements. Every higher education institution establishes own procedures for evaluation of employees who want to advance in their career.

• <u>promotion from associate senior lecturer to senior lecturer</u> – shall be carried out for the candidate meeting the conditions necessary for position occupancy. After selection a labour contract for an undetermined period shall be concluded. The applicant must demonstrate research and teaching skills. In case of promotion the activity area shall not change;

• <u>promotion from lecturer to professor</u> – the applicant shall demonstrate competence in research at professor level, both quantitatively and calitatively. Similarly, shall be taken account of research coordination skills, and teaching skills shall be verified through teaching activities at cycle I and II as well as at cycle III.

The promotion procedure is carried out similarly to the one used at employment. The structure responsible for promotion - the Employment Committee - shall verify the compliance of the candidate to position's profile. For every position there was developed a job description listing in detail employee's job duties as well as job requirements. Also, position's qualification criteria shall be examined in order to select the best performing candidate.

The decision on promotion or non-promotion of a candidate can be contested. The labour contract shall be modified respectively in the direction of promotion and implicitly, of salary increase, setting an employment period, after the promotion decision becomes final and irrevocable.

3.3.2.2. Rights and freedoms of higher education institutions' staff

The academic staff from higher education institutions are autonomous with regard to the right to choose training and research methods. In 2012, an organization free from any political interference was founded in Sweden, called Bevakar den Akademiska Friheten I Sverige - Academic Freedom Rights Watch. This organization was founded in response to the implementation of New Public Management ideology which aims to address the public sector under similar conditions as the private sector where the managerial act is performed vertically and not collaboratively, or collegially. Swedish academia considers that such a management system jeopardizes the freedom of expression and decisions on what and how to teach and/or research should be taken at high level. The idea of transforming Swedish higher education institutions into providers of service to the customer distorts the freedom of expression of academic staff as well as academic freedom in general. Certain violations were accounted for and presented in the report of the association.

Association's conclusions were that university autonomy has brought more freedom to management than to academic staff, that is, academic freedom being the central element of a democratic society, without which the progress stagnates.

The association recommended to develop policies and regulations at institution's level that would not jeopardize academic freedom of staff from higher education institutions.

With the approval of new legal framework governing university autonomy in Sweden there is no central regulation regarding sabbatical leave. The granting method is decided locally. Every teaching staff applyind for this leave shall negotiate with the Head of Department the period and conditions of the leave. Typically, the period is 3 years and the teaching staff shall present an activity plan for these three years. Upon returning the employee shall present an achievement report as well as the product of the activity.

3.3.2.3. Invited academic staff

Swedish higher education institutions are entitled to invite academic and research staff from abroad to work at the institution under contracts concluded for a determined period usually not exceeding 3 years. Individuals meeting the criteria for holding the position applied for shall be invited by the Head of Department without any competition, just based on the written invitation on behalf of the department.

Conclusions through the Government – University interface

The Higher Education Act establishes the general framework for employees' promotion, however every institution is autonomous in determining the criteria and conditions required to hold a certain position as well as the procedure to be followed.

3.3.3. Freedom to decide on workloads

Freedom to decide on labor norming lies with the right of higher education institution to decide on the distribution of working time, work norms, establishing the time period required for qualitative performance of employee obligations.

3.3.3.1. Structure of teaching /academic workload

The teaching workload of academic staff from Swedish higher education institutions consists of a total number of hours distributed monthly during the academic year.

According to internal regulations of higher education institutions, the working hours of academic personnel must be planned within the department of the employee following discussions between him and the Head of Department. When planning the working hours, operational requirements, financial situation and general analysis of teaching tasks shall be taken into account. At the department level, the total number of hours for teaching and research which must be evenly distributed among members of the department shall be accounted.

According to statistics provided by the Swedish Higher Education Agency, the following structure of academic staff workload in Swedish higher education can be noticed:

- 41% of the total number of hours is allocated to research and development work;
- 22% of the total number of hours are allocated to teaching at cycle I and II;
- 3% of the total number of hours is assigned to teaching at cycle III.

Teaching activities at cycle I and II are performed mostly by lecturers and senior lecturers. A university lecturer spends 60% of the total number of hours for teaching. A senior lecturer assigns 42% of his total hours for teaching. At the same time, these two categories of employees dedicate little time of their work to research and development. The category of staff spending most of the work time for research and development, namely 70% of total work time, includes scientific researchers and post-doctoral students, part of research staff

group, and other teaching staff. University professors allocate 17% of the working time for teaching at I and II cycles, 10% for teaching at cycle III and 42% for research and development.

3.3.3.2. Working time. Obligations of higher education institutions' staff

The normal working period of teaching personnel is established between 1700-1756 hours per year. The criterion for differentiation is the age of personnel. For academic staff reaching the age of 40 years a normal working time period is 1700 hours, for those who have reached the age of 30 years the working period is 1732 hours per year and employees under the age of 30 shall work 1756 hours per year.

According to the Higher Education Act, employees from higher education institutions have the following obligations: carrying out educational, research and development and administrative activities. Besides, teaching personnel should monitor the development of material they teach as well as the general development of society and of other areas related to their work.

All teaching and research activities are planned within the department. The distribution of work tasks is done based on the annual plan of teaching and research activities assigned to the department, after an overall evaluation within the institution. The Head of Department shall supervise the fact that there is a balanced teaching and research activity. A work schedule shall be elaborated for every teacher at the beginning of every study year. The activity plan of every employee shall be prepared in writing and shall be signed by the latter.

The activity plan of every employee must also be approved by unions' representatives operating at the institution. They shall evaluate in principle the complexity of the course, the nature and methods of training to be used, the number of students, etc.

Distribution of tasks among teachers varies within different periods. Institutions have the right to grant after a certain period of time, usually once every three years, an exemption from duties to be used for research and development as well as for professional training.

For non-teaching personnel the normal working time period is 40 hours weekly, with the possibility of a flexible work regime depending on position's particularity and complexity.

Working hours, in addition to the basic workload, shall be carried out only by consent of the superviser and with a thorough justification of the relevant reason.

3.3.4. Freedom to decide on the salary system

In Sweden, the freedom of higher education institution to decide on the remuneration system consists of their right to develop own remuneration rules and mechanisms for the work performed by employees, in consultation with unions and based on a social dialogue.

3.3.4.1. Salary determination system

Remuneration criteria

The employer and employee representatives negotiate the establishment of remuneration criteria for different groups of employees. Based on these criteria the school director /head of department shall evaluate every employee in order to establish its rightful wage. These criteria negotiated by parties of the employment relationship in higher education institutions shall serve as the basis for salary negotiation between the employee and the head of department, etc.

Given the fact that every employee from higher education institutions is evaluated based on certain criteria, his salary shall be individualized and differentiated. The essential criteria for employee evaluation refer to his skills and work results obtained. According to the Higher Education Ordinance, work obligations of academic personnel include teaching, research, development and administration. Similarly, according to the same act, when evaluating an employee his leadership skills and ability to work with local community environment shal be taken into consideration. The vast majority of institutions have developed own criteria for evaluation of teaching personnel with regard to wage determination. Evaluation of academic personnel shall be conducted according to three [four] components, as follows:

- 1. Teaching capacity, including the following factors:
- implementation, development and promotion of high level teaching;
- demonstration of commitment and interest toward the course taught;
- development of quality teaching material, etc.
- 2. Research work, including the following factors:
- national and international publications, both quantitatively and qualitatively;
- quoting in national and international papers, both quantitatively and qualitatively;
- ability to apply for external research funds;
- ability to coordinate research activities, etc.
- 3. Administrative work, evaluated based on the following factors:
- participation in the work of various committees and management structures within the institution;
- ability for cooperation, understanding and appreciation of colleagues from own unit, ability to understand and manage career opportunities;
- understanding of internal structure of higher education institution and decision-making mechanisms.
- 4. Cooperation with external community, evaluated based on the following factors:
- collaborative associations with the external environment, start-ups initiation, etc;

- participation in the public life of the community, including participation in public debates, appearance in the media, etc.;
- membership in doctoral theses defence committees outside own institution;
- collaboration with national and international partners.

The criteria must be applied proportionately to the work carried out by the academic staff. In addition to general criteria outlined above, every institution has established own criteria depending on their particular aspects. At the same time, there should not exist enormous disparity when setting wages, both among employees of a department and among employees from several departments.

Staff working as chairmen of research and teaching committees enjoy salary bonuses.

Swedish higher education institutions stimulate professional training, paying various bonuses to employees obtaining Ph.D. degrees.

3.3.4.2. Bodies authorized to set salaries

Every higher educational institution in Sweden is free and autonomous to establish own remuneration system. The institution shall adopt remuneration policies that must relate to all employees. Decisions on salary amounts are taken considering the difficulty of assigned tasks, skills and knowledge of the employee and evaluation of individual results. Every head of department/division of higher education institution is responsible to notify all employees about institution's remuneration policies.

Establishment of motivation policies for employees aims the following purposes: stimulation of excellence and professional development of employees, as well as retention within the institution of well-qualified personnel.

Decisions on rhe remuneration of staff of higher education institutions are taken individually and are differentiated. The main feature of an individualized remuneration system is that it is based on individual negotiation of the head of department/subdivision with every employee. The remuneration level is based on transparency principles. Following collective negotiations remuneration criteria shall be approved and employees shall be individually evaluated each year. When establishing salary levels the following issues shall be taken into account as wages conventions approved at institutional and sector level, institution's remuneration policies, individual results of the employee and his contribution to the daily activity of the institution, as well as labour market situation.

The head of department/university subdivision that will make proposals to the human resource manager shall be reponsible for salary-setting of the employees of higher education institutions. Remuneration of heads of departments/divisions of higher education institutions usually is the responsibility of vice-chancellor of the institution (Executive Manager).

Negotiation and mutual consultions between employees and the head of department/division of an institution of higher education is a prerequisite for a functional and viable remuneration

system. With regard to employees evaluation and remuneration level we are in the presence of an enlarged autonomy, internal autonomy, that is, well-motivated human resource is a key element for the proper functioning of the institution, with a major impact on the quality of provided services.

Higher education institutions are autonomous in terms of setting a maximal or minimal wage level, however they must establish their remuneration systems taking into consideration the Equal Opportunities Act. Here is the intersection point of **Government-University** interface because any institution including higher education institutions have to ensure equal pay for equal work and employees evaluation criteria must be non-discriminatory regardless of gender, ethnicity, sexual orientation, religion or age of employees.

3.3.5. Freedom to decide on the termination of employment contracts

Employment contracts are usually concluded for an indefinite period. As an exception, some positions in higher education institutions are temporary and employment contracts are concluded for determined periods. The difference between an employment contract for indefinite period and a contract concluded for a fixed period is that in the first case the employer may terminate labour relations only based on legal grounds while in the second case labour relations terminate together with expiration of employment period.

The notice period for employees is two months if the employee has a labour relationship with the institution of more than one year and one month when the employee has worked at the institution less than a year.

3.3.5.1. Termination of fixed-term employment and preemptive right to employment

The employment contract concluded for a determined period terminates on the last day of the contract. If the employment contract shall not be extended and if the employee has been employed for more than 12 months during the last three years, and labour relations are not to be extended, the employer shall inform the local union organization and will send a written notice to the employee at least one month before contract termination. The notification shall indicate whether the employee has a preferential right to be re-employed. The right to be re-employed is valid beginning with the period when the notification was issued and before the expiration of nine months from the time of contract termination. The employee wishing to be re-employed must express his agreement in written form.

3.3.5.2. Termination of indefinte-period employment contracts

As grounds for termination of employment contracts concluded for an indefinite period may serve employee-related reasons as well as reasons non-related to the employee. In the situation when employment relationships terminate due to work volume reduction, the employee enjoys social protection from the state. With regard to employees from higher education institutions the Convention on public sector employees job protection applies. According to provisions of this convention employees must be advised on cancelling their position during a period depending on their work activity period. Also, employees receive free consultations from competent bodies with regard to employment.

As for termination of employment relationships with top management staff, it shall be confirmed by an external authority but the termination procedure shall be developed by every institution separately.

In case of management staff, e.g. department heads, deans, the institution can pay a compensation upon contract termination. Usually, its amount depends on the employment period of the manager within the institution.

Conclusions through the Government-University interface

Swedish higher education institutions have the freedom to decide on economic reasons underlying the termination of employment relationships in case of work volume reduction, but shall observe all normative acts in force in the country on providing guarantees and compensations to employees in such a situation. Institution's unions also have a key role in carrying out that freedom.

3.4. Denmark

3.4.1. Freedom /capacity to decide on recruitment and employment procedures

According to the Danish Universities Act, universities are independent institutions financed from the public sector by the relevant Ministry. In accordance with Art. 49 of this Act, Danish universities must follow the rules established by the Ministry of Finance on employment and remuneration conditions for higher education institutions personnel in Denmark. The Ministry of Higher Education and Research has prepared an order regarding employment of academic staff. The purpose of this order is the establishment of a general framework and adjustment to it of internal regulations of every institution in order not to harm the interests of subjects of employment relationship. Provisions of this order refer to the academic staff described in the Memorandum regarding categories of academic staff in universities and the general framework for personnel positions, conditions for occupying vacant positions, evaluation procedures, establishing that universities have the right to set additional conditions.

3.4.1.1. Bodies responsible for recruitment and employment procedures

According to the Danish Universitie Act, the university Board is the highest authority of the higher education institution having the role of protecting the interests of the institution and determining its policies with regard to development and long-term activities. For example, at Aalborg University the Board is responsible for hiring the Rector and top managers. Rector's hiring is preceded by a public announcement regarding the vacant position and a contract with the selected person shall be concluded for the period decided by the Board, with the possibility of its extension.

The Board shall establish a Committee responsible for employment at the university. The Committee shall include representatives of academic, technical, administrative staff and

students. The Committee shall make an overall evaluation of candidates' profile and conduct interviews with selected candidates only. The employment Committee may recommend no more than three applicants for a position. The final decision on employment belongs to the Board. The chairman of the Board or his deputy also acts as chairman of the employment Committee. The Board, by Rector's recommendation, shall employ one or more vice-rectors. The vice-rector must be a recognized and notorious person in the area of research. The vicerector is the deputy rector. If several vice-rectors are employed one of them shall be appointed as deputy rector. Employment of the vice-rector is preceded by the following procedure: the rector shall appoint an employment committee consisting of academic, administrative and technical staff representatives and students' representatives. This committee shall be assigned with the task of evaluating candidates' profile and with those selected an interview shall be conducted. The rector shall recommend only one candidate for a position. Similarly, following rector's recommendation the director of the university shall be employed (in case of Aalborg University the latter is responsible for administrative and financial aspects of the University). The vacant position is publicly announced and the rector establishes a committee responsible for selection of candidates, composed of executive management representatives, administrative staff representatives, a dean and a director of another university. The rector acts as the chairman of the Committee.

Deans are employed by the rector. The vacant position is announced publicly and the employment Committee under the presidency of the rector meets. The Committee includes representatives of academic, technical and administrative staff as well as students' representatives. The Dean is employed for a determined period the length of which is decided by the Rector. The Committee shall evaluate candidates' applications and propose one for Rector's approval.

Deans, in turn, are responsible for employment of education programs managers, as proposed by the respective education council. The Dean may consult the department involved in the respective education program on applications of potential program directors. At the same time, the Dean must ensure that the recommended staff has the necessary competence required for the position.

Employment of library director is the responsibility of the Rector. Vacant position is announced publicly and the Rector shall establish, under his presidency, an employment committee including management, library employees and faculties' representatives. The committee shall also include external experts in the field of librarianship.

Other employees, including academic staff, are employed by the Rector.

3.4.1.2. Methods and procedures for recruitment and employment. Approval /confirmation of recruitment /employment

With certain exceptions, all vacant academic positions are announced, including international announcements for professor prosition. After publication of the notice and after application deadline for a specific position, the rector shall establish an Employment Committee under his presidency. The Committee shall evaluate the records of candidates applying for

employment. The number of committee members varies, depending on the position applied, from three to five persons. Committee members must be at least associate professors and, when recruiting professors, committee members shall include professors only. Committee members are nominated by the Study Board and applicants are notified about its nominal composition.

Applicants' portfolio is evaluated by all members of the Committee which compile a collective evaluation report indicating whether the applicant complies on not with position's requirements. Evaluation indicators are described by the job structure. The report is presented to each applicant and to the head of the department applied, so that the latter can select the most suitable applicant for the vacant position. Before deciding on employment, the Head of Department and the Dean can interview the selected applicant. The Head of Department shall recommend to the Dean the person selected to be employed and the latter is empowered to take the final decision. The Dean may decide that there are no reasons for employment, based on the results and individual merits of the applicant, even if the latter is quite qualified for the position.

The Dean shall send a letter of nomination to the selected candidate, announcing him about the position offered within the university. In parallel, the employment contract of the employee is prepared. On average, the recruitment procedure lasts from four to fifteen weeks. This procedure does not apply to employees working part-time and to those invited to work at the university in a particular department, conducting certain activities.

3.4.1.3. Types of employment and employment contracts

In Danish universities, the Rector of the institution is responsible for personnel employment. Decision on employment is taken no later than six months from the deadline date for submission of particular position employment applications. Usually, employment contracts are concluded for an indefinite period.

Universities have the right to hire employees for a determined period, not exceeding two year-period, as well as employees from abroad for professor or associate professor positions. These employees can be re-employed for a period not exceeding one year. In both cases employment shall be made without public notice, provided that the employee meets the conditions required by the academic position.

For employees outside Denmark, whose total period of employment, including reemployment, exceeds three years, positions shall be announced vacant and they shall participate in the competition according to the general rules.

Notorious personalities can be employed without carrying out the procedure of prior announcement for vacant position and without evaluation. The Rector can establish specialized committees to explore the labour market in search of a specific employee having certain capabilities. Employment contracts with such employees shall be concluded for an indefinite period.

3.4.1.4. Conditions for appointment to posts in higher education. Academic career

Until 2007, Danish higher education institutions did not have the concept of academic career, which meant that employees had no guarantees regarding the conclusion of employment contracts after completion of their activity in post doctoral or assistant professor positions. Beginning with January 1, 2007 new types of employment contracts were developed providing continuity of the academic career. Academic career means continuity in academic positions from an entry-level position up to the highest position within the same institution.

Assistant Professor /Researcher /Post-doc

Applicants must hold a PhD degree. Employment for these positions is done either for an indefinite or a determined period, usually with a 4-year initial employment and a possible extension for a maximal 4-year period, with a possible extension for an indefinite period. The work regime can be full- or part-time, as decided by the university. Usually, employees, after the first 4 years of employment shall be promoted to the position of associate professor, senior researcher, senior consultant. The promotion shall be carried out only after evaluation given that the candidate meets qualification criteria. Typically, the evaluation takes place six months before the expiry of the labour contract. If employee's qualification is not confirmed, termination of employment shall be operated.

Associate Professor /Senior Researcher

Evaluation of candidates is conducted to verify the compliance of their profile with conditions required for occupation of the prosition, which are described in the vacancy notice. Employment period depends on research carried out during employment as assistant professor, researcher, post-doc. Candidates must be competent in supervisory, pedagogical, knowledge transfer and other aspects. Usually, the duration of labor contract is indefinite, with certain exceptions in case of special projects. The work regime can be full- or part-time activity.

Professor

Candidates for these positions are evaluated in compliance with the requirements described in the vacancy notice and must demonstrate relevant academic results internationally recognized as well as capacity to conduct research. Similarly, it is necessary to demonstrate competence in the area of technology transfer, leadership capacity for research and international cooperation.

Applications are evaluated by an Employment Committee, whose approval is required for application to vacant positions.

Establishment of minimal conditions for access to academic careers by means of the Memorandum on teaching positions structure, providing for all education institutions a unified description of teaching positions, comes to support the idea that university human resources autonomy should be correlated with the principle of public accountability of the institution, the university being free to select its staff and establish own criteria (which shall not be lower than the legally established ones) but the selection should be done among the best, that is: the state being aware of the university role in society, establishes rules leading to

the fact that higher education institutions shall decide in favour of the best performing candidates.

3.4.1.5. Staff of higher education institutions

The staff working in Danish universities consists of academic, administrative and technical staff. The legal framework for employment relationship of staff from Danish higher education institutions is governed by a set of regulations approved both at central and institutional levels.

In Denmark there is no central-level methodology based on which the necessary number of academic positions in higher education institution is established. In general, the Ministry of Finance, according to budgetary mechanisms, distributes the total number of positions to the Ministry of Higher Education, and the latter distributes funds to every institution separately. Every institution is free to set own list of personnel positions, however, there is a limitation introduced, imposed by the Ministry of Higher Education, on the number of professors' positions.

In general, the Study Board is responsible for determining the number of positions required for a particular education program.

When determining the required number of positions universities are quasi-autonomous, depending on state funding, but are free to decide internally on the positions and department where the former shall be assigned.

Conclusions through the Government – University interface

The Universities Act and the Order of the Ministry regarding employment of academic personnel establish the structure of academic positions and personnel recruitment procedures, universities being entitled to develop these provisions through the adoption of internal regulations describing the details of these procedures. We are speaking of mixed regulatory procedures both at central and institutional levels.

3.4.2. Freedom of institutions to decide on the promotion of staff

This criterion of university autonomy in the area of human resources materializes in the right of higher education institution to decide on career evolution of personnel by promoting to a higher rank, position or professional level.

3.4.2.1. Staff evaluation

According to an Order of the Danish Ministry of Higher Education universities set their rules regarding academic evaluation of candidates for various positions within the institution.

The purpose of evaluation is to determine whether the candidate meets occupational requirements described in the job structure and also advanced requirements for positions described in the employment notice.

In particular, candidate's skills in teaching, research and communication are to be assessed. Evaluation results shall be recorded in writing and presented to the rector. If there is a different opinion within the evaluation committee, it shall necessarily be indicated in the minutes. The composition of the evaluation committee shall be decided at the university. In general, experts in the area subject to evaluation, holding at least necessary skills for the evaluated position, shall be appointed as members. Only persons holding, at least, the position of associate professor can be members of the evaluation committee. Only the chairman, secretary and ordinary members of the evaluation committee may participate in its work. All of them are obliged to act respecting the principle of privacy and gender equality.

The activity of invited teachers is not subject to evaluation.

Appointment of the chairman and members of the Evaluation Committee is within the authority of the Study Council and the Rector shall set the deadline for submission of the evaluation report. Evaluation criteria are set forth in the Memorandum regarding the job structure.

The result of the evaluation, noted as qualified (when the candidate meets job requirements) or unqualified (when the candidate does not meet job requirements), shall serve as basis for employment or where appropriate, promotion of employee within the academic career.

The task of the Evaluation Committee is to ensure an impartial, qualified and objective evaluation of academic skills of candidates for academic positions, presenting a detailed description of teaching, research, knowledge transfer and other relevant skills required for performance of specific activity. The commission shall not prioritize candidates for certain positions and every candidate shall be assessed individually.

3.4.2.2. Students' role in the promotion of academic staff

Students from Danish higher education institutions are encouraged to play an essential role in learning process and to be responsible for conducting a research activity within a small group of colleagues. Teachers' evaluation by students is part of internal quality management system and students are encouraged to address analytically both the quality of the course and the quality of teaching.

3.4.2.3. Academic mobility of teachers and internationalization policies

Academic mobility of teachers is part of the internationalization policies of each institution. Universities participate in various projects and teachers are motivated to participate as well. In general, teachers have the right to work in other institutions as associated or invited professors. Due to opening of higher education system to students from other countries and offering education programs in English, knowledge of this language is a priority for academic staff.

3.4.2.4. Rights and freedoms of higher education institutions' staff

The law provides the staff of higher education and research institutions with the following rights:

- to participate in competitions for research grants and funds;
- to become a member of various associations and trade unions from the country and from abroad:
- to work independently or join various research and creation groups;
- to publish own scientific work independently.

As for the right to rest for scientific and teaching personnel, these benefit from regular rest vacations as well as from sabbatical leaves. This type of vacation is granted for the completion of a thesis, development of scientific papers, etc., the period and conditions of this vacation being governed by internal regulations of the institution. Usually, this kind of leave is not paid at the expense of the university but research funds can be used for its financing. Employees also benefit from maternity leave, women being entitled to six months leave keeping full salary and men enjoying a 3 month-period keeping full salary. In addition, women can benefit from one maternity leave lasting 6 months keeping 80% of the salary.

3.4.2.5. Invited academic staff. Honorary titles awarding

Higher education institutions are entitled to award honorary titles of affiliated professor and affiliated associate professor. Awarding procedure is governed by a ministerial order. These honorary titles are awarded to individuals having a connection with the university and whom the latter wants to honour.

Awarding of these securities neither involves any remuneration nor influences the remuneration of the main activity.

The title is awarded for a five year-period. When awarding these titles confidentiality is taken into account and award initiative comes from the rector who must make sure that the person awarded agrees to receive this honorary title.

Conclusions through the Government – University interface

The Danish Universities Act establishes minimal conditions required for the evaluation of the academic staff; in order to achieve institutional freedom in terms of setting own criteria and procedures regarding personnel evaluation the universities establish own regulations. State intervention here is minimal given that performance indicators underlying the accreditation of institutions involve serious and strict assessment of personnel.

3.4.3. Freedom to decide on workload

Danish universities are autonomous in terms of their freedom to decide on labour norming, research-related activities being part of academic staff work activity. At local level, institutions are very autonomous and departments are responsible not only for assignment and

accounting of activities, but also for labour norming. The Head of Department, best knowing its staff, assigns specific tasks to every employee from the department and it is important to have both research and teaching results, thus the budget of the department consists of two components: teaching (financial means for enrolled students, for MBA attendants, bonuses from the Ministry of Finance for students who graduate on time) and research (basic financing, publications, external research grants, etc.).

3.4.3.1. Structure of teaching /academic workload

The workload of academic personnel consists of teaching and research activities. The share assigned for teaching activities amounts 50%, for research there is allocated a 40% share and the remaining 10% are assigned for administrative activities. This is the rule, but in practice there may be certain differences depending on the position held, specific work obligations and institutional rules.

Academic personnel enjoys freedom in teaching, including the right to choose the appropriate teaching material and to select the style of teaching.

The Study Council is responsible for monitoring teaching activities, ensuring their compliance with quality indicators.

Research activity represents 40% of the academic staff activity. These activities generally involve scientific publications in journals recognized nationally and internationally. At the same time academic staff have the right to choose research topic and methodology.

3.4.3.2. Working time. Obligations of higher education institutions' staff

Working time is the time period used by employees from higher education institutions in accordance with the existing regulations to fulfill their work obligations. A working week for employees from higher education institutions amounts 37 hours. The annual volume of work for teachers is 1000 hours. About a quarter of this time is assigned for teaching activities, another part of educational activities is assigned for supervisory activity, including evaluation activity as well, and the distribution of working time follows the next scheme:

1 (student) group-20 h;

2 groups-30h;

3 or more groups-40 h.

The maximal allowed number of groups is 25.

According to Danish higher education legislation, the academic community has a general obligation to comply with tasks and duties under the individual employment contract as well as to perform both qualitatively and quantitatively work obligations set out in the job description.

Generally, every higher education institution has its own Code of Ethics and its rules must be respected by all members of the academic community.

3.4.4. Freedom /capacity to decide on the remuneration system

Danish universities are part of the public sector and their remuneration is done based on collective agreements.

3.4.4.1. Salary structure. Incentive payments

Employees who are employed in similar positions having the same seniority and experience in work activity benefit from equal remuneration conditions. Collective agreement on remuneration in Danish universities is negotiated by the Ministry of Finance and the Confederation of Professional Associations. At employment of every employee the salary shall be negotiated with unions representatives. The basic salary of all teachers, except professor's salary is established within a remuneration scale from level 4 to level 8. As a rule, in order to be employed at level 4, the employee must have Master's degree or equivalent to Danish Master degree.

Remuneration scale rating shall be made annually for one level. The remuneration of professors is not carried out considering the seniority criterion in labour activity but based on a distinct salary for this position.

When hiring a representative of the teaching staff, under the job structure memorandum every employee shall receive an allowance specific to every academic position.

In addition to basic salary and allowance for different position categories, employees enjoy different supplements to salaries established under collective negociations between (interested) employees' and managerial team representatives.

3.4.4.2. Bodies empowered to set salaries

According to the Danish Ministry of Finance Circular of 21.09.2009 regarding framework agreements of the new salary system, the right to negotiate and conclude agreements on the salary system is decentralized. Signing of these agreements lies with the competence of parties authorized to do so. Within the university such negotiations are held annually and refer only to salary increases. Basic salaries are regulated by government acts. Negotiations are conducted between two parties, employers' and employees' representatives. From the employer's side, negociations shall be attended by management team representatives belonging to the level and unit to which the negotiation refers.

Managers empowered to negotiate the salary may request the assistance of the manager leading the unit where employees whose salary is subject to negotiation work. The negotiator must be aware of regulations governing remuneration and of unit's situation.

The employees shall be represented by union organizations. When there are no trade unions within the university the managers of the institution shall appeal to branch union organization.

The management team of the university is obliged to disclose information on financial resources assigned to labour remuneration.

However, this freedom, component of human resources autonomy, is limited by the state stipulating that every employer must comply with the principle of fairness when paying salaries, expressed through the fact that the institution must ensure equal pay for similar work activities. Another relevant Danish legislation provision, which also draws the intersection point for GOVERNMENT-UNIVERSITY interface, states that every institution including higher education institutions must guarantee priority payment of salaries before any other claims of the institution.

3.4.5. Freedom to decide on the employment contracts termination method

Termination of employment contracts of personnel from Danish higher education institutions is governed by the law regulating employment relationships of the public sector employees.

3.4.5.1. Grounds for termination of employment contracts specific to higher education

Any member of the academic community may quit by own initiative the position occupied through resignation. In this respect, there must be a notice period. Usually, at least one month before the date of resignation a written notice is dispatched.

Dismissal – termination of labour contract by employer initiative may occur in two cases:

- dismissal based on violation of labour discipline. Shall be operated only by previous record of employee's certain misconduct followed by application of disciplinary sanctions. Disciplinary sanctions must be operated having prior approval from department's union entity (subdivision where the employee works with the employee providing a written explanation regarding the disciplinary misconduct).
- dismissal based on economic reasons, which can occur either after position reduction or under other institutional circumstances such as budget financing cuts, education program closing, etc. General conditions regarding non-discrimination based on various criteria of employees subject to dismissal for economic reasons shall be observed. When dismissed for economic reasons employees shall receive a legally established allowance.

In both cases university unions shall be consulted in and the following notice periods shall be observed:

- 1 month for employees who have been employed less than 6 months;
- 3 months when the employment period exceeded 6 months;
- 4 months after three years of employment. For every 3-year period of employment one month shall be added, but not exceeding 6 months.

3.4.5.2. Termination of employment contracts with managerial staff

The Council of the institution appoints the Rector for a fixed period and the duration of this period is also decided by the Council.

Termination of Rector's labour relations occurs under the same conditions as for the rest of teachers from higher education. Given that the rector recommends to the Council the employment of vice-rectors as well as of the university director, the Rector may also require their resignation when there are reasonable grounds to do so, for example, when they do not fulfill their obligations in accordance with the labour contract. In all cases of labour contract termination for disciplinary or economic reasons, the employees concerned shall be assisted by union's representatives.

Conclusions through the Government – University interface

The Danish state offers limited autonomy regarding the freedom to decide over the termination of labour contracts. The university is free to decide over one termination reason or another, to decide over prolonging these contracts in case of their expiry or to find solutions for retaining teachers in higher education, however, in all cases institutions are required to comply with the established procedure for public sector employees and to ensure legally provided guarrantees.

3.5. Romania

3.5.1. Freedom /ability to decide on recruitment and employment procedures

Romanian Law on National Education no. 1 of January 5, 2011 provides that university autonomy is guaranteed by the Constitution and academic freedom is guaranteed by law. In this respect it is acknowledged the right of university community to establish its own mission, institutional strategy, structure, activities, organization and operation, material and human resources management in strict compliance with the legislation.

In accordance with the University Charter, employees' selection, hiring, periodic evaluation, training, motivation and termination of employment contract relations are the responsibility of the director in charge of personnel department, of the doctoral school manager or of the dean.

The above-mentioned law describes in detail recruitment procedures as well as the procedure for employment contract conclusion, higher education institutions being free to decide on the selection of candidates.

3.5.1.1. Bodies responsible for recruitment and employment procedures

The procedures for recruitment/employment in Romanian higher education institutions are carried out in compliance with the provisions of Competition Framework Methodology for the occupation of vacant teaching and research positions in higher education, approved by Decision no. 457/2011, published in the Official Gazette no. 371 of 26.05.2011. Higher education institutions were required, within 60 days after the entry into force of this decision,

to develop own competition Methodologies for the occupation of vacancies in strict compliance with the provisions of the Framework Methodology. Own methodology had to be approved by the University Senate and published on the higher education institution's website.

In accordance with these normative acts, a vacancy contest proposal is made by the director of the department or by the principal of the doctoral school at which the vacancy exists, by means of a reference approved by the department/doctoral school board and by the faculty board.

The Contest Commission is the body responsible for recruitment/employment procedures. Appointment of contest commission members is done after the publication of position contest notice for each announced vacancy. For example, at the "Ştefan cel Mare" University from Suceava, the Contest Commission is established and approved within 30 days after the publication of position notice in the Official Gazette of Romania. The Contest Commission may include deputy members. The board of the department/doctoral school at which the position exists makes proposals with regard to the nominal composition of the Contest Commission. Composition of the Contest Commission is proposed by the dean of the faculty taking into consideration the proposals of the department/doctoral school board and must be endorsed by the faculty board.

The nominal composition of the Contest Commission, together with faculty board endorsement notice, is submitted to the University Senate for approval. Following approval by the University Senate, the composition of Contest Commission is appointed by Rector's decision. After that, within two working days the decision is transmitted to the Ministry of Education, Research, Youth and Sport and the nominal composition of the Contest Commission is published on contest website. For positions of associate professor, professor, II degree scientific researcher and I degree scientific researcher, the composition of the commission shall be published in the Official Gazette of Romania, Part III. In case of defense system, public order and national security higher education institutions, Rector's decision is also transmitted to the relevant bodies.

Contest Commission composition and activity:

The Contest Commission consists of five members, including its chairman, specialists in the field of the announced vacant position or in related fields. When a member is unavailable for participation in the work of the commission, the respective member shall be replaced by a deputy appointed through the same procedure as commission members. Decisions are taken by secret vote of Contest Commission members. A commission's decision is valid if taken by the vote of at least three members. The chairman directs the work of the Contest Commission. Commission members may be form inside or outside the institution of higher education, from the country or from abroad. In case of higher education institutions from abroad, these must be mandatorily from the list approved by the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sport. For positions of associate professor, professor, I and II degree scientific researcher, at least three commission members must be from outside the institution

that organizes the contest, being from the country or from abroad. For a professor's position, except for positions from specifically Romanian scientific fields as well as positions related to defense system, public order and national security, at least one committee member must have an employment contract, by the date of vacancy notice publication in the Official Gazette of Romania, Part III, with an institution of higher education and research from abroad included in the list approved by the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sports. Contest Commission members must hold a teaching or research degree senior or at least equal to the announced vacant position or, in case of members from abroad, meet relevant university standards with regard to the announced vacant position.

For the sole purpose of participating in the work of the Contest Commission, equivalence of teaching or research degrees of foreign members of the commission with Romanian teaching or research degrees is carried out through university senate approval of the nominal composition of commission members. The following persons can be appointed as chairman of the Contest Commission: the director of the department or the principal of the doctoral school where the position exists; the dean or the vice-dean of the faculty where the position exists; a member of the department /faculty board delegated for this purpose through the vote of the respective board. The nomination of the chairperson is made by the higher education institution according to own methodology.

The Contest Commission evaluates the candidate in terms of the following aspects:

- a) candidate's relevance and impact of scientific results;
- b) candidate's ability to guide students or young researchers;
- c) candidate's teaching skills, for positions requiring teaching activity;
- d) candidate's ability to transfer own knowledge and results to the economic or social environment or to disseminate own scientific results;
- e) candidate's ability to work in a team and his/her scientific collaboration effectiveness depending on the particularities of candidate's field;
- f) candidate's ability to manage research and development projects;
- g) candidate's professional experience in institutions other than the institution which announced the vacancy, particularly the experience within higher education and research institutions from the list approved by order of the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sport.

Professional skills of the candidate shall be assessed by the Contest Commission based on the contest record and, additionally, through one or more contest examinations, including lectures, courses or other tests, according to relevant methodology. For all indefinite-term positions, at least one mandatory contest examination requires a public lecture lasting at least 45 minutes during which the candidate presents previous most significant professional results and academic career development plan. This examination contains a mandatory session of

questions from the Commission and the public. Higher education institution announces on the contest web page the date, time and place of this examination at least 5 working days before the examination.

3.5.1.2. Recruitment and employment methods and procedures. Approval /confirmation of recruitment /employment

According to Art. 219, paragraph (1), letter a) and Art. 295 paragraph (1) of the Law on National Education no. 1/2011, for teaching and research positions in higher education can apply only persons meeting minimal and mandatory standards when registering for vacant teaching and research positions in higher education, approved by order of the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sport. Every higher education institution must provide in its own contest methodology regarding vacant positions the minimal standards for occupation of teaching and research positions of: assistant hired for an indefinite period, lecturer /activity leader, associate professor, professor, research assistant hired for an indefinite period, scientific researcher, II degree scientific researcher, I degree scientific researcher. Standards relevant to these functions are minimal and mandatory requirements for registration at the contest for these functions. They are established by the higher education institution and approval by the university senate. University standards cannot derogate from the national minimal standards approved by order of the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sport. University standards are higher or equal to the national minimal standards. Higher education institution cannot establish by own methodology or through other documents equivalence of candidate's accomplishment of national minimal standards by means of standards, criteria and indicators other than those set by national minimal standards approved by order of the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sport.

Own methodology provides for the settlement of disputes within the institution which organized the contest. Appeals can be submitted exclusively for violation of legal proceedings. When an applicant has evidence that can prove failure to comply to legal proceedings of the contest, the applicant may submit an appeal within 5 working days after the communication of results. The appeal must be in writing, has to be filed at the registration office of higher education institution and must be settled by the contest commission. Failure to comply with the methodology by responsible persons involved in the procedure for organizing and conducting the contest is misconduct and shall be sanctioned in accordance with applicable law. Own methodology must be developed strictly observing the principles governing higher education that are provided in the Law on National Education and other legal acts in force.

Procedures

The notice regarding the organization of the contest shall be published at least two months before the date of the first examination. Registration for the contest starts on the day of publication in the Official Gazette of Romania, Part III, of the competition for vacant position and end 15 calendar days before the first examination. Notices shall be published in compliance with the following minimum requirements: on a visible location from the main

page of the higher education institution website; on a specialized website administered by the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport; in the Official Gazette of Romania, Part III. The higher education institution and the Ministry of National Education may announce the contests by any additional means, including announcements in the media, in national and international scientific publications, on websites specialized in publishing job offers and the like. The contest website is the website presenting complete information about the contest directly from the specialized website administered by the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport. On the contest website shall be published at least the following information: description of the vacant position; tasks /activities related to the vacant position, including teaching workload and types of activities included in it, for research positions - the research workload; minimal position's wage at employment; competition calendar; topics of contest examinations, lectures, courses or other similar, or themes based on which the Contest Commission can select effective examination themes; description of the contest procedure; full list of documents that applicants are required to include in their contest applications; address where applications are to be sent. Announcements regarding positions of associate professor, professor, II degree scientific researcher and I degree scientific researcher shall be published in English.

On the website of the contest as well as on the website of higher education institution, within 5 working days after the closing date for contest registration at the latest, for every candidate registered and in compliance with personal data protection the following information shall be published: curriculum vitae; sheet verifying compliance to minimal standards.

Competitions are open and persons eligible in terms of contest registration conditions may participate without discrimination under the law, and the contest methodology cannot contain discriminatory provisions with regard to candidates based on gender, ethnic or social origin, nationality, religion or belief, disability, political opinions, social or economic condition. Contest methodology cannot refer to age and cannot contain provisions that disadvantage candidates outside the institution or from abroad. The description of vacant position shall be made in comprehensive terms corresponding to the real needs of higher education institution, taking into consideration not to artificially limit the number of potential candidates.

The legislation imposes certain prohibitions for persons involved in the organization of the contest, namely: spouses, in-laws and relatives up to the third degree of one or more candidates; are employed at the same institution with a candidate holding an administrative position and are hierarchically subordinated to the candidate; are or have been paid within research projects in which a candidate has acted as project director in the last 5 years prior to the contest; receive or have received in the last 5 years prior to the contest services or benefits of any kind from a candidate. Are considered to be involved in the competition procedure persons who: participate in the decision process on the appointment of the contest commission; are members or deputy members of the Contest Commission; are involved in professional or administrative assessment decisions within the contest; are involved in complaints settlement. If, after a candidate wins the contest, one or more persons from the higher education institution are to be in an incompatibility situation mentioned above, appointment to the position and awarding of the academic title by the institution of higher

education or of professional research and development degree can take place only after settling the situation of incompatibility. The settling manner of the incompatibility situation shall be communicated to the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport, within two working days after the settlement.

Higher education institutions can organize the contest for a teaching or research position only if it was declared vacant. A position is considered vacant if this is envisaged in the positions list prepared annually, or if it becomes vacant during the academic year. The position becomes vacant through one of the following ways: legal termination of employment contract; transfer of the person occupying the position to another position within the same higher education institution after winning a contest. Teaching and research positions cannot be brought to contest by transforming the occupied position into a senior position. The institution of higher education can organize a contest for occupation of a teaching or research position for an indefinite period only after publication by the Ministry of National Education of the vacant position in the Official Gazette of Romania, Part III. For publication in the Official Gazette of Romania, Part III, higher education institutions submit to the Ministry of National Education the following documents: list of positions proposed for the contest and their structure, signed and stamped by the rector of higher education institution; extract from the positions list containing vacant positions brought to contest, signed by the rector, the dean and the head of department or the principal of the doctoral school; for teaching positions, sworn statement of the rector of higher education institution certifying that all teaching positions proposed for the contest have in their structure only subjects from the legally established curricula of specializations/education programs, including the form of education and place where taught; own methodology. The request to the Ministry of National Education for publication in the Official Gazette of Romania, Part III, of the vacant position brought to contest shall be mandatorily carried out within the first 30 calendar days after the start of each semester of the academic year. The Ministry of National Education verifies positions structure based on legal provisions in force. Contest procedures can be initiated only after publication in the Official Gazette of Romania, Part III, of the vacant position brought to contest.

The proposal to organize a contest for a vacant position is made by the head of department or by the principal of the doctoral school in the structure of which the position exists, through a reference approved by the department board or doctoral school board and by the faculty board. The list of positions proposed for contest completion shall be endorsed by the dean and submitted to the board of higher education institution for approval. Contest results shall be approved by the university senate and employment shall be done starting with the first day of the semester following the contest. Heads of departments, deans and the rector are accountable to the University Senate for good organization of vacant position contests, in compliance with quality standards, academic ethics and current legislation. When discovering deviations from these, the Senate may apply sanctions specified in own methodology, including dismissal of deans or rector. In case of failure to comply with legal requirements during occupation of teaching and research positions, the Ministry of National Education may impose sanctions on the basis of report submitted by the Board of Ethics and University

Management. When courts of law find infringement of contest procedures for occupation of teaching and research positions in universities, the contest is canceled and resumed.

Employment procedure for management positions

In Romanian higher education institutions there are the following management positions: rector, vice-rectors, general director for university administration; dean and vice-deans at faculty level; head of the department at the department level. Deans are selected through public contest, organized by the rector at faculty level. The competition is open to persons from the university or from any relevant faculty in Romania or from abroad that, based on plenary hearings of the faculty board, received its approval for participation in the contest. The faculty board is required to approve at least 2 candidates. The dean shall appoint vice-deans after their appointment by the rector.

The rector may be appointed by one of the following procedures: through a public contest, based on a methodology approved by the newly elected university senate, in accordance with the Law on National Education or through the universal, direct and secret vote of all tenured teachers and researchers from the university as well as of student representatives from the University Senate and faculty boards. The proceeding for rector's appointment is established at least 6 months before every appointment of the rector, through universal, direct and secret vote of all tenured teachers and researchers from the university as well as of student representatives from the University Senate and faculty boards.

If the proceeding chosen for rector's appointment is based on a public competition, the designation procedure is as follows: the newly elected university senate creates a commission for selection and recruitment of the rector, composed of members of the university (50%) and of scientific and academic personalities from outside the university, from Romania and from abroad (50%). This commission shall be composed of at least 12 members, of which at least one student representative or a university graduate appointed by students from the Senate, in accordance with the university Charter. Also, the newly elected senate develops and approves the methodology for designation, selection and recruitment of the rector according to the law. The public contest for rector's appoinment is conducted based on the methodology for hiring of teachers and researchers. The contest commission is the commission in charge of selection and recruitment. The contest for rector's position is open to scientific or academic personalities from Romania and from abroad, which, after hearings within the newly elected University Senate, were approved by the latter for participation at the contest. The approval shall be granted only based on the simple vote majority of the newly elected University Senate members. The newly elected University Senate is required to approve at least 2 candidates. Candidates approved by the newly elected Senate participate in the contest. The appointed rector is confirmed by the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sport within 30 days from the date of selection. After the release of the confirmation order, the rector can sign official documents, financial /accounting documents, diplomas and certificates. The rector, confirmed by the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sport, appoints vice-rectors after consultation with the University Senate. The rector, confirmed by the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sport concludes with the Senate a management contract that stipulates criteria and management performance indicators, rights and obligations of the contracting parties.

Deans are selected through a public contest organized by the new rector and approved by the University Senate. The competition is open to candidates approved by the faculty board through simple vote majority of its members and based on own methodology developed by the University Senate. The faculty board shall aprove at least 2 candidates.

The general director for administration may remain in his position based on his written agreement regarding the executive support of the management plan of the new rector.

Rector's term of office is 4 years. This term may be renewed at most once and after a new contest according to the university Charter. A person cannot hold the rector's office of the same higher education institution for more than 8 years, regardless of the period in which appointments were made and interruptions occurred.

The administrative structure of higher education institutions is headed by an administrative director and is organized into directorates. The position of general director for administration is occupied by contest organized by the administrative board of the higher education institution. The chairman of the Contest Commission is the rector of the institution. The Commission is necessarily composed of a representative from the Ministry of Education, Research, Youth and Sport. Contest results validation is made by the University Senate and appointment into position – by the rector.

3.5.1.3. Types of employment and employment contracts

The Law on National Education no. 1 of January 5, 2011 stipulates the general conditions for recruitment and hiring of personnel of higher education institutions. Employment for a teaching or research position is done for a fixed or indefinite period. Employment for an indefinite period for any teaching or research position is only possible through public contest, organized by the institution of higher education following candidate's reception of a doctoral degree. The contest for a teaching or research position is open for participation to Romanian citizens or foreigners, without any discrimination, under the law. Employment for a fixed period is an exception and its maximal duration is three years. Doctoral students can be employed for a maximum period of 5 years. A fixed-term employment contract concluded between the university and members of the teaching and research personnel, following a contest, may be renewed depending on personal professional results evaluated according to the criteria established by the University Senate and depending on employment and financial resources needs of the institution in accordance with the legal provisions in force.

Doctoral students can perform teaching activity according to the doctoral education contract, limiteded to 4-6 conventional teaching hours a week. Teaching activities that exceed this limit shall be remunerated in accordance with the legislation in force, under Labour Code provisions, respecting the rights and obligations of the employee and payment of due contributions, under the law, for state social security, unemployment insurance, health social insurance as well as for work accidents and occupational diseases. Throughout the whole

activity period, the doctoral student benefits from recognition of professional and work seniority and also from free healthcare, without payment of state social insurance contributions, unemployment insurance, as well as health, work accidents and occupational diseases social insurance.

3.5.1.4. Conditions for appointment in higher education. Academic career

The minimal requirements for admission to the contest for a teaching position are provided by the Law on National Education and by other legal acts, approved at ministerial level. Higher education institutions have to establish own conditions which must be at least equal to those approved at the higher level.

For the position of <u>university assistant</u>, hired for an indefinite period, it is cumulatively required:

- a) to hold PhD diploma;
- b) to comply with the standards for filling teaching positions, specific to the post of assistant professor hired for an indefinite period, as provided by own methodology.

For the position of <u>lecturer /reader</u> it is cumulatively required:

- a) to hold PhD diploma;
- b) to comply with minimal standards required for filling teaching positions, specific to the post of lecturer /activity leader, as provided by own methodology.

For the position of associate professor it is cumulatively required:

- a) to hold PhD diploma;
- b) to comply with national minimal standards for filling teaching positions, specific to the post of associate professor, approved by order of the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sport;
- c) to comply with minimal standards for filling teaching positions, specific to the post of associate professor, as provided by own methodology. These standards should be higher or equal to the national minimal standards approved by order of the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sport.

For the position of <u>professor</u> it is required:

- a) to hold PhD diploma;
- b) to be holder of Certificate of Entitlement or have the right to conduct doctoral studies, obtained before the entry into force of the Law on National Education;
- c) to comply with national minimal standards for the occupation of teaching positions, specific to the post of professor, approved by order of the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sport;

d) to comply with minimal standards for filling teaching positions, specific to the post of professor, as provided by own methodology. These standards should be higher or equal to the national minimal standards approved by order of the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sport.

To enter the contest for a research position, it is necessary to meet conditions set forth by the Law no. 319/2003 regarding the status of research and development personnel and by the Law on National Education, namely:

- a) for indefinite period positions it is required to hold PhD diploma;
- b) to meet national minimal standards for filling research posts, specific to these positions, as provided by own methodology.

In order to enter the contest for a teaching and research positions the candidate is required to submit a dossier containing, at least, the following documents:

- a) contest application, signed by the candidate, including an own responsibility statement regarding the truthfulness of information submitted in the dossier;
- b) proposal for academic career development of the candidate both from teaching stanpoint, in case of teaching positions, and from the standpoint of scientific research activities; the proposal shall be developed by the candidate and comprise 10 pages at most; it is one of the main criteria for candidates' evaluation.
- c) hard copy and electronic version of Curriculum Vitae of the candidate;
- d) hard copy and electronic-version list of candidate's publications;
- e) check list in compliance with university standards regarding contest presentation, whose standard format is required by own methodology. The check list shall be completed and signed by the candidate;
- f) documents confirming possession of PhD diploma: certified copy of PhD diploma and, if the original PhD diploma is not recognized in Romania, the certificate of its recognition or equivalence;
- g) summary, in Romanian and in an international language, of the PhD thesis or, where applicable, of the habilitation thesis on more than one page for each language;
- h) applicant's own responsibility statement indicating incompatibility situations arising in case of winning the contest or indicating lack of such incompatibility situations;
- i) in case of contest for professor's position, a certified copy of Certificate of Entitlement is required;
- j) copies of other diplomas confirming candidate's education;

- k) copy of identity card or, if the candidate does not have an identity card, copy of the passport or other identity document issued for a purpose equivalent to that of an identity card or a passport;
- l) if the candidate has changed the name, copies of documents certifying change of name marriage certificate or proof of name change;
- m) not more than 10 publications, patents or other papers of the candidate, in electronic version, selected by him and considered to be most relevant for own professional achievements.

The higher education institution shall specify regulations that apply to candidate's publications not available in electronic version.

Candidates for the positions of associate professor or II degree scientific researcher shall submit with the contest file at least 3 names and contact addresses of personalities in the respective field, from the country or from abroad, outside the institution of higher education whose position is brough to contest, which agreed to write letters of recommendation regarding candidate's professional qualities. Candidates for the positions of professor or I degree scientific researcher shall submit with the contest file at least 3 names and contact addresses of personalities in the respective field from abroad, from higher education and research institutions included in the list approved by order of the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sport, which agreed to write letters of recommendation regarding candidate's professional qualities.

Contest application file shall be compiled by the candidate and shall be submitted to the higher education institution address specified on contest's website, directly or through postal or courier services allowing confirmation of receipt. Contest Committee members must receive the application file starting with the closing date for submission of contest applications files, but not later than 5 working days before the first contest examination. Candidate's compliance with legal requirements for contest file submission is certified by the resolution of the legal department of higher education institution based on verification of information from the check list and from other documents required for application to the contest. The resolution shall be communicated to the candidate within 48 hours after it was issued, but not later than 5 working days before the first contest examination. Candidates meeting legal requirements for contest application shall be invited by the higher education institution to contest examinations.

3.5.1.5. Staff of the institution

The list of teaching and research staff positions are drawn up annually, by establishing university workload, at least 15 days before the beginning of each academic year and these cannot be changed during the academic year. Teaching positions and the number of posts are established taking into account: curricula; study groups; university workloads.

Staff positions contain, in hierarchical order, teaching and research positions occupied or vacant, specifying the corresponding teaching and research positions and the weekly number

of conventional hours distributed among teaching activities, seminars, practical or laboratory works, project guidance, students and Ph.D. students mentoring, professional and research practice and equivalent activities according to curriculum disciplines.

Staff positions are drawn up at department or graduate school levels, after consultations with their members and specification of teaching and research tasks by the faculty board. At departments providing disciplines taught within several faculties, staff positions are completed based on ordering forms, approved by the administration of higher education institution. Staff positions of teaching and research personnel shall be approved by the faculty board or, where appropriate, by the doctoral school board and shall be approved by the university senate. The number of positions for auxiliary teaching and research personnel is established by the University Senate, depending on budget and particularity of institution, faculty, education program, department or doctoral school. General classification of auxiliary teaching and research positions in higher education as well as the level of education required for these positions is developed by the Ministry of National Education together with the Ministry of Labour, Family and Social Protection.

Conclusions through the Government – University interface

The autonomy of human resources in terms of the right of institutions to obtain freedom regarding the establishment of recruitment/employment procedures is considerably limited by the state. The state establishes minimal requirements and the institution has no right to derogate from them, only being entitled to apply more strict criteria. Limitation of university autonomy is reflected in the procedure for announcement of vacancies and contest organization.

3.5.2. Freedom of institutions to decide on the promotion of staff

This criterion of university human resources autonomy is materialized in the right of higher education institution to decide on ensuring career evolution of personnel by promotion to a higher rank, position or professional level.

3.5.2.1. Staff evaluation

Results and performance of teaching and research activity of university academic staff are evaluated periodically at periods not exceeding five years. This evaluation is made in accordance with a methodology approved and applied by the University Senate. Teaching and research staff employment contracts impose compliance with minimal standards for teaching and research results as well as provisions regarding termination of contracts in cases of non-fulfillment of these minimal standards. These standards are part of quality policies at every higher education institution. For example, at "Ştefan cel Mare" University of Suceava, quality policy implementation by the management of the institution and by the management of existing organizational structures envisages excellence, competence and responsibility. Their assessment is performed by means of a set of indicators allowing their numerical evaluation. The indicators are correlated with external requirements and represent benchmarking elements. They are covered through strategic plans adopted by the

administration every four years and by annualy developed operational plans. These indicators allow the development of internal quality control mechanisms for the implementation of quality assurance system approved by the University Senate. "Ştefan cel Mare" University employs for quality assessment the following components: areas (teaching, research, internships, international relations, activities of administrative nature), criteria, own procedures, standards and performance indicators, found in external evaluation methodologies for standards, for reference standards and for the list of performance indicators used by ARACIS. The evaluation of teachers has a complex and integrating character and involves self-evaluation, peer evaluation, evaluation by direct supervisor and student evaluation. Self-assessment/evaluation of teachers provides information on teaching performance, scientific research, national and international recognition, work with students and work within the academic community, reported at various time periods. Evaluation results are public for department members, faculty and university administrations, without imposing any access restrictions. The evaluation is applied only to teachers carrying out activities based on job description within the university at least six months out of the calendar year. Peer review assesses the fulfilment of professional ethics by every teacher as well as personal qualities displayed as a member of the department. Criteria are developed for peer evaluation, including determination of the following activities: engagement in collective life, joint actions, respondence to additional requests; participation in college and university activities; teamwork: participation in collective achievements, projects, education programs, scientific exhibitions, research; taking over responsibilities: consistency and timeliness in carrying out tasks; promotion of college/university image; professional attitude and behavior: principiality, impartiality, expression of own views not infringing the rights of others by language and attitude; communication capacity: cultivation of positive climate; respect for colleagues: support to colleagues, compliance to group rules; promotion of creativity: initiative and organization of collective performant actions; concern for the quality of teaching activities performed.

Peer review activities shall be organized over a period of up to six days. All teachers are subject to peer review process once a year at the end of the calendar year. All members of the department at which the evaluated teacher works participate in the peer review.

The final mark shall be calculated by the following formula:

$$N_{\text{final}} = 0.8 \times (0.5 \times \text{N1} + 0.2 \times \text{N2} + 0.3 \times \text{N3}) + 0.2 \times \text{N4}$$

where:

N1 – self-assessment equated mark;

N2 – mark obtained after peer review;

N3 – mark obtained after evaluation by the Head of department;

N4 – mark obtained after students' evaluation.

The mark N1 for teachers who worked more than six months but less than 9 months shall be calculated by dividing the obtained scores by the number of months worked and multiplying by 12. Based on new scores the mark shall be determined. The mark N4, also taken into consideration, is obtained after the last evaluation performed by students. The final score of the evaluation is determined based on the final mark as follows:

```
between 1,00 \div 2,00 = unsatisfactory;
between 2,01 \div 3,00 = satisfactory;
between 3,01 \div 4,00 = good;
between 4,01 \div 5,00 = very good.
```

Final scores shall be communicated personally to teachers evaluated by the department head.

3.5.2.2. Students' role of in the promotion of academic staff

In general, according to the Romanian Law on National Education no. 1 of January 5, 2011, students are guaranteed the right of free choice of courses and specializations according to the actual education plan. Students are considered partners of the institution and equal members of the academic community.

Charters of several Romanian universities stipulate the right of students to participate in the evaluation of teachers. For example, "Alexandru Ioan Cuza" University of Iaşi, students have the right to participate in the evaluation of courses, seminars, practical work and other educational and/or organizational aspects related to the education programs attended. These evaluations serve as basis for evaluating the performance of these courses, seminars, internships, education programs and teachers.

At "Ştefan cel Mare" University of Suceava, student evaluation of teachers' performance is mandatory. Evaluation results are public information.

3.5.2.3. Academic mobility of teachers and internationalization policies

According to Art. 118 of the Romanian Law on National Education no. 1 of January 5, 2011, the national higher education system is based on national and international mobility of teachers and researchers.

Academic staff holding teaching positions in the education system, being requested abroad for teaching, research, artistic or sport activity on a contract basis as provided by agreements and governmental, inter-university or inter-institutional conventions, or delegated for specialization, hold their teaching positions for the respective period. Academic staff holding teaching positions in the education system, which by own initiative request to specialize or participate in scientific research in Romania or abroad, are entitled to unpaid leave. This leave should not exceed 3 years in a 7-year period. Approvals in such situations fall under the responsibility of higher education institution administration or, where appropriate, of the administrative board, upon evidence of such activity.

For example, at "Alexandru Ioan Cuza" University of Iaşi the Regulation on international academic collaboration was developed. According to this regulation, official visits abroad of teaching or administrative personnel and students are carried out based on Rector's Resolution. The request for such trip must be accompanied by an academic invitation. Mobility financing is carried out on the basis of several financing sources. Salary payment is guaranteed depending on mobility and program it belongs to.

3.5.2.4. Rights and freedoms higher education institutions' staff

According to the university Charter, university Code of Ethics, individual employment contract and legislation in force, higher education institutions' staff have rights and duties. Protection of employees' rights as well as of intellectual property rights over scientific, cultural and artistic creation is guaranteed and ensured in accordance with the university Charter or specific legislation in force.

Members of the university community are guaranteed academic freedom. On this basis they can freely express academic opinions in the university environment and enjoy academic freedom in terms of teaching, research and creation according to the criteria of academic quality. In general, teaching and research personnel have the following rights:

- to publish studies, articles, books or artistic works;
- to apply for national and international grants, without restrictions on academic freedom;
- to be a member of professional and cultural, national and international associations and unions, as well as of legally constituted political organizations, in accordance with the law;
- to receive healthcare in medical and psychological facilities, in clinics and hospitals assigned by a protocol concluded between the Ministry of National Education and the Ministry of Health.

Teachers have the right to be on leave, such as:

- a) paid annual leave during university holidays, lasting at least 40 working days; in duly justified cases, the administration of the education institution may interrupt the leave of these persons remunerating them for the fulfilled work; methodological norms regarding legal leave shall be developed by the Ministry of National Education together with relevant trade union representatives at higher education level;
- b) the periods of annual leave for every teacher shall be established by the University Senate, depending on the interest of education and person concerned.

Professors and lecturers or grant directors that for 6 consecutive years have managed research grants and worked at the same university are entitled to sabbatical year. During the sabbatical

year, they receive almost a basic salary, by approval of the university senate, and hold their position but are exempt from carrying out the activities as set in their job description.

Academic staff holding teaching positions in education, when elected to the Parliament, appointed to the Government or perform particularly specialized functions within the structures of the Parliament, the Legislative Council, the Constitutional Court, the Ombudsman, the Presidential Administration, the Government or within the Ministry of National Education as well as appointed by the Parliament within central state bodies, have the right to keep their positions while performing these functions. Throughout their office- or appointment term teachers can combine these functions with teaching and research activity.

Teachers elected or appointed to state public institutions or performing activities specific to public office in ministries or other specialized state bodies may carry out educational activities related to a teaching workload.

3.5.2.5. Invited academic staff. Honorary titles awarding

The Romanian Law on National Education no. 1 of January 5, 2011 establishes state distinctions awarded to teachers. According to this legal act, the following orders and medals can be conferred to the academic staff of higher education: Alma Mater Order with the ranks of Commander, Knight and Officer. Also, they can be awarded the Teaching Corps Honorary Member Medal; the medal is given to retired teaching staff for outstanding activity in education and professional training.

In accordance with their own rules, institutions are free to award their own honorary titles. For example, at "Ștefan cel Mare" University of Suceava the following titles are awarded: Professor Emeritus, Doctor Honoris causa and Honorary Senator. In terms of this subcriterion institutions enjoy wide autonomy and have the right to award these titles if conditions established by internal regulations of the institutions are met.

Conclusions through the Government – University interface

The Romanian Law on National Education no. 1 of January 5, 2011 establishes minimal conditions required for the evaluation of academic staff, and, in terms of organization's freedom to establish own criteria and procedures for staff evaluation, institutions should develop their own regulations that are part of quality management system. Regulations developed at government level do not provide performance indicators, these being developed by the institution and the state closely monitoring evaluation procedures through the Romanian Agency for Higher Education Accreditation and Certification.

3.5.3. Freedom to decide on the workload

Freedom to decide on the workload lies in the higher education institution's right to decide on the distribution of working time, working norms, most accurate determination of working tasks for a member of the academic community.

3.5.3.1. Structure of teaching /academic workload

According to the Romanian Law on National Education no. 1 of January 5, 2011 a university workload includes: the teaching workload and the research workload. The teaching workload may comprise a number of activities including:

- a) teaching activity;
- b) seminar activities, practical and laboratory work, project papers guidance;
- c) Bachelor's thesis elaboration guidance;
- d) Master's thesis elaboration guidance;
- e) PhD thesis elaboration guidance;
- f) other teaching, practical and scientific research activity included in the curricula;
- g) management of teaching and artistic/sport activities;
- h) assessment activities;
- i) tutoring, counseling, mentoring of student scientific group, of students within credit transfer system;
- j) participation in education-relevant councils and commissions.

The weekly teaching workload in higher education is quantified into conventional hours. The teaching workload is determined according to the educational plan and calculated as the weekly average workload, regardless of the academic semester period it is carried out. The weekly average workload is determined dividing the number of conventional hours from the individual job description by the number of weeks established by the curriculum for teaching and seminar activities for the whole academic year. A conventional hour is the teaching hour of Bachelor's level university education activities that were listed above. At Bachelor's level university education a teaching activity hour makes two conventional hours. At Master's and PhD university education a teaching activity hour makes 2.5 conventional hours and the hour which includes other activities listed above makes 1.5 conventional hours. When teaching in foreign languages at Bachelor, Master and Doctoral cycles, teaching, seminars or other activities can be standardized by an additional multiplicative coefficient - 1.25. The above languages teaching hours are an exception to this provision. The rest of activities listed above, included in the teaching workload, are quantified into conventional hours according to a methodology approved by the University Senate depending on the education program, profile and specialization, so that to a physical hour of activity correspond at least 0.5 conventional hours.

The minimal weekly teaching workload for activities listed shall be established as follows:

a) professor: 7 conventional hours, of which at least 4 conventional hours of teaching activities;

- b) associate professor: 8 conventional hours, of which at least 4 conventional hours of teaching activities;
- c) university lecturer /activity leader: 10 conventional hours, of which at least two conventional hours of teaching activities;
- d) assistant professor: 11 conventional hours, comprising the following activities: seminars, practical work and laboratory, project papers guidance, Bachelor thesis elaboration guidance and other practical teaching activities.

A teaching workload cannot exceed 16 conventional hours per week. Teaching workloads set for every teaching position represent the minimal level of teaching activity workload. Based on university autonomy, the Senate can increase by regulation the minimal weekly teaching workload in accordance with quality assurance standards, without exceeding the maximal limit of 16 conventional hours. Within the limits of the existing legislation, the Senate differentiates the effective academic workload depending on the specialization area, percentage of disciplines for a specialization and size of educational structures.

The total amount of working hours for teaching or research workload, obtained by aggregating the corresponding shares of listed activities, is 40 hours per week. Teaching activities exceeding a teaching workload are paid according to an hourly payment regime. For positions holders the maximal number of hours paid according to an hourly payment regime, regardless of the paying institution, cannot exceed the minimal teaching workload.

3.5.3.2. Working time. Obligations of higher education institutions' staff

The normal working time period averages 8 hours/day, 40 hours/week, carried out through 5-days working week. Activities assigned for teachers in higher education are established in the job description prepared by the employer together with the relevant unions or, where applicable, with employees' representatives. The teaching workload in higher education includes activities provided by Art. 287 of the Law on National Education, no. 1/2011, with subsequent amendments. Weekly teaching workload is quantified in conventional hours and reaches 16 conventional hours weekly, averaged over the two semesters. Research workload includes specific activities set out in the job description by the employer.

Obligations of the teaching, research and auxiliary teaching staff are regulated by the Law on National Education no. 1/2011, republished, with subsequent amendments. Every higher education institution specifies these obligations in the University Charter, acting autonomously in terms of establishing certain obligations that correspond to existing regulations and do not limit guarantees and individual freedoms of employees. For example, the University Charter of "Ştefan cel Mare" University of Suceava provides that all categories of staff employed under a working contract at the institution have, according to the Labor Code and the Law on National Education, the following obligations:

to observe the work program;

- to precisely and timely fulfill their duties according to the job description and to hierarchically passed job instructions;
- to observe labour discipline, to maintain order and cleanliness at the workplace;
- to protect the integrity of university's property;
- to promote collegial relationships and correct behaviour within labour relations;
- to use machinery, equipment, facilities and other property entrusted under normal parameters and overall safety conditions;
- to announce the superviser as soon as there is a direct cause of disruption of the normal course of activity and when unable to perform the duties;
- to strictly observe the rules regarding labour protection, use of work- and protection equipment, prevention of fire or of any situation that might endanger university buildings and facilities or life, bodily integrity or health of a person;
- to observe the rules of internal regulations as well as provisions of the individual work contract and of the applicable collective labour contract;
- to be loyal to the university when carrying out duties and in all other cases;
- to respect the confidentiality of data and information classified thereby by law or internal rules of the university;
- to be subject to disciplinary and patrimonial liability for misconduct or damages to the university by own fault and in connection with own work;
- to wear at work protective equipment provided free of charge by the university in accordance with legal procedures.

3.5.4. Freedom /capacity of institutions to decide on the salary system

The basic salary is regulated in accordance with the Framework Law no. 284/2010 regarding the uniform remuneration of personnel paid from public funds and with other regulations in this field.

3.5.4.1. Salary structure. Incentive payments

In Romania, remuneration of teaching and auxiliary staff is carried out according to the Law no. 63 of May 10, 2011on employment and wages of teaching and auxiliary staff involved in education. Thus, the mentioned act stipulates a maximal salary for a professor with an experience of over 40 years in education between 3733 RON and 6971 RON. In contrast, a junior lecturer with up to three years experience shall earn between 1123 RON and 1575 RON.

For auxiliary personnel, the salary ranges between the average salary per economy and amounts 2000 RON, thus a general director for administration, considered to be auxiliary

personnel, shall have the highest remuneration being entitled to amounts between 2790 RON and 1415 RON. To this salary various bonuses are added, making up the basic salary. According to the law, the basic salary of the teaching staff consists of:

- position's employment salary which includes a stability bonus only for periods of experience in education for over 10 years as well as the bonus for neuropsychological overload existing within all periods of experience in education;
- management allowance;
- merit ranking;
- stability bonus.

In addition to the basic salary, salary bonuses are paid related to special working conditions and seniority. Working experience seniority in education consists of effective seniority and recognized seniority, as appropriate. *Effective seniority* in education is the period during which a person employed by individual labour contract carried out effective teaching activity at a department within an education entity or institution. *Recognized seniority* in education is the period during which the person engaged in education, when coming from other areas of activity, proves teaching practice in the specialty field stated in the diploma, in the case when this person holds a teaching position of the same specialty. This seniority is considered only when determining salary rights.

In addition to salary rights determined as required by law there can be established differentiated salaries from own revenues of higher education institutions and undergraduate education institutions, these amounts representing an increase of up to 30% of employment salaries provided by law and not forming the calculation basis for establishment of other salary rights.

Teachers in higher education benefit from merit ranking awarded through open competition. This ranking is awarded for 16% of teaching positions existing in the institution and makes 25% of the basic salary. Merit ranking is awarded for a 5-year period.

3.5.4.2. Bodies authorized to set salaries

Responsibility for establishing the remuneration system and methodology rests solely with the higher education institution. The Senate of the institution is responsible for management, use and disposition of funds for labour remuneration of employees from the institution. The institution prepares an annual budget of revenues and expenditures, in which labour remuneration expenses are planned. Relevant competent bodies verify the correctness and legality of the use of funds assigned for labour remuneration.

However, this freedom - component of human resources autonomy, is limited by the state through the Framework Law no. 284/2010 regarding the uniform remuneration of personnel paid from public funds, which aims to establish a uniform remuneration system for public sector personnel paid from the general consolidated state budget.

Another provision of the Romanian Labour Code, also defining the intersection point of **GOVERNMENT-UNIVERSITY** interface, stipulates that any institution, including higher education institutions, must guarantee in a priority manner payment of salaries before any other liabilities of the institution.

3.5.5. Freedom to decide on employment contracts termination method

Termination of employment contracts of personnel employed by Romanian higher education institutions is carried out in strict accordance with the legal framework governing labour relations.

3.5.5.1. Grounds for termination of employment contracts specific to higher education

Dismissal from management position in education: it is applied to the employee who committed serious and repeated violations, for which he/she was punished before, and which caused material injury or seriously affected the image of the university. Being the penultimate disciplinary sanction before termination of the employment contract on disciplinary grounds, the application of this sanction is done considering that attitude correction of the sanctioned person is still possible.

Termination of employment contract on disciplinary grounds is the maximal penalty that can be applied both for purposely committing a particularly serious misconduct and repeated violation of employee's obligations, likely to seriously disrupt the order and work of the university. When ascertaining serious misconduct or repeated violations of labour discipline rules, the university dismisses the employee under Article 61, paragraph 1, letter (a)of the Labour Code.

3.5.5.2. Termination of employment contracts with management staff

The University Charter of "Ștefan cel Mare" University of Suceava provides certain dismissal cases for managerial personnel.

According to these provisions the Rector may be dismissed by the University Senate given at least one of the following conditions:

- a) does not accomplish performance indicators under the management contract and does not comply with other obligations specified in this contract;
- b) violates the legislation and university ethics standards;
- c) harms the interests and prestige of "Ştefan cel Mare" University of Suceava;
- d) is subject to one of incompatibility situations provided by law for the office of rector.

The Rector may be recalled from office by the relevant Minister, under the law, after consulting the University Senate.

Such situations occur when the Rector acts failing to observe the principle of public accountability. Recalling procedure is described in detail in the Law on National Education.

The Dean can be dismissed by the Rector, after consultating the Faculty Council, when detected at least one of the following violations committed by the former:

- a) violation of the university Code of professional ethics with regard to the conflict of interest;
- b) is subject to one of the incompatibility situations stipulated by legal acts in force and by the university Code of professional ethics;
- c) non-accomplishment of managerial performance indicators established by the appointment decision;
- d) violation of laws and university ethics standards;
- e) harms the interests and prestige of the university.

Director of Department may be recalled from office by the Rector, with Senate approval, if one of the following situations occurs:

- a) violation of the university Code of professional ethics with regard to the conflict of interest;
- b) is subject to one of the incompatibility situations stipulated by legal acts in force and by the university Code of professional ethics;
- c) violation of position-related duties with respect to performance standards within teaching and research activity of the department;
- d) harms the interests and prestige of "Ştefan cel Mare" University of Suceava;
- e) at the request of simple majority of personnel occupying teaching and research positions within the department.

Conclusions through the Government – University interface

Termination of employment relations with academic staff of higher education institutions takes place by law or at the initiative of the parties. The procedures are established by general labour law except cases of dismissal of staff occupying administrative positions. In situations not covered by the Law on National Education, institutions establish their own rules and conditions, and failure to comply with or their negligent carrying out leads to dismissal of the manager. University autonomy means public responsibility for the managerial act.

3.6. Conclusions

The results of investigations mentioned above underlie the comparative study with reference to the autonomy of human resources in the universities from EU member countries, partners in this project, presented in the next paragraph.

4. Comparative study: Benchmarking

A comparative analysis of the level as well as occurrence and regulation degree of human resources autonomy in universities from Lithuania, Scotland, Sweden, Denmark and Romania was conducted based on criteria and sub-criteria identified and described in paragraph 3.

The table below gives an overview on the similarities and differences among the investigated systems with regard to the mentioned subject.

Lithuania	Scotland	Sweden	Denmark	Romania
Freedom /ability to	decide on recruitme	ent and employment	procedures	
The higher	The institution is	All institutions are	Universities Act	The autonomy of
education	completely	free /autonomous	and Ministry	human resources
institution has the	autonomous in	as regards the	Ordinance	in relation to the
right to develop its	deciding on these	right to set their	regarding	right of the
own procedures,	procedures. The	own recruitment	academic staff	institution to
to set its own	exercise of this	procedures, taking	employment	achieve freedom
criteria of	freedom should	into account the	establish the	establishing
employment to the	not contradict the	objectives of each	structure of	procedures for
extent that they do	principle of non-	institution.	academic	recruitment
not contravene the	discrimination and		positions,	/employment is
rules of labour	equal		recruitment	very limited by the
law.	opportunities.		procedures, and	state. The state
			universities are	establishes
			entitled to develop	minimum
			these provisions	requirements and
			through the	the institution has
			adoption of	no right to
			internal	derogate from
			regulations, which	them being
			describe the	entitled to apply
			details of these	more stringent
			procedures. We	criteria. A
			find some mixed	limitation of
			regulatory	university
			procedures both at	autonomy is
			central and	reflected in the
			institutional	procedure of
			levels.	declaring
				vacancies and
				conducting the
				contest.

Freedom of institutions to decide on the promotion of staff						
Law on Higher Education and Research establishes minimum conditions necessary for evaluating academic staff and the institution is autonomous to set its own criteria and procedures for staff evaluation.	State interference in this area is very small, each higher education institution is entitled to establish its own assessment procedures, higher education institutions pledging to ensure that the principle of equal opportunities is observed and will not allow any discrimination on grounds of racial, national, ethnic origins, gender or disability, age, religion, sexual orientation or marital status.	Higher Education Act establishes the general framework for staff promotion, but each institution is autonomous in determining the criteria and conditions for holding a certain position, as well as the procedure to be followed.	Danish Universities Act establishes minimum conditions necessary for evaluating academic staff and for achieving the freedom of institution to set its own criteria and procedures for staff evaluation, universities establish their own regulations. State interference in this area is minimal, given that performance indicators underlying the institutions' accreditation involves a serious and rigorous	Regulations that are developed at the government level do not contain performance indicators, these being elaborated by the institution, but the state monitors the maximum achievement of assessment procedures through the Romanian Agency for Higher Education Accreditation and Certification.		
Freedom of the ins	titutions to decide or	the workload	evaluation of staff.			
The higher education institution decides on the distribution of working time, work norms, accurate determination of the work assigned that a member of the academic community must achieve.	Higher education institutions are autonomous in terms of absolute freedom to decide on labor norming, each position is clearly described in the job description; for the fulfilment of work tasks 35 hours per week are allocated, institutions establishing their work program	The teaching workload includes teaching and research activities, their weight varies from one to another teaching position and the actual distribution of activities is carried out at the department level.	Danish universities are autonomous in terms of their freedom to decide on labour norming, research activities being part of the academic staff work activities. Institutions are quite autonomous at local level, departments are responsible not only for the	The teaching workload includes teaching and research activities. Quantification is done at the department level. Share of activities are regulated externally being unified over the country.		

specific activity of each employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the salary system The higher education institution is autonomous to decide on the pay system, bonuses; establishing stepstablishing state complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the external authority terms of setting a autonomous in maximum or minimum wage, tonfirming the stablishing system. The various salary increases depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the principle of "equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination of employment the primation of employment contracts with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination of employment contracts with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination of employment contract termination of employment contract termination of the workload, the promote of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination of employment contract termination of employment contract termination of the		1 1 1 1		11 (11 (1 1	
Freedom of the institutions to decide on the salary system The higher education autonomous in autonomous to decide on the pay system, bonuses, establishing various salary higher education institution is free depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the pay system, bonuses, establishing various salary higher education institution is free depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the principle of "equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the principle of "equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the principle of "equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under higher education institutions have well-developed on the principle of "equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under higher education institutions have well-developed on the principle of "equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under higher education institutions have well-developed in strict accordance with the strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions have deducation institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions have well-developed in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions are regulated under the pracedual of the granting of the termination of employment relationships and the granting of the workload, regulated under the granting of guarantees and compensation to the dismissal of the dismissal of the provided by the granting of guarantees and compensation to dismissal to dismissal to dismissal to dismissal the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to dismissal conditions and the prov		depending on the		distribution and	
Freedom of the institutions to decide on the salary system The higher education institution is entirely internal institutions are institution is confirming the various salary system. The higher education institution is free depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Freedom of the institution is free depending on the complexity and volume of work conditions of the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with staff of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract with the precepts of the Labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract with the precepts of the Labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract with the precepts of the Labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination of account the Equal lops of the same kind", organized under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination of account the employment relationships and the grounds for Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination of employment relationships and the grounds for Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment relationships and the grounds for case of reduction of the workload, but shall comply acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to the dismissal of stitutions are altered to decide on the employment and condition fination of the consultancy. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment and conditions are to decide on the employment and conditions are to decide on the employment and the procedura					
The higher education institution is autonomous to depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the payroll system and volume of work performed by an employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the payroll confirming the various salary increases depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the payroll confirming the various salary system. The various salary system and rewarding of staff. Internal payroll employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination of employment relationships and the grantiation of the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method the propositions of the economic profit and condition of the decided on the employment contract termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employm		each employee.		•	
The higher education entirely internal, institution is autonomous to decide on the pay system, bonuses, establishing various salary increases depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the same kind', organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions have contracts with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of Lithuanian higher education institutions are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuanian late and complex of the labour law. Freedom of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment regarding the greating of guarantees and compensation to the decide on the entrilation of guarantees and compensation to the decide on the workload, but shall comply acknown regarding the granting of guarantees and compression to bactons autonomous in institutions are autonomous in institutions are autonomous in institutions are maximum or maximum or maximum or maximum or maximum or maximum or matalon stratition is free to deside on the salary system in shased on the principle of "equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under the same kind', organized under the general rules of the same kind' the precepts of the same kind' the precepts of the same kind' the precepts of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment or the employment or the employment or the entril the proceduration of the exponencial pay the provided by the termination of the workload, but shall comply acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to the contract termination is the transmittent or t				for the workloads.	
education is institution is institutions are institution is its autonomous in decide on the pay system, bonuses, establishing various salary increases institution is free depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the principle of employment contracts with staff of Lithuanian institutions is done institution is free to decide on the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Entirely internal, institutions are institutions are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Institution is free to decide on the employment cantract with the preception of employment institutions are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Entirely internal, institutions are institutions are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Entirely internal, institutions are institutions are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Entirely internal, institutions are institution is free to decide on the employment cantract termination of employment institutions have well-developed in case of reduction of termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Entirely internal autonomous in part of the public actorn, and their inmaximum or remuneration is State that throu the salary system and collective agreements. Entirely internal autonomous in part of the public actorn, and their inmaximum or remuneration is state that throu the salary system and collective agreements. Entirely internal autonomous in part of the public actorn, the salary system and collective agreements. Entirely intiruted by to collective agreements. Exavon the units accorn, and their inmined by the salary system and collective agreements. Exavon the units accorn, and their inmined by the Ental based on the templation staff paid from public account the Equal agreements. Exavon the unitations are proportion institutions are proportion institutions are policies upon the real and part of the proportion institutions are regulated under	Freedom of the ins	titutions to decide or	n the salary system		
institution is autonomous in external authority decide on the pay system, bonuses, establishing various salary increases depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the principle of megual pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom Code of Lithuanian are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom Code of Lithuanian are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom Code of Lithuanian are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom Code of Lithuanian are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom Code of Lithuanian are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom Code of Lithuanian are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom Code Code of Lithuanian are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom Code Code Code Code Code Code Code Code	The higher	Payroll system is	Higher education	Danish	This criterion of
autonomous to decide on the pay system, bonuses, establishing stablishing higher education institution is free depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination of employment contracts with the precepts of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment c	education	entirely internal.	institutions are	universities are	human resources
decide on the pay system, bonuses, establishing station increases depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the moldiscrimination institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. The minimum wage, minimum wage, but must establish the salary system and compensation to but must establish the salary system are taking into account the Equal Opportunities Act. Op	institution is	There is no	autonomous in	part of the public	autonomy is
system, bonuses, establishing various salary system. The higher education increases depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Treedom of the institutions is done contracts with staff of Lithuania. The procepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. The parameter of the labour law. The parameter of the labour law. The higher education institutions is done in the principle of the general rules of the labour law. The public funds, remuneration staff paid from the same kind", organized under HERA system. The public funds, remuneration staff paid from the same kind", organized under HERA system. The public funds, remuneration staff paid from the same kind", organized under the sale on the employment contract termination method the ability to organized under the economic reasons underlying commercial, but income from their activities may be positions. Besid the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to dismissal of sale paid from the saler public sector of the same kind", organized under the mitaking into account the Equal Opportunities Act.	autonomous to	external authority	terms of setting a	sector, and their	limited by the
stablishing various salary increases depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Section Sec	decide on the pay	confirming the	maximum or	remuneration is	State that through
various salary increases depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Internal payroll system is based on the principle of "equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Figure 1	system, bonuses,	remuneration	minimum wage,	made based on	the Framework
increases depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Internal payroll employee. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Internal payroll employee. Well-developed in stitutions are free to decide on the economic institutions is done in strict accordance with the general rules of the labour law. Internal payroll employment contract termination method Swedish higher education institutions are free to decide on the economic profit and reasons underlying the termination of employment relationships and Labour Code of Lithuania. Internal payroll employment contract termination method Swedish higher education institutions are free to decide on the economic profit and reasons underlying the termination of employment relationships in case of reduction of the workload, but shall comply with all regulatory acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to to dismissal or staff paid from public funds, ro 284/2010, whi aims to establish unitary pay system is based on the propublic funds, ro 284/2010, whi aims to establish unitary pay system is based on the employment contract termination method Universities have the ability to create legal entities, both nonly the economic profit and entities, both nonly to research and or consultancy. Internal payroll opportunities Act. Swedish higher education institutions are free to decide on the employment reasons underlying to employ the economic profit and entities, both nonly to research and or consultancy. Internal payroll opportunities Act. Internal payroll opportunities Act. Swedish higher education institutions are free to decide on the employment reasons underlying to make the economic profit and entities, both nonly to research and or consultancy.	establishing	system. The	but must establish	collective	Law on the unitary
depending on the complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Internal payroll system is based on the principle of "equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the grounds for Lithuania. Labour Code of Lithuania. Labour Code of Lithuania. Termination of the grounds for Lithuania. Labour Code of Lithuania. Termination of the grounds for Lithuania. Labour Code of Lithuania. Termination of the grounds for the general rules of the labour law. Termination of the institutions to decide on the employment reasons underlying the general rules of the labour law. Termination of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Universities have the ability to are create legal segmental labour commercial, but income from their activities may be positions. Beside the cases of reduction termination of termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Termination of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Universities have the ability to are create legal singulation of entities, both nonling activities may be positions. Beside the cases of reduction termination of termination are regulated under the general rules of the workload, but shall comply with all regulatory acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to dismissal	various salary	higher education	the salary system	agreements.	remuneration of
complexity and volume of work performed by an employee. Internal payroll system is based on the principle of "equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Termination of employment institutions have contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Termination of employment relationships and Labour Code of the grounds for Lithuania. Termination of employment relationships and Labour Code of the grounds for termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Treedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Swedish higher the ability to create legal entities, both nonlinstitutions are conson underlying cases of reduction institutions in case of reduction case of reduction of the termination of termination of termination of termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. The proceduration institutions are resulted under the processor of the labour law. The proceduration institutions are resulted under the termination of termination of termination of termination of termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. The proceduration institutions are resulted under the termination of termination of case of reduction of the workload, but shall comply with all regulatory and consultancy. The proceduration institutions are research and condition of the workload, but shall comply with all regulatory and consultancy. The proceduration of the ability to create legal entities, both nonly the ability and commercial, but dismissal of stations in the economic reasons underlying activities may be used only for termination are regulated under the granting of guarantees and consultancy. The proceduration institutions are research and consultancy. The proceduration institutions are for the expension of the termination	increases	institution is free	taking into		staff paid from
volume of work performed by an employee. Internal payroll system is based on the principle of "equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Termination of employment contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done in strict termination of institutions is done in the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Termination of employment contract termination method Termination of employment contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions have education institutions are reasons underlying commercial, but the precepts of the labour law. The procedure the ability to are those create legal entities, both non-profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for termination of the workload, but shall comply with all regulatory of the labour law. The procedure the ability to are those create legal entities, both non-profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for termination are regulated under the general rules of the workload, but shall comply with all regulatory acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to dismissal	depending on the	to set its own	account the Equal		public funds, no.
volume of work performed by an employee. Tremination of employment contracts with staff of Lithuanian lighter education institutions is done in the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Termination of lacordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Tremination of Lithuanian labour Code of Lithuania. Tremination of lacordance with the general rules of the labour law. Tredom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Termination of employment contract termination method Termination of employment contract termination method Termination of education institutions have education institutions have education institutions are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. The procedure the employment contract termination method The procedure the education institutions are free to decide on the economic profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be employment activities may be positions. Beside the workload, but shall comply with all regulatory acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to dismissal or staff or public sect personnel profit method budget. The procedure the employment contract termination method The procedure the education institutions are free to decide on the termination of the termination of employment activities may be positions. Beside the provided by the case of reduction of the workload, but shall comply with all regulatory and consultancy. The procedure the ability to are those create legal entities, both non-profit and entities, both non-profit and continuence commercial, but the activities may be positions. Beside the provided by the provided		salary system and	_		-
performed by an employee. Internal payroll system is based on the principle of "equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Termination of education institutions have education the economic of the ability to are those entities, both nonly profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be employment relationships in relationships in relationships in relationships in termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Internal payroll for byte decide on the employment contract termination method The procedure the ability to are those education the ability to are those conomic consultancy are those entities, both nonly profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for the cases of reduction research and consultancy. Law on Nation Education, the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to to dismissal	volume of work	rewarding of staff.	**		aims to establish a
mployee. system is based on the principle of "equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Termination of employment institutions have contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Endown of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Swedish higher Universities have education institutions are create legal general labor contracts with economic profit and being cases in the termination of the termination of the termination of accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Endown of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Tread on the institutions are deducation institutions are reasons underlying the termination of the termination of termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Endom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method The procedure the ability to are those education institutions are create legal general labor commercial, but dismissal of state to decide on the employment accordance with the termination of employment accordance with the procepts of the grounds for termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Endom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Tread on the developed institutions are create legal general labor commercial, but dismissal of state to decide on entities, both nonlaw, an exception the economic profit and being cases of reaction and being cases of reduction research and provided by the cases of reduction acts approved at the national level and condition failure of which bad failure of which bad achievement legal to the provided by	performed by an	Internal payroll			unitary pay system
"equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Termination of employment institutions have contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Tequal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under the mations of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Termination of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method The procedure the ability to create legal entities, both nonliance the economic the economic commercial, but income from their activities may be relationships in case of reduction of the workload, but shall comply with all regulatory acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to the dismissal of states and the same kind", organized under the mational level regarding the garantees and compensation to the dismissal of states and the ability to are those general labor create legal entities, both nonliative are those ducation entities, both nonliator the economic the economic reasons underlying commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. Law on Nation Education, the institutions of the institution are those ducation are those ducation the ability to are those ducation entities, both nonliator entities, both nonliato	employee.	system is based on			for public sector
"equal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Termination of employment institutions have contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Tequal pay for work conditions of the same kind", organized under the mations of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Termination of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method The procedure the ability to create legal entities, both nonliance the economic the economic commercial, but income from their activities may be relationships in case of reduction of the workload, but shall comply with all regulatory acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to the dismissal of states and the same kind", organized under the mational level regarding the garantees and compensation to the dismissal of states and the ability to are those general labor create legal entities, both nonliative are those ducation entities, both nonliator the economic the economic reasons underlying commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. Law on Nation Education, the institutions of the institution are those ducation are those ducation the ability to are those ducation entities, both nonliator entities, both nonliato		the principle of			personnel paid
the same kind", organized under HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Termination of employment institutions have contracts with well-developed institutions are free to decide on institutions is done in strict termination of accordance with employment the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. The procedure the employment contract termination method The procedure the employment contract termination method The procedure the education institutions are free to decide on the economic reasons underlying in the termination of employment employment employment relationships and Labour Code of Lithuania. The procedure the ability to are those create legal general labor create legal commercial, but dismissal of statincome from their activities may be positions. Beside the workload, but shall comply with all regulatory acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to the ability to are those create legal general labor create legal senting are those create legal general labor create legal senting are those create legal general labor create legal senting are those create legal senting are					from the general
Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Termination of employment institutions have contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done institutions is done in stirct accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Termination of employment institutions have contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Termination of education institutions are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. The procedure the education institutions are create legal entities, both nonprofit and commercial, but income from their activities may be employment activities may be relationships in used only for the cases of reduction research and provided by the consultancy. Law on Nation Education, their own rule and condition failure of which bad fair achievement legal general laboration are those create legal entities, both nonplant entities, both non-being cases dismissal of stations are termination of the termination of income from their activities may be mployment of the workload, consultancy. Law on Nation Education, their own rule and condition failure of which bad fair achievement legal achievement legal entities, both non-being create legal entities, both non-being and discrimination of the termination of income from their activities may be mployment of the workload, consultancy. Law on Nation Education, their own rule and condition failure of which bad fair achievement legal achievement legal entities, both non-being are those create legal entities, both non-blaw, and exception of the achievement legal achievement legal entities, bath non-blaw, are those create legal entities, both non-blaw, are those or entities, both non-blaw, ar		work conditions of			consolidated state
Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Termination of employment institutions have education contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. HERA system. Swedish higher Universities have the ability to create legal entities, both non-law, an exception the economic profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. HERA system. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method The procedur are those general labor create legal entities, both non-law, an exception institutions are reasons underlying commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. The procedur are those general labor commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. The procedur are those general labor commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for termination are research and consultancy. Law on Nation Education, the institutions of the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to dismissal		the same kind",			budget.
Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination method Termination of Higher education institutions have education to contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education discrimination institutions is done institutions is done institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment contract termination the education the ability to create legal entities, both nonlaw, an exception the economic profit and commercial, but dismissal of state income from their activities may be used only for termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions to decide on the employment create legal entities, both nonlaw, an exception the economic profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the institutions have education institutions are treations higher the ability to create legal entities, both nonlaw, an exception the economic profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for termination are regulated under the grounds for termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Freedom of the ability to create legal entities, both nonlaw, an exception entities, both nonlaw, and exception entities, both nonlaw, an exception entities, both nonlaw, and exception entities, both nonlaw, and exception entities, both nonlaw, an exception entities, both nonlaw, an exception entities, both nonlaw		organized under			
Termination of employment institutions have contracts with well-developed staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Labour Code of Lithuania. Lithuania. Lithuania. Lithuania. Lithuania. Swedish higher education institutions have contracts with well-developed institutions are free to decide on the economic profit and being cases of the termination of employment relationships and the termination of the termination of employment relationships in case of reduction the granting of guarantees and compensation to Lithuania Lit		HERA system.			
employment contracts with well-developed staff of Lithuanian non-higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Lithuania. Institutions have well-developed institutions are free to decide on the economic reasons underlying the termination of employment relationships and termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Institutions have well-developed institutions are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Institutions have well-developed institutions are readed to decide on the economic profit and commercial, but dismissal of state of the termination of income from their activities may be used only for the cases provided by the case of reduction of the workload, consultancy. Institutions have deducation institutions are reasons underlying commercial, but dismissal of state of the termination of employment activities may be used only for research and consultancy. Institutions are those create legal general labour law, an exception of the economic inscitution of entities, both nonlaw, activities may be used only for the cases provided by the consultancy. Institutions are relationships in case of reduction of the workload, but shall comply with all regulatory acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to to dismissal	Freedom of the ins	titutions to decide or	n the employment co	ntract termination r	nethod
contracts with staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In the precepts of the labour law. In the precepts of the general rules of the labour law. In the precepts of the general rules of the labour law. In the precepts of the general rules of the labour law. In the precepts of the general rules of the labour law. In the precepts of the general rules of the labour law. In the precepts of the general rules of the general rules of the labour law. In the precepts of the general rules of the general rules of the labour law. In the precepts of the general rules of the general rules of the labour law. In the economic profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. In the economic commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. In the economic profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. In the economic profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. In the economic profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. In the economic profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. In the economic profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. In the economic profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. In the economic profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. In the economic profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. In the economic profit and commercial, but income from their activities may be used only for the economic	Termination of	Higher education	Swedish higher	Universities have	The procedures
staff of Lithuanian higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In a strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In a strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In a strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In a strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In a strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In a strict termination of the termination of employment relationships in relationships in termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. In a strict termination of the termination of employment relationships in termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. In a strict termination of the termination of employment activities may be used only for research and consultancy. In a strict termination of the termination of the workload, the cases of reduction to the termination of employment activities may be used only for the cases provided by the consultancy. In a strict termination of the termination of the termination of the termination of employment activities may be used only for the cases provided by the consultancy. In a strict termination of the termination	employment	institutions have	education	the ability to	are those of
higher education institutions is done institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Lithuania. higher education institutions is done in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Lithuania. higher education policies upon the reasons underlying the termination of employment relationships in case of reduction of the workload, but shall comply with all regulatory acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to the economic reasons underlying the termination of the termination of employment activities may be used only for the cases provided by the cases provided by the case of the labour law. Law on Nation the reasons underlying the termination of employment activities may be used only for research and consultancy. Law on Nation the reasons underlying the termination of employment activities may be used only for research and consultancy. Law on Nation the income from their with manager activities may be used only for research and consultancy. Law on Nation the income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. Law on Nation the income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. Law on Nation the income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. Law on Nation the income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. Law on Nation the income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. Law on Nation the income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. Law on Nation the income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy. Law on Nation the income from their activities may be used only for research and consultancy.	contracts with	well-developed	institutions are	create legal	general labour
institutions is done in strict termination of the termination of accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Lithuania. Institutions is done in strict termination of the termination of the termination of employment relationships and the grounds for termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Institutions is done termination of the termination of employment relationships in the grounds for termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. Institutions is done termination of the termination of employment activities may be used only for the cases provided by the cases of reduction to the workload, consultancy. Institutions is done termination of employment activities may be used only for the cases provided by the cases of reduction to the workload, consultancy. Institutions is done termination of employment activities may be used only for the cases provided by the cases of reduction the cases of reduction activities may be used only for the cases provided by the cases of reduction activities may be used only for the cases provided by the cases of reduction activities may be used only for the cases provided by the case of reduction activities may be used only for the cases provided by the case of reduction activities may be used only for the cases provided by the case of reduction activities may be used only for the cases of reduction activities may be used only for the cases provided by the case of reduction activities may be used only for the cases of reduction activities may be used only for the cases of reduction activities may be used only for the cases of reduction activities may be used only for the cases of reduction activities may be used only for the cases of reduction activities may be used only for the cases of reduction activities may be used only for the cases of reduction activities may be used only for the cases of reduction activities may be used only for the cases of reduction activities may be used only for the cases of reduction	staff of Lithuanian	non-	free to decide on	entities, both non-	law, an exception
in strict accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. In the precepts of the Labour Code of Labour Code of Lithuania. In the precepts of the Labour Code of Labour Code of Lithuania. In the precepts of the Labour Code of Labour Code of Labour Code of Labour Code of Lithuania. In the precepts of the Labour Code of Case of reduction Ca	higher education	discrimination	the economic	profit and	being cases of
accordance with the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. Lithuania. employment relationships and the grounds for termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to	institutions is done	policies upon the	reasons underlying	commercial, but	dismissal of staff
the precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. The precepts of the Labour Code of Lithuania. The precepts of the Labour Code of Labour Code of Lithuania. The precepts of the Labour Code of Labour Code of Lithuania. The precepts of the Labour Code of the grounds for termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. The precepts of the Labour Code of the grounds for termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. The precepts of the grounds for the grounds for the workload, consultancy. The precepts of the grounds for termination are relationships in case of reduction research and consultancy. The precepts of the grounds for termination are relationships in case of reduction research consultancy. The precepts of the grounds for termination are relationships in case of reduction research consultancy. The precepts of the grounds for termination are relationships in case of reduction research consultancy. The precepts of the grounds for termination are relationships in used only for the cases provided by the consultancy. The precepts of the grounds for termination are regarded but shall comply with all regulatory acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and guarantees and complete the cases of reduction research and provided by the case of reduction research and consultance. The provided by the case of reduction research and consultance and case of reduction research and consultance and case of reduction research and case of reduction research and case of reduction researc	in strict	termination of	the termination of	income from their	with managerial
Labour Code of Lithuania. termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. the general rules of the labour law. the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. termination are regulated under the general rules of the workload, consultancy. Law on Nation Education, the institutions of the national level and condition failure of which bad failure of which to dismissal	accordance with	employment	employment	activities may be	positions. Besides
Lithuania. termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. of the labour law. termination are regulated under the general rules of the labour law. of the labour law. of the workload, but shall comply with all regulatory acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to taw on Nation Education, the institutions of their own rule and condition failure of which bad failure of which to dismissal	the precepts of the	relationships and	relationships in	used only for	the cases as
regulated under the general rules of the labour law. of the labour law. but shall comply with all regulatory of the labour law. acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to but shall comply institutions is institutions of their own rule and condition failure of which achievement lettor dismissal	Labour Code of	the grounds for	case of reduction	research and	provided by the
the general rules of the labour law. with all regulatory acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to institutions is institutions of their own rule and condition failure of which bad failure of which to dismissal	Lithuania.	_	of the workload,	consultancy.	Law on National
of the labour law. acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to their own rule and condition failure of which bad failure of which to dismissal		regulated under	but shall comply		Education, the
of the labour law. acts approved at the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to their own rule and condition failure of which bad failure of which to dismissal		_			institutions set
the national level regarding the granting of guarantees and compensation to and condition and condition failure of which bad failure of which to dismissal		of the labour law.			their own rules
granting of guarantees and compensation to bad fair achievement le					and conditions,
guarantees and compensation to achievement le to dismissal			regarding the		failure of which or
guarantees and compensation to achievement le to dismissal			granting of		bad faith
					achievement lead
employees who manager			compensation to		to dismissal of
manager.	1			ì	İ
LEDITION WILL THAT SOEL			_		

are in such a	
situation. A key	
role in the exercise	
of that freedom	
belongs to the	
unions of the	
institution.	

Further, a comparative analysis of each criterion (sub-criterion) characterizing the autonomy of human resources in higher education institutions shall be performed.

4.1. Freedom /ability to decide on recruitment and employment procedures

This criterion refers to the freedom of higher education institutions to decide on recruitment and employment procedures. In general, universities are autonomous with regard to achievement of such freedom. Central authorities do not interfere into employment and/or recruitment procedures (to a lesser extent in Romania), universities are autonomous in terms of freedom to decide on recruitment and/or employment procedures. Freedom of higher education institution to decide on recruitment and employment procedures is correlated with general principles of labour law: higher education institutions, no matter how much autonomy, cannot establish internal regulations with regard to employment and recruitment that would not comply to national and Community labour legislation. The freedom of higher education institutions to decide on personnel recruitment and employment procedures should not limit the rights and freedoms guaranteed to employees and employers through various legislative acts. So, the institution has the right to develop its own procedures, to establish its own employment criteria to the extent that these do not contravene labour law rules.

4.1.1. Bodies responsible for recruitment and employment procedures

In all five examined countries universities have specialized collegial bodies responsible for recruitment procedures and/or employment: Payroll and Employment Commission in Lithuania, the Committee for human resources procedures and strategies in Scotland, the Employment Commission in Sweden and Denmark and the Competition Commission in Romania.

The structure of these commissions should not be approved by an hierarchical authority, except in Romania where rector's decision establishing the composition of the commission is submitted to the Ministry of Education, Research, Youth and Sport and the nominal composition of the Contest Commission is published on the contest's web page. For positions of associate professor, professor, II degree scientific researcher and I degree scientific researcher, the composition of the Commission shall be published in the Official Gazette of Romania, Part III. For higher education institutions of the defense system, public order and national security, Rector's decision is also transmitted to relevant entities.

In four countries the body responsible for the designation of the Rector is the Council, and in Romania the legislation provides two possibilities: a public contest, based on a methodology

approved by the newly elected University Senate consistent with the Law on National Education or an universal direct and secret vote of all tenured teachers and researchers of the university as well as of student representatives in the University Senate and Faculty Councils. However, unlike other European countries where the autonomy of institution is total in this regard, in Romania the relevant Ministry confirmes Rector's appointment.

4.1.2. Recruitment and employment methods and procedures. Approval /confirmation of recruitment /employment

Despite the fact that normative acts regulating the activity of higher education institutions describe the recruitment/employment procedures in a uniform manner for all institutions of the country, every university is free to ultimately decide on the optimal applicant.

The staff of higher education institutions does not have the status of public servants, except Sweden and Denmark where they are considered employees of the public sector, but in all countries employment of teachers does not require confirmation from a higher authority.

A very important detail worthy to be highlighted is that the election of Rector should not be confirmed by any external authority (except Romania, where the rector is confirmed by the Minister of Education, Research, Youth and Sport and concludes with the University Senate a management contract stipulating criteria and managerial performance indicators, rights and obligations of the parties), the institution being absolutely autonomous in terms of its right to recruit and elect the executive manager.

Vice-rectors are not subject to confirmation in office by any external authority.

Employment contests are open for participation to persons meeting contest application requirements without discrimination, under the law, and contest Methodology cannot contain discriminatory provisions for candidates based on gender, ethnic or social origin, nationality, religion or belief, disability, political views, social or economic condition. Contest Methodology cannot refer to seniority and cannot contain provisions that disadvantage candidates from outside the institution or from abroad. Description of the position brought to contest should be made in comprehensive terms that correspond to the real needs of the higher education institution, taking into consideration not to limit artificially the number of potential candidates.

4.1.3. Types employment and employment contracts

In all countries employment is made initially for a fixed-term period, afterwards, if the person meets the established criteria an employment contract is concluded for an indefinite period. In this sense, we cannot speak about autonomy since the institution respects the relevant legal norms. The autonomy of the institution is proved by the right to negotiate the work contract and to establish the exact duration in case of fixed-term contracts.

4.1.4. Conditions for appointment to posts in higher education. Academic career

Establishment of minimal conditions for hiring teaching and research staff by higher education framework law comes to support the idea that university autonomy of human resources should be correlated with the principle of public accountability of the institution, therefore the university is free to select its staff, to establish its own criteria (which should not be lesser than those established by law), but selection must be done among the best, meaning: the state, being aware of the role of university in the society, establishes rules that will lead to the fact that higher education institutions' option shall be the best performing candidates.

Even if all five countries have normative acts describing the conditions for access to higher education positions, including the stages of academic path-academic career, the university autonomy is large and the aim of regulating these conditions is not to interfere in the activity of institutions, but only prevention of certain possible abuses during employment and assurance of greater transparency.

The objective of academic career in higher education institutions of all five countries is to recruit people that obtained a Ph.D. degree, to employ them in higher education institutions and to provide them with opportunities for a lasting development in their academic career both in the field of teaching and research.

4.1.5. Staff of institutions

Elaboration of institutions' staff structure is carried out taking into account the education plans and the number of students enrolled at the institution. With regard to this sub-criterion higher education institutions are completely autonomous in all five countries. No external authority approves the staff structure. There are certain provisions, for example in Romania, where the general Classificator of auxiliary teaching and research positions in higher education as well as the level of education required for occupation of these positions is elaborated by the Ministry of Education, Research, Youth and Sport and also with the Ministry of Labour, Family and Social Protection. In Scotland, the only interference of the state in this area is the establishment of JOB FAMILIES system within higher education institutions, following a framework agreement signed with the National Confederation of trade unions. In order to equalize the multitude of positions within the system of higher education an analysis of sector's job positions based on 14 criteria, called HERA (Higher Education Role Analysis), was conducted. HERA is an abbreviation which translated from English means Analysis of the Role of Higher Education and represents a job evaluation system designed and developed by ECC in collaboration with higher education institutions (over 100 institutions have established a consortium together with representatives of national trade unions Confederation) for specific use by higher education institutions. HERA has been recognized by the Commission on Equal Opportunities as non-discriminatory job evaluation system. Most higher education institutions in Great Britain, including Scotland, have adopted HERA as their job evaluation system.

In the remaining countries, higher education institutions are totally autonomous with regard to the analyzed sub-criterion.

4.2. Freedom of institutions to decide on the promotion of staff

This criterion denotes the right of higher education institution to decide on assurance of personnel career advancement by promotion to a higher degree, position or professional level.

4.2.1. Staff evaluation

Staff evaluation aims to determine promotion opportunities and remuneration criteria. Career promotion of staff in the universities from the five countries is done according to internal evaluation procedures, with certain exceptions in Romania regulated by the Law on National Education. Promotion to a higher position is conducted on a competitive basis after due examination. Similarly, employees evaluation is part of the quality management system in force in each institution.

In all five countries the autonomy is large and the institution is free to decide on the periodicity of the evaluation, on the structures responsible for evaluation as well as on the evaluation methodology.

No external authority supervises these procedures, however the institution must take care that the evaluation procedures shall be established taking into account the principle of non-discrimination and transparency.

4.2.2. Students' role of in the promotion of academic staff

With regard to this sub-criterion, universities in all five countries are autonomous. According to internal regulations of the institutions, students are guaranteed the right to free selection of courses and specializations, according to the existing education plan. Students are considered partners of the institution and equal members of the academic community.

4.2.3. Academic mobility of teachers and internationalization policies

Mobility of higher education institutions' staff is encouraged and internationalization is a strategic priority to European higher education institutions, all five countries being autonomous in terms of this sub-criterion. Every institution has the right to develop its own policies, establishing personnel motivation mechanisms with regard to mobility. These mechanisms shall take account of mobility type, program providing mobility and other elements.

4.2.4. Rights and freedoms of higher education institutions' staff

Academic staff of higher education institutions enjoy freedom in terms of their right to choose teaching and research methods. Also, they enjoy all rights and guarantees relevant to an employment contract concluded in accordance with the current legislation.

Higher education institutions in all five countries developed a number of policies regarding the enforcement of institutions' personnel rights. These policies also target the enforcement of the right to rest through ensurance of both ordinary and additional annual leave. Universities are autonomous in terms of the number of freedoms and guarantees offered to teachers, however they are responsible not only to their own employees, for example in

Denmark and Sweden the enforcement of these freedoms and guarantees is strictly supervised by unions.

The institutions are autonomous in terms of granting the creation leave - the sabbatical leave with salary upkeep, thereby stimulating research activity.

4.2.5. Invited academic staff. Honorary titles awarding

With regard to this sub-criterion higher education institutions from the five evaluated countries are absolutely autonomous in terms of granting honorary titles. Every institution has its own honorific titles and is autonomous when establishing awarding criteria. With the exception of Denmark, having a ministerial order in this regard, in the remaining countries there are only internal regulations.

4.3. Freedom to decide on the workload

Freedom to decide on labour norming lies in the right of higher education institution to decide on the distribution of working time, working norms, most accurate determination of working tasks that a member of the academic community must achieve.

4.3.1. Structure of teaching /academic workload

The teaching workload of academic staff in higher education institutions of Sweden and Denmark consists of a number of hours distributed monthly throughout the academic year. According to the internal regulations of higher education institutions, academic staff working hours must be planned within the department where the employee works, following discussions between the latter and the Head of Department. When planning working hours, operational requirements, financial situation and general analysis of the teaching tasks should be taken into consideration. At the department level it should be taken into account the total number of hours for teaching and research evenly distributed among department members. In Lithuania, the workload of academic staff consists of teaching and research activity. In Scotland, the workload of academic staff consists of teaching, research, knowledge transfer and carrying out administrative activities. The share of an activity type in overal workload is determined by the Head of Department, who assesses the skills of each employee and organizes department activities in such a way as to have a reasonable balance between all members of the department. In Romania, the teaching workload may comprise a number of teaching and research activities.

In all five countries universities enjoy autonomy both at institutional and internal level.

4.3.2. Working time. Obligations of higher education institutions' staff

In all five countries academic staff enjoy a reduced working regime due to increased psychoemotional effort made during their activity. The annual amount of hours is approximately 1000 hours, of which approximately 1/4 are assigned to direct-contract teaching activities. Institutions are autonomous in terms of annual distribution of working hours, which is the competence of departments.

Expressing university autonomy, the Code of ethics emphasizes obligations and ethical standards of the teacher. Besides these, teachers are obliged to observe labour discipline within the institution.

4.4. Freedom to decide on salary system

Freedom of higher education institution to decide on labour remuneration system is demonstrated by its right to decide on the system of salary, rewards, establishing various salary increases depending on the complexity of work performed and on the volume of work carried out by an employee.

4.4.1. Salary structure. Incentive payments

In all five countries the salary consists of a fixed part (position salary: Lithuania, Scotland, Sweden and Denmark, and basic salary in Romania) and a variable part, which consists of various bonuses, allowances, incentive payments, etc. In Lithuania, the fixed part of the salary is equal for similar academic positions and does not depend on the scientific degree and on the working experience of a particular employee; therefore the salary is not negotiated and salary scale for a particular position is not applied. The salary is different only for different academic functions, e.g. the position salary of a professor shall be different from the salary of a lecturer. The state guarantees the minimal salary to any employee of higher education institution, but does not limit the maximal amount of salaries that can be received. In Scotland, remuneration is carried out under the HERA system which analyzes positions families to ensure equal pay for equal work.

In Sweden, institutions are free to set their own remuneration systems given the financial situation of the institutions based on each employee's individual performance criteria, thus registering a high degree of autonomy. In Denmark, every employment occurs under the Job Structure Memorandum and remuneration is carried out based on the principle of equal pay for employees performing the same functions. However, institutions provide a competitive level of salaries compared to the private sector. In terms of remuneration Danish institutions also have a high degree of autonomy internally – at department level.

In all these countries every institution is required to adopt remuneration policies which should contain provisions with regard to transparency when setting salaries, universities thus enjoying enlarged autonomy in terms of the right to determine remuneration conditions, less in Romania where there is a clear regulation in the Law on National Education regarding the amount of salaries and other incentive payments.

4.4.2. Bodies empowered to set salaries

Bodies empowered to establish salaries are usually collegial structures called Salary Commissions or Commissions for Labour Remuneration. In Sweden and Denmark the employer and employees' representatives negotiate the establishment of remuneration criteria for different groups of employees. Based on these criteria the school principal /head of department shall evaluate every employee in order to establish a proper wage. These criteria, negotiated by parties of employment relationship in higher education institutions shall serve

as the basis for salary negotiation between the employee and the Head of Department, etc. In Romania, the Senate of the institution is also responsible for regulation of remuneration procedures.

4.5. Freedom to decide on the employment contracts termination method

Employment contracts of higher education institutions' staff in all five countries may be terminated legally or at the initiative of either party. Higher education institutions have well-developed policies and grounds for termination are regulated by general rules of labour law.

4.5.1. Grounds for termination of employment contracts specific for higher education

There are no particular grounds for termination of employment contract specific for higher education in either country, but in all of them the disciplinary termination of the employment contract is the highest penalty that can be applied both for intentional commitment of a particularly serious transgression and for repeated violation of employee's obligations, likely serious disrupt of the order and activity of the university.

One cannot relate the degree of autonomy in this regard, but it is clear that institutions are autonomous in terms of the fact that the decision regarding termination of labour relations does not require approval from any external authority.

4.5.2. Termination of employment contracts with managerial staff

In all countries except Romania, the Board of the institution is responsible for the termination of employment relationship with the staff empowered with managerial functions. In Romania, higher education institution is not autonomous in this respect and the Rector may be dismissed by the relevant Minister, legally, after consulting the University Senate. Such situations occur when the Rector acts contrary to the principle of public accountability. The dismissal procedure is described in detail by the Law on National Education.

4.6. Conclusions

Analysis of relevant normative documents in the five EU countries have revealed certain similarities, but also certain differences in terms of human resources autonomy due to the particularities of applicable legal system as well as to the economic and social conditions if each country. In the Scandinavian countries - Sweden and Denmark, due to a well-developed social protection system, unions play a key role in the achievement of human resources autonomy thus being a key factor influencing the application of all criteria of human resources autonomy. Higher education employees in these two countries are employed by the public sector, but, as in the rest of the countries, their employment does not need to be confirmed by an external authority. In all countries the Rector or the Principal (Scotland) is the employer who concludes employment contracts, but the selection of personnel is made by collegial structures, called Employment Committees, that evaluate candidates. Any vacancy shall be announced publicly, both at national and international level. The state establishes minimal requirements for the occupation of a position and institutions are entitled to set their own conditions depending on the specifics of access to academic career. The objective of

academic career in higher education institutions from the five countries is to recruit people who have obtained doctoral degree, to employ them and to provide them with opportunities for lasting development of academic career both in the area of teaching and in the area of research.

In all countries employment is initially made for a specific period, afterwards, if the person meets the established criteria an employment contract in concluded for an indefinite period. In this respect, one cannot speak of autonomy; the institution complies with the relevant legal rules. The autonomy of an institution occurs by means of its right to negotiate the employment contract as well as to establish the exact duration of contracts in the case of fixed period contracts. Except for Romania, the staff structure does not require approval from any external authority.

Career promotion of personnel from the universities of the five countries is done according to internal evaluation procedures, with certain exceptions in Romania, where the Law on National Education governs such procedures. Promotion to a higher position is conducted on a competitive basis after an examination. Similarly, the evaluation of employees is part of quality management system existing in each institution.

The teaching workload of academic staff consists of both teaching and research activities as well as activities of administrative nature.

Remuneration in Denmark and Romania is dominated by the public sector remuneration system and involves certain legal limitations. In Sweden and Scotland institutions have full autonomy with regard to remuneration system. As for Lithuania, the remuneration is not subject to public law, but there are certain limitations and the institution must meet a minimal salary guaranteed by the state. Entities in charge of establishing remuneration are collegial bodies.

The working contracts of staff in higher education institutions from all five countries may be legally terminated usually after expiration of the employment period or by initiative of either party. Higher education institutions have well-developed policies and grounds for termination are regulated by general rules of labour law.

5. Final conclusions

Following an analysis of normative acts in the system of higher education from the countries that hosted study visits the following conclusions were drawn.

Relevant ministries of these countries are bodies that develop personnel policies, which must be considered and implemented by institutions taking into account the principle of non-discrimination. At the same time, ministries have an advisory role for the work of the institution. Less can be said about Romania, where the relevant ministry has one of the main roles, coordinating and monitoring all personnel related activities.

Employment contests are open for participation to persons meeting contest application conditions, without any discrimination, under the law, and the contest methodology cannot stipulate discriminatory provisions for candidates based on gender, ethnic or social origin, nationality, religion, disability, political opinions, social or economic condition. Contest methodology cannot refer to seniority work experience and cannot stipulate provisions disadvantaging candidates from outside the institution or from abroad. Job description of the position brought to contest shall be made in comprehensive terms corresponding to the real needs of higher education institution meaning not to limit, artificially, the number of potential candidates. All vacant positions should be announced both at national and international levels (except in Romania, where announced in the Official Gazette). Similarly, no external authority approves Rector's election (except Romania, where the Rector is confirmed by the Minister of National Education and concludes with the Senate a management contract providing management performance criteria and indicators together with the rights and obligations of the parties) and higher education institution is absolutely autonomous in terms of its right to recruit and elect the executive manager in all countries except Romania. The Board of higher education institution is responsible for the termination of labour relations with personnel performing managerial functions. In Romania, higher education institution are not autonomous in this respect and the Rector may also be dismissed by the relevant Minister, legally, after consulting the University Senate – a governing body elected by the personnel of higher education institution.

Collaboration with business environment is a mandatory activity for all visited universities. It is represented by the fact that every member of the teaching personnel must be involved in research and must undertake research projects. Research should be applied for a particular company, to be useful for the collaborating institution as well as to bring additional income to the institution and to the researcher. All institutions from these five countries have developed internationalization policies. The mobility of academic staff regarding teaching and especially research activities is an important criterion for the evaluation of academic staff.

Analysis of similarities and differences among the five systems reveals that there is no perfect model of human resource autonomy, but there are good practices of well-known universities, which after being taken over and adjusted to social and economic realities from our country could give good results, would strengthen institutional capacities of higher education and would increase the degree of autonomy with regard to the existing human resource management, mandatorily correlating it with the principle of public accountability of every institution, thus: university autonomy besides freedom means a high level of responsibility.

REFERENCES

- 1. Law on Higher Education and Research, Republic of Lithuania, 30 April 2009, no. XI-242. http://goo.gl/Ry36fg
- 2. Mykolas Romeris University Statute. http://goo.gl/oX7G7u
- 3. Vilnus University Statute. http://goo.gl/Y4ysnz
- 4. The site of Seimas of the Republic of Lithuania. http://goo.gl/gbAW35
- 5. Scottish Code for Good HE Governance. http://goo.gl/VIFmWm
- 6. Further and Higher Education (Scotland) Act 1992. http://goo.gl/QlZR6U
- 7. Statute of the University of Strathclyde. http://goo.gl/5H06PS
- 8. Ordinances of the University of Strathclyde. http://goo.gl/07UGBx
- 9. Regulations of the University of Strathclyde. http://goo.gl/cCJThg
- 10. The Glasgow Caledonian University Order of Council 2010. http://goo.gl/NN1bfg
- 11. The Glasgow Caledonian University Governors Handbook. http://goo.gl/ipc62r
- 12. The Swedish Higher Education Act, 1992. http://goo.gl/ywcSM9
- 13. The Swedish Higher Education Ordinance, 1993. http://goo.gl/Hc7dSV
- 14. Website of KTH Royal Institute of Technology, www.kth.se/en
- 15. Website of Linkoping University. http://goo.gl/q5L949
- 16. Website of Stockholm University. http://goo.gl/TpvmDw
- 17. Salary Policy and guidelines relating to salary at Halmstad University. http://goo.gl/fApumg
- 18. Swedish Employment Protection Act. http://goo.gl/L7vWz6
- 19. The Danish (Consolidation) Act on Universities, 2012. http://goo.gl/EmT1fT
- 20. Site of the Ministry of Higher Education and Science. http://ufm.dk/en/
- 21. Statutes of the self-governing institution Aalborg University, 2012. http://goo.gl/ls4Yt9
- 22. Aarhus University By-laws. http://goo.gl/mDo40T
- 23. Legea Educației Naționale (Law on National Education), no. 1, 2011 (with subsequent amendments and completions). http://edu.ro/

- 24. Website of the University of Bucharest. http://goo.gl/caEfqQ
- 25. Website of "Al. Ioan Cuza" University of Iași. http://goo.gl/hjBCzi
- 26. Website of "Ştefan cel Mare" University of Suceava. http://goo.gl/fFLkkr
- 27. Thomas Estermann and Terhi Nokkala, University Autonomy in Europe I (2009). http://goo.gl/vuJzR8
- 28. Thomas Estermann, Terhi Nokkala and Monika Steinel, University Autonomy in Europe II, the Scorecard (2012). http://goo.gl/MYRn7i

Appendix 1. Identified issues and questions for Lithuania

#	Autonomy type	Problem formulation	Material consulted ⁱ	Unresolved question /issue	Suggested meetings
1	Staffing	Capacity to decide on Recruitment procedures. If there are variances across universities, why is it the case?	Law on Higher Education and Researchii The Statute of MRUiii Labour Code of Lithuaniaiv Law on the Employment Contract On the approval of the model form of the employment contract Vilnius University Statute Vii	1. Internal /External procedures (i.e. if the recruitment procedures are developed solely by the HEI). 2. Does any external authority confirm recruitment? Maybe only for managerial positions? 3. What is the procedure for announcing vacancies? (national level, international level or just internal within HE) 4. Is there any methodology for establishing the necessary number of posts (as for academic staff so for other staff)? 5. Are number of posts regulated by any external authority? 6. Are rectors /vice-rectors public servants? 7. How are vice-rectors, deans, vice-deans, heads of departments appointed? Are the dean's /vice-dean's positions distinctive jobs or are an addition to the academic job? Which are the responsibilities of the dean? 8. What is the maximum workload for scientific and pedagogical activities of the University Administration Staff? 9. What kind of employment contract is used to establish labour	Step 1. Any governmental regulation in the field if it is the case. Any internal regulation if it is the case. Step 2. HR office. Legal office and other concerning.

			I 4.2 - 24 - 2	
			relations with a person who	
			is enrolled for doctoral	
			studies? For what kind of	
			activities are work	
			arrangements used?	
			10. What is the	
			maximum workload	
			admissible for one person	
			(depending on the position	
			held)?	
			11. Are there any legal	
			restrictions to be admitted	
			to any position within HEI	
			(except the subordination of	
			relatives)?	
			12. What are the	
			conditions for the first	
			enrollment in high	
			education?	
			13. Are there any	
			probationary periods for	
			teaching staff? If yes what	
			is the procedure?	
			14. How is the	
			Recruitment Commission	
			set up? How is the chairman	
			appointed?	
			15. Is there any	
			restriction for teaching staff	
			to work simultaneously in	
			two or more HEI?	
			16. The University	
			Library Staff. How is the	
			Recruitment and the	
			execution of their labor	
			contract regulated?	
	Capacity to	The Statute of	1. Who is responsible	Step 1. Any
	decide or		for the salary policies? The	governmental
	salaries.		HEI or another authority?	regulation in the
	Sului 103.	Labour Code	•	field if it is the
		of Lithuania ^{ix}	2. What is the salary	case. Any
		Law on	structure? Are there any other supplements	internal
		Higher	other supplements (scientific degree, working	regulation if it is
		Education and	years)?	possible.
		Research ^x	•	Step 2. HR
		Vilnius	3. Is the salary	office, Finance
1 1				office, Fillance

	University Statute ^{xi}	distinctive for distinctive academic position or is	office (responsible for
		distinctive for particular persons?	payroll).
		4. Are established limits for the maximum amount of the salary for academic staff by the state? Other staff?	
		5. Is there established a minimal amount of the salary in HEI?	
		6. How are the norms of staff's scientific and pedagogical work regulated?	
		7. Is there any preferential tax regime for people working in HEI?	
		8. Does the payroll system for principals differ from one HEI to another? If	
		yes what are the criteria?	
		9. What kind of	
		incentives are paid to the HEI staff? Procedures?	
		10. Is there any	
		administrative position in the HEI where is possible to	
		negotiate the salary?	
		11. Is there any annual adjustment of the minimal salary in HEI?	
		Is staff evaluation essential for the work retribution?	
Capacity to	Law on	1. Is there any reason	Step 1. Any
decide on	Tinginer	for the termination of an	governmental
dismissals.	Education and	employment contract	regulation in the
	Research ^{xii}	specific for HEI?	field if it is the case. Any
	The Statute of MRU ^{xiii}	2. For what legal reasons academic staff may	internal
	Labour Code	be dismissed?	regulation if it is
	of Lithuania ^{xiv}	3. Are there any	possible.
	Law on the	procedures for staff	Step 2. HR
	Employment	redundancies?	office, Legal

	VV.		
	Contract ^{xv} On the approval of the model form of the employment contract ^{xvi} Vilnius University Statute ^{xvii}	4. What is the procedure for staff dismissal if he fails the performance evaluation? Is there the possibility to continue his activity in the HEI, but in another position?	office.
Capacity to decide on promotions (senior academic /senior administrative staff.	Law on Higher Education and Research xviii The Statute of MRU xix Strategic Activities Plan of MRU 2010-2020 xx Labour Code of Lithuania xxi Law on the Employment Contract xxiii Vilnius University Statute xxiii Resolution on a Uniform Higher Education Policy in Baltic States xxiv	1. Are students involved in staff promotions? 2. Have students the right to select a particular lecturer for a particular course? 3. Have students the right to formulate complaints on a staff behaviour? Is there any appropriate structure? 4. How is staff mobility regulated? Is it encouraged? Does a suspension of work contract operate in case of mobility? If yes in which cases and for how long? 5. What kinds of measures are taken at the University Level for minimizing brain-drain? 6. Is the supervisor of academic ethics and procedures in charge to examine complaints from employees regarding the violation of the promotion procedures? 7. Does the same Supervisor examine complaints from students? 8. What kinds of procedures are used for	Step 1. Any governmental regulation in the field if it is the case. Any internal regulation if it is possible. Step 2. HR office and other in charge with promotion maybe Recruitment Commission.

	promoting of high level	
	specialists?	
	9. Is there any	
	external structure for	
	awarding the pedagogical	
	scientific titles of professor	
	and associate professor?	
	_	
	10. What is the	
	procedure for sabbatical	
	leave? Is it paid? What	
	kinds of works /activities	
	are relevant for this?	
	11. Every five years	
	teaching staff members may	
	be released for a period not	
	longer than one year from	
	their pedagogical work to	
	conduct research and to	
	improve their scientific and	
	pedagogical qualifications	
	and they are paid the	
	average salary. What are the	
	procedures? How many	
	persons can benefit from	
	this during one year?	
	12. What are the	
	reasons for an extraordinary	
	performance evaluation?	

Appendix 2. Identified issues and questions for Scotland

#	Autonomy type	Problem formulation	Material consulted xxv	Unresolved question /issue	Suggested meetings
1	Staffing	Capacity to decide on Recruitment procedures. If there are variances across universities, why is it the case?	Assessment of Recruitment Needs xxvi Academic Job Level Descriptors Xxvii Support Staff Job Level Descriptors Xxviii Academic Probationary Period Guidelines Xxix Indicators of Requirements for Internal Promotions to Senior Lecturer, Reader and professor XXX Fixed Term Contracts Use Policy XXXXi	1. Internal /External procedures (i.e. if the recruitment procedures are developed solely by the HEI). 2. Does any external authority confirm recruitment? Maybe only for managerial positions? 3. Is there any methodology for establishing the necessary number of posts (as for academic staff so for other staff)? 4. Are number of posts regulated by any external authority? 5. Are principals public servants? 6. How are vice-principal, deans, vice-deans, heads of departments employed? Is there any specific procedure (elections, contest)? Which is the period of employment for them? Are the dean's /vice-dean's positions distinctive jobs or are an addition to the academic job? 7. Is there possible to cumulate an administrative job and an academic one (i.e. part time)? 8. What kind of employment contract is	Step 1. Any governmental regulation in the field if it is the case. Step 2. HR office.

used to establish labour relations with a person who is enrolled for doctoral studies? 9. What is the maximum workload admissible for one person (depending on the position held)? 10. Are there any legal restrictions to be admitted to any position within HEI? Capacity to Code of Good HE salarys. Governance **Statistis* Payroll**** Payroll**** Payroll**** 1. Who is responsible for the salary policies? The HEI or another authority? 2. What is the salary structure? Are there any other supplements (scientific degree, working years)? 3. Is the salary distinctive for distinctive academic position or is distinctive for distinctive academic position or is distinctive for particular persons? 4. Are there any established limits for the maximum amount of the salary for academic staff by the state? Other staff? 5. Is there any preferential tax regime for people working in HEI? 6. The payroll system for principals differs from one HEI to another? If yes what are the criteria? 7. Based on what criteria are other members of staff, besides the principal, chosen in order that their				
decide on salaries. Code of Good HE Governance*** Salary Scales****** Payroll***** Payroll**** Payroll**** Payroll*** Payroll** Payroll*** Payroll** Payroll*	Conssitu	The Scottish	relations with a person who is enrolled for doctoral studies? 9. What is the maximum workload admissible for one person (depending on the position held)? 10. Are there any legal restrictions to be admitted to any position within HEI?	Stan 1 Any
	decide on	Code of Good HE Governance ^{xxxiii} Salary Scales ^{xxxiii}	responsible for the salary policies? The HEI or another authority? 2. What is the salary structure? Are there any other supplements (scientific degree, working years)? 3. Is the salary distinctive for distinctive academic position or is distinctive for particular persons? 4. Are there any established limits for the maximum amount of the salary for academic staff by the state? Other staff? 5. Is there any preferential tax regime for people working in HEI? 6. The payroll system for principals differs from one HEI to another? If yes what are the criteria? 7. Based on what criteria are other members of staff,	governmental regulation in the field if it is the case. Any internal regulation if it is possible. Step 2. HR office, Finance office (responsible for

de	Capacity to lecide on lismissals.	Academic Probationary Period Guidelines ^{xxxv}	salaries should be determined by the Remuneration Committee? 8. Are there any financial stimulants besides salary for HEI staff? 1. Is there any reason for the termination of an employment contract specific for HEI? 2. For what legal reasons academic staff may be dismissed? 3. Are there any procedures for staff	Step 1. Any governmental regulation in the field if it is the case. Any internal regulation if it is possible. Step 2. HR office.
do process of the control of the con	Capacity to lecide on promotions senior cademic senior dministrative taff.	Accountability and development Review Policy*xxvi Promotion Procedure for Senior Academic Professional Staff*xxxvii Promotion from Lecturer A to Lecturer B*xxxviii Professional Development framework*xxxix Regrading policy for non-academic staff*xl	cutbacks? 1. Are students involved in staff promotions? 2. Have students the right to select a particular lecturer for a particular course? 3. Have students the right to formulate complains on staff behavior? Is there any appropriate structure? 4. How is staff mobility regulated? Is it encouraged? Does a suspension of work contract operate in case of mobility? If yes in which cases and for how long?	Step 1. Any governmental regulation in the field if it is the case. Any internal regulation if it is possible. Step 2. HR office and OSDU.

Appendix 3. Identified issues and questions for Sweden

	Autonomy type	Problem formulation	Material consulted ^{xli}	Unresolved question /issue	Suggested meetings
1	Staffing	Capacity to decide on Recruitment procedures. If there are variances across universities, why is it the case?	The academic career path at KTH ^{xlii} Employment of assistant professors at KTH ^{xliii} The Swedish HE Act ^{xliv} The Swedish HE Ordinance ^{xlv} KTH HR Policy ^{xlvi}	1. Internal /External procedures (i.e. if the recruitment procedures are developed solely by the HEI). 2. Does any external authority confirm recruitment? Maybe only for managerial positions? 3. What is the procedure for announcing vacancies? (national level, international level or just internal within HE). 4. Is there any methodology for establishing the necessary number of posts (as for academic staff so for other staff)? 5. Are number of posts regulated by any external authority? 6. Are rectors /vice-rectors public servants? 7. How are vice-rectors, deans, vice-deans, heads of departments appointed? Are the dean's /vice-dean's positions distinctive jobs or are an addition to the academic job? Which are the responsibilities of the dean? 8. What's the period of the employment for deans, vice deans and directors of departments? 9. What is the	Step 1. Any governmental regulation in the field if it is the case. Any internal regulation if it is the case. Step 2. HR office. Legal office and other concerning.

maximum work load for scientific and pedagogical of activities the University Administration Staff? 10. What kinds of relations are established between the HEI and a doctoral student? there 11. Is any possibility to cumulate an administrative job with a teaching position? 12. Are there any legal restrictions to be admitted to any position within HEI (except the subordination of relatives)? 13. What are the conditions for the first enrollment in higher education? 14. Are there any probationary periods for teaching staff? If yes what is the procedure? 15. Is there any restriction for teaching staff to work simultaneously in two or more HEI? 16. The University Library Staff. How is Recruitment their and the regulated execution of their labor contract? Are they academic or technical staff?

- 17. In what cases are fixed-term contracts used?
- 18. Is there a specific approved form for the labour contract (at the

				national level or only	
				available for KTH)?	
				19. What is the	
				statute of the personnel	
				from administrative	
				structures (Financial, HR,	
				Maintenance etc.)?	
	~ .		-	· ·	~ .
		0.	Language	1. Who is	Step 1. Any
		n	policy at	responsible for the salary	governmental
	salaries.		KTH ^{xlvii}	policies? The HEI or	regulation in the
			Local	another authority?	field if it is the
			agreement on	2. What is the salary	case. Any internal
			salary during	structure? Are there any	regulation if it is
			parental leave	other supplements	possible.
			at KTH ^{xlviii}	(scientific degree,	Step 2. HR office,
				working years)?	Finance office
					(responsible for
				3. Is the salary	_
				distinctive for distinctive	payroll).
				academic position or is	
				distinctive for particular	
				persons?	
				4. Are there any	
				established limits for the	
				maximum amount of the	
				salary for academic staff	
				by the state? Other staff?	
				•	
				5. How are the	
				norms of staff's scientific	
				and pedagogical work	
				regulated?	
				6. Is there any	
				preferential tax regime	
				for people working in	
				HEI?	
				7. Does the payroll	
				* *	
				system for principals	
				differ from one HEI to	
				another? If yes what are	
				the criteria?	
				8. What kinds of	
				incentives are paid to the	
				HEI staff? Procedures?	
				9. Is there any	
				additional payment for	
				using English in the work	
				using English in the WOLK	

		activity?	
		10. What social facilities are paid to HEI staff?	
		11. Is staff evaluation essential for the work retribution?	
Capacity to decide on dismissals.	The Swedish HE Act ^{xlix} The Swedish HE Ordinance ¹ KTH HR Policy ¹ⁱ	1. Is there any reason for the termination of an employment contract specific for HEI? 2. For what legal reasons academic staff may be dismissed? 3. Are there any procedures for staff redundancies? 4. Is there the possibility for the academic staff to continue its activity if he fails self-evaluation? 5. Do staff benefits from a specific training?	Step 1. Any governmental regulation in the field if it is the case. Any internal regulation if it is possible. Step 2. HR office, Legal office.
Capacity to decide on promotions (senior academic /senior administrative staff.	The academic career path at KTH ^{lii} The Swedish HE Act ^{liii} The Swedish HE Ordinance ^{liv} KTH HR Policy ^{lv}	1. Are students involved in staff promotions? 2. Have students the right to select a particular lecturer for a particular course? 3. Have students the right to formulate complaints on a staff behaviour? Is there any appropriate structure? 4. How is staff mobility regulated? Is it encouraged? Does a suspension of work contract operate in case of mobility? If yes in which cases and for how long? 5. What kinds of procedures are used for	Step 1. Any governmental regulation in the field if it is the case. Any internal regulation if it is possible. Step 2. HR office and other in charge with promotion maybe Recruitment Commission.

promoting high level
specialists?
6. Is there any
external structure for
awarding the pedagogical scientific titles of
professor and associate
professor?
7. Do academic
staff from Sweden benefit
of so-called sabbatical
leave?
8. What is the length of a usual annual
leave? Is there any
specific period to be used
by staff?

Appendix 4. Identified issues and questions for Denmark

Data gathering template

Annex to Job structure lx procedure for announcing vacancies, lxi office and concerning.	in the is the Any
decide on Recruitment procedures. If there are variances across universities, why is it the case? Annex to Job structure for academic staff ^{lix} HR forms lixi Maybe Act log governmental regulation in the recruitment procedures are developed solely by the HEI). Case governmental regulation in the recruitment procedures are developed solely by the HEI). Case governmental regulation in the case procedures are developed solely by the HEI). Case governmental regulation in the case procedure authority confirm recruitment? Maybe only for managerial positions? Maybe office and concerning.	in the is the Any
except positions of professor and associate professor? (national level, international level or just internal within HE). 4. Is there any methodology for establishing the necessary number of posts (as for academic staff so for other staff)? 5. Are number of posts regulated by any external authority? 6. Are rectors /vice-rectors public servants? Other university staff? 7. How are vice-rectors, deans, vice-deans, heads of departments appointed? Are the dean's /vice-dean's positions distinctive jobs or are an addition to the academic job? Which are the	

responsibilities of the dean? 8. What's the period of the employment for deans, vice deans and directors of departments? 9. What is the maximum work load for scientific pedagogical activities of the University Administration Staff? 10. What kinds of relations are established between the HEI and a doctoral student? 11. Is there any possibility to cumulate an administrative job with a teaching position? 12. Are there any legal restrictions to be admitted to any position within HEI (except the subordination relatives)? 13. What are the conditions for the first enrollment in higher education? Are there any 14. probationary periods for teaching staff? If yes what is the procedure? 15. Is there any restriction for teaching staff to work simultaneously in two or more HEI? 16. The University Library Staff. How is their Recruitment and the execution of their labor

they

contract regulated? Are

academic

		technical staff?	
		17. In what cases are	
		fixed-term contracts	
		used?	
		18. Is there a	
		specific approved form	
		for the labour contract (at	
		the national level or only	
		available for KTH)?	
		19. What is the	
		statute of the personnel	
		from administrative	
		structures (Financial,	
		HR, Maintenance etc.)?	
Capacity to	HR forms ^{lxii}	1. Who is	Step 1. Any
1	THE TOTHIS	responsible for the salary	governmental
decide on salaries.		policies? The HEI or	regulation in the
sararies.		another authority?	field if it is the
		-	
		2. What is the	case. Any
		salary structure? Are	internal
		there any other	regulation if it is
		supplements (scientific	possible.
		degree, working years)?	Step 2. HR
		3. Is the salary	office, Finance
		distinctive for distinctive	office
		academic position or is	(responsible for
		distinctive for particular	payroll).
		persons?	
		^	
		4. Are there any	
		established limits for the	
		maximum amount of the	
		salary for academic staff	
		by the state? Other staff?	
		5. How are the	
		norms of staff's scientific	
		and pedagogical work	
		regulated?	
		6. Is there any	
		preferential tax regime	
		for people working in	
		HEI?	
		7. Does the payroll	
		system for principals	
		differ from one HEI to	
		another? If yes what are	

			Alan mikani - 0	
Capacity	to	Working contract in	the criteria? 8. What kinds of incentives are paid to the HEI staff? Procedures? 9. Is there any additional payment for using English in the work activity? 10. What social facilities are paid to HEI STAFF? 11. Is staff evaluation essential for the work retribution? 1. Is there any reason for the	Step 1. Any
decide dismissal	on S.	contract in Denmark lxiii	reason for the termination of an employment contract specific for HEI? 2. For what legal reasons academic staff may be dismissed? 3. Are there any procedures for staff redundancies? 4. Is there the possibility for the academic staff to continue its activity if he fails self-evaluation? 5. Do staff benefits from a specific training?	governmental regulation in the field if it is the case. Any internal regulation if it is possible. Step 2. HR office, Legal office.
Capacity decide promotio (senior a /senior administr staff).	on ns cademic	On the conferment of the titles of affiliated associate professor and affiliate professor lxiv Key HR performance indicators lxv	 Are students involved in staff promotions? Have students the right to select a particular lecturer for a particular course? Have students the right to formulate complaints on staff behaviour? Is there any appropriate structure? How is staff 	Step 1. Any governmental regulation in the field if it is the case. Any internal regulation if it is possible. Step 2. HR office and other in charge with promotion maybe Recruitment Commission.

	mobility regulated	? Is it
	encouraged? Do	es a
	suspension of	work
	contract operate in	n case
	of mobility? If y	ves in
	which cases and for	or how
	long?	
	5. What kind	ds of
	procedures are use	ed for
	promoting high	
	specialists?	
	6. Is there	any
	external structure	*
	awarding the pedag	
	scientific titles	-
	professor and ass	
	professor?	
	7. Do aca	damia
	staff from De	
	benefit of so-	
	sabbatical leave?	cancu
		a l
	8. What is	
	length of a usual a	
	leave? Is there	· ·
	specific period to b	e used
	by staff?	

Appendix 5. Data reporting and data analysis for Lithuania

Data collection template 2: data per autonomy type (Lithuania)

Staffing autonomy

Short description about the meeting: 21.01.2014 /MRUNI /Birute Mikulkiskiene

Problem /question	Findings	Comments
formulation	_	
Capacity to decide	1. Q: Internal /External	In general, Lithuanian Universities
on Recruitment	procedures (i.e. if the recruitment	are free to decide on their
procedures.	procedures are developed solely by the	Recruitment procedures, even for
If there are	HEI)? A: According to art. 20 of the	managerial position. The only
variances across	Lithuanian Law of Higher Education	request is to respect the provisions
universities, why	and research, the Council of HEI sets	of the Labour Law in the general
is it the case?	principles for selection and assessment	matters of labour relations. Also, a
	of employees of the higher education	good example to follow is the
	institution ^{lxvi} .	procedure established for
	2. Q: Does any external authority	management staff's appointment. In
	confirm recruitment? Maybe only for	Lithuania there are no collective
	managerial positions? A: There is no	elections for the deans and also no
	external authority which confirms	Ministerial approval for vice-
	recruitment, even for managerial	rectors. The described situations are
	positions, including rectors.	good examples to follow for our
	3. Q: What is the procedure for	HEIs, because only a consolidated
	announcing vacancies? (National level,	managerial team is able to perform
	international level or just internal within	the management in accordance with
	HE). A: The procedure for announcing	University mission and strategy.
	vacancies is one open, as for teaching	Also the appointment by the rector
	and research staff, also for	of the managerial team at the
	administrative positions. According to	faculty level is an example of good
	the law, with not less than three months	practice. The described situation
	remaining before the expiry of the term	allows avoiding team segregations
	of tenure of a teaching staff member	within the faculty or department
	and research staff member of a higher	level.
	education and research institution, an	
	open competition shall be announced to	
	fill such position. A person who already	
	holds this position may participate in	
	the competition. An announcement	
	about a competition to fill a position	
	must be published in the websites of the	
	institution and the Research Council of	
	Lithuania, as well as in the Lithuanian	
	mass media and, where appropriate, in	
	the international mass media.	

- 4. **Q:** Is there any methodology for establishing the necessary number of posts (as for academic staff so for other staff)? **A:** Officially there is no methodology at MRUNI, but Mrs Birute Mikulskiene said, they try to balance the needs of the departments with the possibilities of the administration.
- 5. **Q:** Are number of posts regulated by any external authority? **A:** No, the funding from the State, comes as price for the student, including the sum for the remuneration, but does not establish the number of posts for which this sum should be paid. This is all internal concerns of the institution.
- **Q:** Are rectors /vice-rectors public servants? A: No, they are not. The University Council is responsible for the Rector's employment and the following procedure will be used: an open competition will be announced to fill the position of the Rector. The Rector shall be considered to be elected, if at least six Council members vote for him. When electing the Rector, if no candidate is elected to the position of the Rector during the first round of voting, another round of voting shall be held. In this case not more than two candidates who have won the majority of votes during the first round of voting shall take part in the competition. The Rector may be a person who has an academic degree or is an established artist, who has the experience in pedagogy and management. The Chairman of the Council or any other person authorised by the Council shall sign in the name of the University an employment contract with the elected Rector for the duration of his term of office. The term of office of the Rector shall be five years. The same person may be elected Rector of the University for not more than two terms of office in succession and not earlier than after an

- interval of five years since the end of the last term of office, if the last term of office was the second consecutive term.
- **Q:** How are vice-rectors, deans, heads of departments vice-deans, employed? Is there any specific procedure (elections, contest)? Which is the period of employment for them? Are dean's /vice-dean's positions distinctive jobs or is an addition to the academic job? A: The positions of vice-rectors and deans are announced in news paper. There is a selection of the candidates, based on CV, the rector selects the best performed candidates and he presents the candidate to the Faculty (dean's positions). Further, the rector submits to the Senate for approval candidates for a five-year term of: University Vice Rectors, University Chancellor, Faculty Deans, Department Heads and Institute Directors. Also, the Rector on the recommendation of the Deans, approve Faculty Deputy Deans and the Rector defines the functions and powers of the Vice Rectors and the Chancellor. The academic work for the deans is an additional to the managerial position. He may have maximum 0.5 academic workload.
- **Q:** What is the maximum workload for scientific and pedagogical activities of the University Administration Staff? A: It is a distinctive job and they may have maximum 0.5 academic workload. The administration shall consist of employees of higher education and research institutions, with the exception of the heads of the academic units of higher education institutions, which are included into the composition of other academic units, and the heads of the academic units of research institutes, who shall have the right to give orders within the limits of their competence to subordinate employees. Besides the

- administrative duties, they may carry out pedagogical and/or research work. An academic unit of a higher education and research institution shall be such a unit whose main activities are the carrying-out of studies and/or research and experimental (social, cultural) development.
- 9. **Q:** What kind of employment contract is used to establish labour relations with a person who is enrolled for doctoral studies? For what kind of activities are used work arrangements? **A:** There is no distinctive labour contract for persons enrolled in doctoral studies. University staff shall be provided with the conditions, in accordance with the procedure laid down by the Senate, to improve their qualification and to prepare to enter doctoral studies.
- 10. **Q:** What is the maximum workload admissible for one person (depending on the position held)? **A:** It is maximum 0.5 academic workload.
- 11. 0: Are there any restrictions to be admitted to any position within HEI (except subordination of relatives)? A: When an employee is deprived of special rights to perform certain work in accordance with the procedure prescribed by laws. For the Rector is established the following limitation if the same person may be elected Rector of the University for not more than two terms of office in succession and not earlier than after an interval of five years since the end of the last term of office, if the last term of office was the second consecutive term.
- 12. **Q:** What are the conditions for the first enrollment in higher education? **A:** There are no distinctive requirements. A person who has at least a Master's qualification degree or a higher education qualification equivalent to it may be a candidate for

- the position of assistant. An assistant must direct practical training of students (practical work, practical trainings, internship, etc.), help in carrying out research and experimental (social, cultural) development work.
- 13. **Q:** Are there any probationary periods for teaching staff? If yes what is the procedure? **A:** Not the case.
- **O:** How is the Recruitment Commission set up? How is the chairman appointed? A: A recruitment commission which evaluates candidates for the position of teaching staff members and research staff members, with the exception of postdoctoral grant holder, shall be set up in accordance with the procedure laid down by higher education and research institutions. Not less than one-third of the members of the recruitment commission must be persons who do not work in this higher education and research institution. When making arrangements for a competition to fill the position of the chief research staff member professor, at least one international expert must be in the recruitment commission.
- 15. **Q:** Is there any restriction for teaching staff to work simultaneously in two or more HEI? **A:** No, there is no restriction.
- 16. **Q:** The University Library Staff. How is their Recruitment and the execution of their labor contract regulated? **A:** Recruitment and employment procedures for the library staff are established the same as for the other technical staff employed in Lithuanian HEI. Usually they are employed on indefinite period of time, based on simple recruitment procedure i.e. CV selection.

Capacity to decide on salaries.

1. **Q:** Who is responsible for the salary policies? The HEI or another

Regarding remuneration policies and system, Universities in

- authority? **A:** The HEI is solely responsible for remuneration. The Council of the HEI sets the procedure for managing, using and disposing of higher education institution's funds designated for remuneration of the institution's leadership and other employees.
- 2. **Q:** What is the salary structure? Are there any other supplements (scientific degree, working years)? **A:** The constant part of the salary is the same for a concrete academic position, is not negotiated and does not depend on scientific degree, working years.
- 3. **Q:** Is the salary distinctive for distinctive academic position or is distinctive for particular persons? **A:** The base salary is distinctive for different academic positions.
- 4. **Q:** Are there any established limits for the maximum amount of the salary for academic staff by the state? Other staff? **A:** No, there are no limits for the maximum amount established by the state, there is only a guaranteed minimal amount of the wages.
- 5. **Q:** Is there a minimal amount of the salary in HEI established? **A:** Yes.
- **Q:** How are the norms of staff's pedagogical scientific and regulated? A: One work load is equal to 1000 hours, consisting in 400 h research, 600 h teaching, including administrative work. Class hours: professors (160)associate (240);lecturer (280 h); assistant (320 h).
- 7. **Q:** Is there any preferential tax regime for people working in HEI? **A:** Not the case.
- 8. **Q:** Does the payroll system for principals differ from one HEI to another? If yes what are the criteria? **A:** Differs, because it depends on Council decision within institution, each institution has its own financial

Lithuania are absolutely autonomous, with respecting the principles of responsibility and accountability. There no limitations by the law, only internal rules in order to guarantee the payment for work. The base part of the salary is paid to everyone, except 40% for the research, there is a set of criteria established (i.e. participations publications, conferences etc.), if a person does not achieve is paid proportionally. The rest of the salary (the variable part) is paid based on internal regulations, but can not exceed the constant part^{lxvii} In conclusion, I may say, that each member of the HEI staff is paid according to his or her individual merits, including for research, despite the situation in our country, where academic staff is paid only for teaching activities.

- situation and the rector is paid according to the decision of the council, upon hearing the decision of the Senate.
- 9. **Q:** What kinds of incentives are paid to the HEI staff? Procedures? **A:**
- 10. **Q:** Is there any administrative position in the HEI where is possible to negotiate the salary? **A:** Maybe (our guide could not tell us about it).
- 11. **Q:** Is there any annual adjustment of the minimal salary in HEI? **A:** Each institution may decide according to its financial capacity.
- 12. **Q:** Is staff evaluation essential for the work retribution. **A:** Yes, it is, because on the evaluations promotions of staff are operated and a new level of salary is established.

Capacity to decide on dismissals.

- **O:** Is there any reason for the termination of an employment contract specific for HEI? A: There are no legal provisions that specify a particular case for HEI, but there is a specific situation for the rector: if an annual report on the activities of the University is not approved by a majority of the Council members at a meeting of the Council, the Rector shall be dismissed from office by the majority of at least six Council members in accordance with the procedure laid down by legal acts lxviii Upon expiry of the Rector's term of office, the terms of office of Vice Rectors and the Chancellor shall also expire lxix
- 2. **Q:** For what legal reasons academic staff may be dismissed? **A:** When an employee is deprived of special rights to perform certain work in accordance with the procedure prescribed by laws^{lxx}
- 3. **Q:** Are there any procedures for staff redundancies? **A:** Yes, there is an established procedure, according to art.130 of Lithuanian Labour Law.
- 4. **Q:** What is the procedure for

general, autonomous Lithuanian University should respect the legal provisions settled in the Labour Law concerning dismissals. In general, there will be no reason for the HEI staff dismissals if they will observe the Code of Academic Ethics and perform other duties set in the statute (regulations, statutes) of their institution and their employment contracts.

These principles are similar with the ones from our country, the problems occur because of the contradiction between the Labour Code of RM, Law on Education and the Regulations for occupying academic positions in higher education institutions, approved by Government Decision No. 854 of 21.09.2010.

staff dismissal if he fails the performance evaluation? Is there the possibility to continue his activity in the HEI, but in another position? **A:** There were not such situations at MRU, but theoretically it is possible and the University will offer a new position, but not an academic one.

Capacity to decide on promotions (senior academic /senior administrative staff.

- 1. **Q:** Are students involved in staff promotions? **A:** Theoretically and according to the Law of HE, students have the right to choose a teaching staff member, if the same subject is taught by several teaching staff members.
- 2. **Q:** Have students the right to select a particular lecturer for a particular course? **A:** According to the Law of HE, students have the right to choose a teaching staff member, if the same subject is taught by several teaching staff members.
- **Q:** Have students the right to formulate complains on a staff behaviour? Is there any appropriate structure? A: Students have the right to address the administration of a higher education institution. the dispute settlement commission regarding the violation of interests. The dispute settlement commission shall function in a higher education institution. This commission shall settle disputes of students and the administration or other employees related to research and study activities. The administration of a higher education institution and a students' representative body (if there is no students' representative body - a general meeting (conference) students) shall each appoint an equal number of authorised persons to the dispute settlement commission. The statute of a higher education institution shall lay down the procedure for setting up a dispute settlement commission, settling disputes and implementing decisions.

Promotions criteria are very clear defined in HE LAW, also in the internal regulations of the MRUNI. Staff mobility is encouraged, by paying them the salary during a period of time: a good example for us, now according to Labour Code of RM only for a period up to 60 days is maintained the average salary. Even if an institution would try to establish other regulations, controlling bodies state will consider it as illegal, because during a mobility up to 60 days operates the suspension of the work contract and of all payments. Also the good practice is one with sabbatical leave that is granted to each employee. For example at **MRUNI** average salary is maintained ½ year. Persons shall be accepted to the positions of teaching staff members and research staff members of higher education and research institutions, with exception of postdoctoral grant holders and persons indicated in Article 61 and paragraph 4 of this Article, through an open competition for a five-year term of The procedure tenure. organizing a competition to fill the positions of teaching staff members and research staff members of a higher education institution shall be laid down by the higher education institution, and the procedure for organizing a competition to fill the positions of teaching staff members

- 4. **Q:** How is staff mobility regulated? Is it encouraged? Does a suspension of work contract operate in case of mobility? If yes in which cases and for how long? **A:** In any case it is encouraged; it is part of HEI strategy. During 3 months it is paid the full amount of salary, and after 3 months only 30% of salary.
- 5. **Q:** What kinds of measures are taken at the University Level for minimizing brain-drain? **A:** It is difficult to say.
- **Q:** Is the supervisor academic ethics and procedures in charge to examine complains from employees regarding the violation of the promotion procedures? A: Supervisor of academic ethics and procedures shall be a state officer who examines complains and initiates investigation regarding the violation of academic ethics and procedures, including promotion procedures, but is relatively a new institution in HE system of Lithuania.
- 7. **Q:** Does the same Supervisor examine complains from students? **A:** No.
- 8. **Q:** What kinds of procedures are used for promoting of high level specialists? A: The University Senate will approve the internal system of quality assurance in studies and control its implementation. Also, this body will qualification requirements positions of teaching and research staff members, lay down the procedure of performance evaluation of teaching and research staff members as well as the procedure of organization competition to fill a position lxxi A recruitment commission, set up in accordance with the procedure laid down by the Senate, shall evaluate candidates for the position of a teacher and a research worker, with the exception of postdoctoral fellowship

and research staff members of a research institute – by the research institute. An employment contract of unlimited duration for holding this position shall be concluded with a person who has the second time in succession won the competition to hold the same position of the teaching staff member or research staff member. Performance evaluation of this person shall be carried out every five years in accordance with the procedure laid down by higher education and research institutions. A person who fails the performance evaluation shall be dismissed from the position. Persons shall be accepted to a higher position of a teaching staff member or research staff member by way of an open competition. – also an example of good practice.

- holder. Not less than one-third of the members of the recruitment commission must be persons who do not work in the University. When making arrangement for a competition to fill the position of a chief research worker or professor, at least one international expert must be in the recruitment commission.
- 9. **Q:** Is there any external structure for awarding the pedagogical scientific titles of professor and associate professor? **A:** There is no external structure for awarding the pedagogical scientific titles of professor and associate professor.
- 10. **Q:** What is the procedure for sabbatical leave? Is it paid? What kind of works /activities are relevant for this? **A:** It is paid average amount of salary and maximum duration is ½ year. As relevant activities may be considered publishing of a monograph, study etc.
- 11. **Q:** Every five years teaching staff members may be released for a period not longer than one year from their pedagogical work to conduct research and to improve their scientific and pedagogical qualifications and they are paid the average salary. What are the procedures? How many persons can benefit from this during one year? **A:** There is no special procedure and everyone may benefit if it is the case.
- 12. **Q:** What are the reasons for an extraordinary performance evaluation?

Appendix 6. Data reporting and data analysis for Scotland

Data collection template 2: data per autonomy type (to be filled in per each EU partner)

Staffing autonomy

Short description about the meeting: Date /place /person

All Higher Education Institute	
Capacity to The Scottish system of higher education is All Higher Education Institute decide on regulated under a very complex legal in Scotland are independent	
decide on regulated under a very complex legal in Scotland are independent	
	tutions
	public
Recruitment structure that is made up of papal bulls, bodies. They enjoy a high le	evel of
procedures. statutes, statutory instruments and royal institutional autonomy in	n the
If there are charters. While the legislative and domain of staff recruitment.	
variances across constitutional arrangements vary, All universities in Scotland	l have
universities, why universities are all independent corporate senior management team	ms –
is it the case? institutions with charitable status and with groups of senior academi	c and
a governing body that is responsible for administrative officers w	
the overall direction and strategy of the with the Principal. Som	-
institution, and is accountable, alongside these teams have the statu	
	mittee,
terms of staffing all Scottish Universities whereas in other cases	they
are very autonomous. operate as informal groups.	
University of Strathclyde, our host during The Principal leads	the
this week, has a Committee responsible management of the institution	on, but
for HR procedures and strategies training. The also leads the community of	
Staff Committee is responsible for the and students overall. For	or all
strategic oversight of strategy and policy Principals this leadership	is in
in relation to staffing matters as well as some contexts one	of
monitoring compliance with all relevant representation, in others it	is one
legislation. In particular the Committee is of management, and in	others
responsible for: again it is ceremonial.	It is
(a) the University staffing strategy important to recognise all	these
and ensuring that it is consistent with the aspects of the role. Uni	versity
overall University strategy, and for Principals are now often des	cribed
proposing this to the Executive Team to as their institution's	'chief
ensure consistency with the wider executive officer', using lar	
strategic investment framework; borrowed from the business	world.
(b) the scrutiny of policies and In many ways the role is	
procedures to ensure that the University comparable to that of a corr	-
continues to attract, reward and retain the CEO, but then again it m	-
calibre of staff it requires to achieve its that, for the leader of a second	
aims as set out in the Strategic Plan; institution such as a univ	ersity,
(c) taking account of the wider such comparisons are	not
external environment to ensure that the altogether useful.	

terms and conditions of employment for all staff remain appropriate and sustainable, and for reaching agreement on these following consultation with the Campus Unions;

- (d) staff development and performance management systems and monitoring the effectiveness of these;
- (e) ensuring compliance with any relevant legislative or professional requirements relating to the employment of staff;
- (f) ensuring that the staffing profile is such that it will ensure delivery of the University's aims as set out in its strategic plan;
- (g) regularly reviewing the staffing strategy to ensure that it remains relevant and sustainable.

The Committee will be composed of:

- (a) Vice-Principal /Deputy Principal *ex officio* Convener
- (b) Principal ex officio
- (c) Deputy Convener of Court (Staff) *ex officio*
- (d) One further lay member of Court
- (e) Two Senior members of staff with staff management experience appointed by Senate
- (f) Chief Financial Officer ex officio
- (g) Director of Human Resources ex officio
- (h) Such other members as the Committee may wish to co-opt because of their expertise.

University of Strathclyde has established a set of principles, guidance in their HR policy. According to this, the mission and the vision of the University, concerning HR are established as follows: lxxiv

• Developing their recruitment and selection methods and procedures to ensure that they attract exceptional staff from all backgrounds within the UK and

As we discuss about the principal and the whole executive team appointment it is good to mention the width of the autonomy enjoying by Scottish Universities. The principal is appointed by the Governing body of the institution, no need for an approval from Ministry, so there is no political mixture in the HEI's internal affairs.

If we speak about the appointment of the rest of the executive team it is good to mention the same procedure as in Lithuania, i.e. the selection of the CVs, panel interview and the selection of the best performed candidate. We should insist on adopting such a procedure in our country because it is one efficient and absolutely democratic, regardless that the deans and the head of departments are not elected by the collective, but appointed upon a selection. It is obvious that the executive team should implement the managerial act and the University strategy alongside with the rector. For example according our legislation the deans and the head of departments (chairs) should present their managerial plan before their elections. In this case it is not clear how it should be related to University's strategy. In my opinion I think the appointment of the whole managerial team is a good example that should be taken by our system.

from overseas.

- Ensuring that appropriate development, induction and probationary arrangements are in place for all new staff.
- Implementing a framework for performance management that facilitates regular supportive conversations between staff and their managers.
- Promoting staff development internally and externally by providing a useful suite of learning and development opportunities including mentoring, secondments, sabbaticals and placements, making the most of their contacts in industry, business, voluntary and public sectors.
- Ensuring effective succession planning is in place.
- Ensuring that their staff have a flexible and effective system of reward and recognition that is integrated and promotes high performance and innovation across the University.
- Establishing a culture of personal and professional development for all staff at all stages of their career.
- Ensuring that all staff understand what is expected of them and how their work contributes to organisational success.
- Supporting academic staff to develop a balanced portfolio of activity across the core activities of research, education and knowledge exchange.
- Reviewing their leadership initiatives to ensure they are suitable and appropriate to develop future leaders across the University.
- Implementing mentoring, coaching and feedback mechanisms for current and future leaders.
- Developing a new appointment procedure and personal support package for key managerial staff, such as Heads of

Department.

- Delivering working practices that recognise the changing world of work and allowing our employees to be innovative and entrepreneurial.
- Establishing employee feedback initiatives to assess and learn from their internal culture.
- Developing an explicit set of organisational values and behaviours that supports One Strathclyde.
- Encouraging environmentally and socially responsible behaviour among all staff.
- Continuing to promote partnership working between professional services staff and academic colleagues to deliver One Strathclyde.
- Creating a positive working environment that promotes staff engagement and wellbeing.
- Providing opportunities for staff to have open and continuing dialogue with colleagues and senior management on a regular basis.

All Universities have the capacity to decide on Recruitment procedures, adopting their internal regulations on this matter. In this sense, University of Strathclyde has exhaustive internal regulations, because there are no external rules for recruitment procedures.

According to the internal regulations University staff consists of:

- Senior officers of the University (the principal, the vice-principal, the chief operating officer, the chief financial officer and executive deans);
- The Academic staff (Academic, Research, Teaching, Knowledge exchange);
- **Support staff** (Administrative and Professional Services, Technical Services, Operational Services).

The University of Starthclyde manages a wide range of policies and procedures relevant to the employment with the University. They are intended to provide practical and consistent advice and guidance to managers and staff about the University's position and approach to employment related matters and to support the University's vision, strategy, values and culture. Subject to consultation, they may be added to, reviewed or amended from time to time to reflect changes in employment law or best practices in effective people management or in light of changes required to better support the University's strategy for research. education and knowledge exchange.

The appointment of the staff is established according to different procedures, depending on the position.

No external authority confirms appointment, even for senior officers of the University and no external authority regulates the number of posts within the University.

The recruitment procedures starts with the fulfilling of the document called **Recruitment schedule** used for completion by the recruiting manager and HR responsible. The document contains details about the vacancy, the advertising procedures etc. lxxv

Before advertising a new position, all the issues should be economically justified. After all necessary documents are fulfilled are elaborated job descriptions and personal requirements, according to the internal rules lxxvi

All the vacant position should be announced, both nationally and internationally, in order to choose the best candidate. The advertising period and placement will depend on the nature of the post. The University advertises all posts on jobs.ac.uk and their own website as standard. Placement in other locations will

depend on the type of post in question but it should be noted that the University will ordinarily advertise posts online only. For posts where the pool of candidates may be international in nature the advert should be live for a minimum of 28 days to satisfy UKBA regulations. Normally these posts would be of a skilled and/or specialist nature e.g. requiring a PhD.

The University operates probationary periods for new staff, the duration of which will be specified in individual letters of appointment. The normal probation period differs for specific posts and from one category to another. The duration of the probation period will depend upon the complexity of the role and over what length of time the member of staff can reasonably be expected to complete most aspects of the role. Usually it lasts from 6 up to 36 months lxxvii The primary purpose of the probationary period is to help the member of staff perform to the required standard and to ensure they are, in overall terms, the right fit for the role to which they have been appointed. The probationary accordingly provides an opportunity for the member of staff to demonstrate that they are able to fulfill the role and undertake the key responsibilities of the post. However, it is recognised that the University has a responsibility to assist members of staff in achieving the required standards and therefore during the probation period the University will assist and support new staff to:

- be clear about and achieve the requirements of the post.
- identify training and development needs and undertake relevant training.
- where relevant, understand in which areas they are not performing to the required standard and what improvement is required.
- where relevant, be given sufficient

time and support to achieve the required improvement.

• integrate into the University and become fully effective in the post as soon as possible.

Performance will be assessed periodically throughout the probationary period and for development where areas highlighted, every reasonable opportunity will be provided to assist in the improvement of performance. The relevant manager will make clear how these standards will be monitored and the frequency with which they will be formally reviewed lxxviii

If we are talking about the appointment of the principals (rectors), the procedure is the same in all HEI. The following criteria should be applied in the appointment and remuneration of the principals:

- Appointed by the governing body, usually following an executive search and interview process. The contractual terms are determined by the governing body;
- The remuneration is set by a Remuneration Committee or the Governing body. This subject will be developed later;
- For appointment should be used transparent criteria and specifications for the post and should encompass more than managerial skills and cover the institution's need to interact with the community.

Also, should be mentioned that principals are not public servants.

The appointment of vice-principals, chancellor and deans is decided within the University. No exterior authority approves the appointment. The principals are free to establish the executive team, taking into account the criteria of transparency, professionalism and the lack of conflict of interests.

The Head of Department is appointed for

a 3 years term. The appointment is based on an interview - a panel of 6 persons, usually the dean, senior officer from the University.

The Head of Department shall be responsible for maintaining and promoting the efficiency and good order of the Department, shall be the official correspondent of the Department and shall under the Court exercise authority in and bear responsibility for the Department as a salary consists whole. The management allowance, the work load is 50% directed for administrative work. After the dismissal the Head of Department has the right to a sabbatical leave with duration with 1 month for 1 worked year, but has not to exceed 6 months.

The appointment of vice-deans follows the same procedure; his work load is 50% administrative work and 50% academic.

Senior Officers of the University

The Vice-Principal shall exercise such functions and responsibilities, and be engaged at such remuneration and upon such terms and conditions as the Court shall deem fit. During the absence of the Principal the Vice-Principal shall undertake any such functions and duties of the Principal as the Principal or the Court may delegate to him/her. The Vice-Principal shall normally hold office for a period of five years (unless otherwise determined by the Appointment Committee or the Court).

The Chief Operating Officer shall be appointed as pursuant to the Charter and Statutes and shall, under the direction of the Principal, be responsible for the administration of the University and for providing secretarial services for the Court and the Senate.

The Chief Financial Officer under the direction of the Principal, shall be responsible for the financial management

of the University and the strategic management of the Professional Service functions in the broad areas of resources, including finance, estates and human resources.

Executive Deans. An executive Dean shall be appointed for each Faculty. The functions and responsibilities of the office of Executive Dean shall be as determined by the Court and will include contributing to the overall leadership of the University.

General Conditions for the Appointment of University Officers – for the offices of Vice-Principal, Chief Operating Officer, Chief Financial Officer and Executive Dean.

These senior University Officers shall be appointed, pursuant to any provisions within the Charter and Statutes, by an Appointment Committee established by Court and be engaged at remuneration and upon such terms and conditions as the Court shall deem fit. The arrangements and constitution of the Appointment Committee shall be provided for within relevant policies and procedures approved by the Staff Committee, on behalf of Court. Notwithstanding such policies and procedures, an Appointment Committee shall have the power to seek external assessments for any or all candidates for any or all of the above posts. No person shall be a member of an Appointment Committee considering the appointment of his/her successor. The requirements above shall not prejudice office holders appointed prior to the implementation of these provisions.

As we talk about the specific of employment contract during the PhD. studies, it is necessary to highlight that doctoral research is highly demanding and may leave limited time or energy to pursue part-time work. However, it is not unusual for doctoral candidates to undertake part-time work, especially academic-related work such as teaching,

for professional development purposes, or out of financial necessity. Some disciplines (sciences) expect their students to become laboratory assistants while others have specific teaching assistant posts linked to doctoral studentships.

Specific criteria attached to research studentships may limit the number of hours per week a full-time doctoral candidate is permitted to work. Six hours per week is often the maximum in these cases, but you would need to check individual institutional regulations and/or the relevant funding organisation.

It is not possible to work full-time while registered as a full-time doctoral candidate.

If we refer to any limitation or legal restriction to work within HEI we must speak about the conflict of Interests. As we are speaking about Strathclyde University, we must say that there is an internal regulation of what limitation for employment are established lixix

The University of Strathclyde does not preclude the appointment of spouses /partners or near relatives of present members of staff to posts within the University. All appointments are made on the basis of selecting the best candidate available for the post in question.

However, staff involved in the consideration of applications must be aware of any near relationships which could lead, for example, to managerial problems in such matters as supervision and working relationships with other colleagues.

In addition staff are required to adhere to the procedures outlined below which are designed to ensure that no favour is given to relatives of existing members of staff.

These are:

• All appointments will be made in accordance with approved University procedures.

- All posts involving applications from near relatives will be advertised in accordance with the University's normal recruitment practices.
- No member of staff who is a near relative of an applicant shall be involved in any aspect of the recruitment procedure including:
- o the selection of candidates for shortlisting
- the giving of references to other candidates or the candidate in question
- o making arrangements for interview
- o the interviewing panel
- o contacting the applicants for any reason
- o decisions as to which candidate will be appointed.

If a member of staff intends to name a spouse /partner or near relative as a prospective member of staff in a research grant application, the Deputy Director of Human Resources must be informed in writing at the earliest stage since the appointment would not be subject to the normal recruitment procedures.

This policy applies to all posts within the University of Strathclyde, regardless of the duration of the contract, hours of work or salary. Where an appointment will not be subject to the normal recruitment procedures, no spouse /partner or near relative may be employed without the prior knowledge and approval of the Head of Department.

Capacity to decide on salaries.

As we talk about University's autonomy in the terms of capacity to decide on salaries we must say that in Scotland Universities are indeed autonomous. Appointments at Strathclyde are made at an appropriate salary point on the University's grading structure, with initial placing determined according to qualifications and experience.

The payroll system is entirely internal. There is no external authority that authorise the remuneration system. The University is free to establish salaries and incentives for their employee. There is an internal scale for payment, established upon different criteria, one of this

The activity of the Universities should be highly transparent, all the minutes of Senate and other bodies should be public. Also the current salary scales are published on the website of the University Also all the information concerning staff payment is public, accessible to all interested parts

The tax regime applicable is not different from other employees in UK. The employees from a HEI pay the same taxes and there is no preferential tax regime.

The payroll system is established based on job families, i.e. the same salary scale for similar positions. Responsible for the salary of an employee is the manager of the department, faculty, directorate etc. where the employee works.

A special Committee is established for the remuneration of the executive team. It is so-called Remuneration Committee.

The main responsibilities of the Committee are established as follows:

- confirming the remuneration and conditions of service of the Principal, taking account, where relevant, of the provisions of the Charter and the Statutes (currently under review);
- confirming the remuneration and conditions of service of the Secretary to the University /Chief Operating Officer, taking account, where relevant, of the provisions of the Charter and Statutes (currently under review);
- confirming the remuneration and conditions of service of other employed Senior Officers required for the proper governance of the University, taking into account, where relevant, the provisions of the Charter, Statutes and Ordinances. These posts being the Vice- Principal, the Deputy Principals and the Chief Financial Officer:
- confirming the remuneration and conditions of service of Deans of Faculty and Directors of Professional Services (as

being the job families, i.e. the same salary grid for the same position, but concrete remuneration for each person, depending personal onprofessional merits. remuneration system is verv transparent; all information is posted on the University site and is accessible for all interested persons. The information updated monthly, containing all financial documents and evidence.

According to the Review of HE Governance in Scotland, by prof. Ferdinand von Prodzinsky, while the pay of Principals is public information, the method of its calculation or the reasons for any increases given are not. It is also not always clear what other benefits, or bonus payments, may be available to individual senior *staff. He recommends – in the light* of the wider public debate about executive pay and bonuses – that universities ensure that payments that may be perceived as bonuses are either abolished or at least transparently awarded and brought into line with the scale of 'contribution payments' available to on-scale staff.

For our system the payment of the rector is still approved by the Ministry of Education, on the recommendation of the Senate. From practice, I find procedure one difficult and inutile because, the rector should act with accountability and I am sure no rector will be paid more than he/she deserves and no University establish Senate will remuneration system that does not correspond to the legal provisions.

established by the Professional Services Review) required for the proper governance of the University, taking into account, where relevant, the provisions of the Charter, Statutes, Ordinances and Regulations;

- reviewing the performance of the above post holders, normally on an annual basis, and determining what adjustments should be made to their remuneration and conditions of service:
- confirming the terms of agreed severance and/or early retirement of any of the above post holders;
- deciding on any issues referred to it involving the remuneration and conditions of service of Senior Staff where such a referral would represent good practice in the conduct of public life;
- confirming the University's position on the affordability and acceptability of the terms of any national pay agreement proposed or entered into by the Universities and Colleges Employers Association;
- reporting to Court as necessary.

The composition of the Committee:

The Convener of Court (in the Chair)

The Treasurer

The Deputy Convener of Court (Staff)

The Deputy Convener of Court (Estates)

The Convener of Audit Committee

The Principal *

Secretary: Director of Human Resources

* The Principal is not a member of the Remuneration Committee when his or her own remuneration and/or conditions of service are determined, nor will he or she be present while these matters are considered. The Secretary (Director of Human Resources) will also withdraw when his or her case is being considered.

Capacity	to
decide	on

A HEI has the right to decide on dismissals according to the general

Each University in Scotland has the capacity to decide on dismissals.

provisions of Labour Law. The procedures for dismissals differ from situation to situation. There is a special procedure of the termination of the contract, which is distinctive for fixed term contracts and for contracts with an open date. The ending of a fixed-term contract is deemed to be a dismissal in law. It follows therefore that the University must adhere to a dismissal procedure which is compliant with the relevant statutory requirements. There may be some instances where the reason for dismissal upon the expiry of the contract is for "some other substantial reason", e.g. upon the return of an absent member of staff for whom cover has been provided, but in the majority of cases the reason will be redundancy. There will also be cases where it is necessary for the University to consider the termination of open-ended contract as a result of redundancy, for example related to staff who has been engaged on open-ended contracts but where the underpinning fixed-term funded externally grants /initiatives come to an end without equivalent replacement. The process therefore for managing these scenarios is similar.

A potential redundancy occurs where:

- the volume of work diminishes either permanently or temporarily, e.g. Upon withdrawal of external funding or
- the volume of work remains undiminished but the University requires fewer staff to carry out work, e.g. upon a reorganization and reallocation of duties or
- there is a change in the nature of the work but the overall volume of that work and the number of staff required remains the same, e.g. where significant changes bring about a requirement for different kinds of skills.

In cases where two or more "in scope" posts exist to undertake work as above,

dismissals within the provisions of the Labour Law. University has internal regulations establishing the procedure of the termination of employment contracts or the disciplinary dismissals. For disciplinary dismissals or even for disciplinary liability there are established a set of doings that may be considered as disciplinary misconducts and may lead to a disciplinary dismissals.

Also the University has an Exhaustive Procedure for redundancies and for redeployment.

Regretfully in our system we do not have such well described procedures that will both correspond to the legal provisions of labour laws and to the economical needs the of University. Even the regulations for the academic staff appointment does nor describe the legal context of the termination of the labour contract if a person does not pass the contest for a new academic position or for a new term.

there may be a need to consider selection for redundancy where there is a need for a proportion of the work, and therefore one post or more, to continue. In these cases contractual status will not be the sole criteria for a factor in selection e.g. the redundancy pool can comprise those on open-ended as well as fixed-term contracts. The University will make all reasonable efforts to ensure the continuity of employment for individuals where possible and, towards this consideration will be given to a variety of measures including the use of bridging funding, retraining and, where applicable, redeployment.

The following procedure shall apply where a fixed term contract is in operation or where an open ended contract is coming to an end, for example, as a result of withdrawal of fixed term funded grants or the ending of fixed term initiatives.

Normally, at least four months before the due date of termination of the fixed-term contract or funding period the relevant Head of Department or Professional Services area will be reminded of the impending expiry of a contract. In the case of fixed-term contracts this reminder will be sent from Human Resources and, in the case of continuing contracts potentially impacted by expiry of funding, it will be sent from the Finance Office. The appropriate line manager shall discuss with the member of staff what alternative options are available. This discussion will be in line with the requirement for individual consultation outlined within redundancy legislation. The employee may be accompanied by a colleague or trade union representative if they wish. The discussion of possible options will include:

• a further renewal of the fixed-term contract arising from renewal of funding, the sourcing of additional funding, the requirement for work to continue for a further period and so forth.

- the relevance of considering transfer to an open-ended contract.
- the expiry of the fixed-term contract with no renewal.
- the termination of an open-ended contract subject to payment of the appropriate notice period for the contract.
- where applicable, seeking alternative employment via the formal redeployment process, this to include reasonable retaining as applicable.

The Head of Department or Service area, or their nominee, will advise Human Resources or the Finance Office and Human Resources of the outcome of these discussions on the appropriate form in sufficient time to allow for the undernoted.

- Where practicable, three months before the due date of termination of the fixed-term contract the member of staff will receive from Human Resources confirmation of any likely changes in contractual terms, of the expiry of their fixed-term contract or the termination of the continuing contract.
- Where the decision is that a contract should not be renewed the member of staff's attention shall be drawn to the formal University policy in respect to redeployment and to information on other positions within the University.

In cases where it is established that it is necessary to consider the termination of an open-ended contract, as a result of the pending cessation of external funding or for other reasons, the termination will be subject to the approval of the Director of Human Resources, always with due regard to the provisions of the University's Statutes. Where approval is granted, the open-ended contract will be terminated by the issuing of notice, with due exploration of redeployment and other support options

as detailed above and in other relevant University policies. The University pays statutory redundancy terms to staff whose employment is terminated by the University at the end of a fixed-term contract period and in any other redundancy cases where it has not proven possible to avoid termination of the contract. The University will not seek to enforce any redundancy waiver clauses lixxxiii

An employee may Appeal against the termination of their employment on the grounds of redundancy. To do so, they should write to the Director of HR, setting out their grounds for appeal, within 10 working days from the date of the letter confirming the end of their employment. Appeals will be heard by a senior University employee who has not been previously involved in the case.

A termination of the contract because of retirement age is not possible on University's decision. As the University will no longer be determining when a member of staff retires the process of retirement will therefore be voluntary and so is essentially a resignation. Members of staff can voluntarily retire at a time of their choosing and, where applicable, draw any occupational pension they are entitled to under the rules of their pension scheme.

Some of disciplinary issues that can conduct to dismissals will be discussed further.

Capacity to decide on promotions (senior academic /senior administrative staff.

Scotland's Universities recognize the necessity of performing staff so there are created appropriate conditions for staff's development and for staff's promotions.

As we speak about staff development we must note that staff development laxxiii refers to the development of the individual's potential and career in terms of knowledge, skills, personal abilities, competencies and understanding to

Speaking about promotions it is good to notice that Strathclyde University, as well as other HEI from Scotland have a set of internal regulations for describing staff promotions and staff development. An example of good practice is the Department of Learning and Development. It offers a series of courses for the employees in the field of

support the University's academic mission and the priorities as set out in the Strategic Plan. It embraces a wide range of learning experiences, both within and outside the workplace, and is a continuing process that can help individuals to:

- Extend their range of performance
- Identify and develop their potential
- Respond positively to change, uncertainty and conflict
- Increase their job satisfaction
- Improve their self-confidence, motivation and initiative.

Staff development can take place on-job or off-job. Other arrangements for staff development might include, as appropriate:

- Having a mentor or coach
- Job enrichment, e.g. participation in working parties or project groups, or involvement in other activities which are outside the individual's normal job responsibilities, and therefore enhance or enrich that person's professional life:
- Job shadowing, particularly for those either new to the University or about to take up a senior position
- Job rotation or swapping
- Exchange visits, for example to an overseas institution
- Secondment, either internally or to another institution or organisation
- Study leave
- Release time to undertake a (further) qualification.

At Starthclyde University staff development is encouraged and supported financially. It is a special department, called Learning and Development. It offers a series of courses for the employee in the field of management, leadership, pedagogical skills etc. lxxxiv

management, leadership, pedagogical skills etc. Also this Department supports the new during enrolled staff their probationary period which is very well regulated at Strathclyde University. This example is also very interesting, and may be helpful for our University if we want to enroll and to maintain performed employees. It is a good practice for young academic staff to have this probationary period and I find the idea with the supervisor for the newly enrolled a very efficient one in promoting and educating high-developed employees.

PROMOTIONS. There are two different situations of promotions from Lecturer A to Lecturer B grade and promotion for senior academic professional staff.

Promotion from Lecturer A to Lecturer B grade are dealt with by the Faculty Probation Review Panels in accordance with the relevant criteria lxxxv

For the Senior academic staff is set the procedures. To ensure following consistency of approach in Academic promotions, the arrangements consideration of cases for promotion to Senior Lecturer, Reader and Professor been brought together rationalised under one procedure. This procedure also provides a mechanism for the consideration of cases of transfers to the Academic staff category for staff whose posts are currently assigned to a staff category other than Academic. This procedure also provides a mechanism for the regrading of posts to Grade 10 within the Research, Teaching and Knowledge Exchange staff categories i.e. regrading to Principal Research Fellow, Principal Teaching Fellow or Principal Knowledge Exchange Fellow. In addition, this procedure defines how cases for the conferment of Emeritus Professor status will be considered.

The Academic Professional Appointments Panel (APAP) will meet twice a year, normally in March and September, to consider cases made under the terms of this procedure.

The procedure for internal promotion to the Academic staff grades of Senior Lecturer, Reader and Professor and for Grade 10 within the other Academic Professional staff categories involves five stages if a promotion is to occur:

1. The submission of a written case for promotion by the candidate's Head of Department /School to the Executive Dean.

- 2. Consideration of the written case by the Faculty (Executive Dean and two Vice Deans) to determine whether it should be referred to the Academic Professional Appointments Panel (APAP).
- 3. Consideration of the written case by APAP resulting in a decision that External Assessors' views should be sought (Reader, Principal Research Fellow, Principal Teaching Fellow, Principle Knowledge Exchange Fellow and Professor), that promotion is approved (Senior Lecturer) or that the case should not progress.
- 4. In the case of promotion to Research Reader. Principal Fellow. Principal Teaching Fellow, Principal Knowledge Exchange Fellow or Professor, consideration by an appropriately constituted Ordinance 4.2 External Committee, informed by Assessors' views, in order that a final decision on promotion can be made.
- 5. Outcome letter issued to the candidate by Human Resources.

Twice a year, Heads of Department /School will be advised that nominations can be made for internal candidates for promotion to Senior Lecturer, Reader, Principal Research Fellow, Principal Teaching Fellow, Principal Knowledge Exchange Fellow or Professor and noting that any cases for transfer to the Academic staff category may also be considered.

The Head of Department/School will submit to the Executive Dean a case for promotion /re-categorisation that will include:

- An up-to-date CV of the candidate.
- The candidate's most recent Review Record Form.
- A recommendation supplied by the Head of Department /School.
- For Reader, Principal Research

Fellow, Principal Teaching Fellow, Principal Knowledge Exchange Fellow and Professor cases, a statement compiled by the candidate in support of his/her application.

- Names and contact details of suggested External Assessors (six for Reader. Principal Research Fellow. Principal Teaching Fellow or Principal Knowledge Exchange Fellow and seven for Professor, including two or three names respectively nominated by the candidate). Cases for promotion/recategorisation to Lecturer or Senior Lecturer not require external assessment.
- Exceptionally, a candidate may submit case for promotion/recategorisation to Lecturer, Senior Lecturer, Reader or Professor directly to the Executive Dean of the Faculty for consideration; such a case will contain a CV, the most recent ADR Review Record Form, a statement provided by the candidate in support of his or her application and names of two External Assessors for Reader, or three for Professor. Such a personal case can also be made, on the same basis, for promotion to Principal Research Fellow, Principal Teaching Fellow, Principal Knowledge Exchange Fellow.

The Executive Dean and two Vice Deans will meet to review submissions, carefully vetting every case against the relevant criteria to ensure consistency. Thereafter, the Executive Dean will:

- a) Professional Appointments Panel, if the submission is supported.
- b) where relevant provide the names of the recommended assessors (six for a Readership or equivalent level Research, Teaching or Knowledge Exchange role, in total, and seven for a Professorship). These names must include those nominated by the candidate, who should

be clearly identified, and should include others recommended by the Department /School and the Faculty in order to ensure an overall balance of expertise and an appropriate spread of international esteem.

c) provide feedback to the candidate if the nomination is rejected, including information that the candidate has the right to make a personal submission to APAP. (The composition of APAP will not include the Executive Dean when deciding upon a personal submission.)

APAP will normally be convened in March and September each year and will be remitted to take decisions on cases for Lecturer and Senior Lecturer and to determine whether cases for internal promotion to Readership, or its equivalent level Research, Teaching or Knowledge Exchange role, or Professorship merit being submitted to external assessment. If a recommendation for Reader, Principal Research Fellow, Principal Teaching Fellow, Principal Knowledge Exchange Fellow or Professor is accepted by APAP, the formal process of external assessment will be initiated. The Director of HR will convene a meeting with the Principal as soon as possible after the APAP meeting and select a set of external assessors to be approached from the nominations. The Executive Deans of Faculty will then write to the assessors seeking their response within a month. Where APAP approve a promotion/re-categorisation to Lecturer or Senior Lecturer, HR will confirm their decision in writing to the candidate and the promotion will be effective from the beginning of the month following the APAP meeting. If the recommendation is rejected, the candidate will be informed in writing and oral feedback will be provided by the Dean if requested by the candidate. If APAP rejects a case it cannot be resubmitted until at least two years have elapsed. An appeal mechanism will be available where APAP rejects a case for promotion to Senior Lecturer lxxxvi

In the mean time University has its regrading policy that aims to reflect the University's commitment to equality of opportunity with respect to pay, development and career progression for staff^{lxxxvii}

It is also established a comprehensive Disciplinary Procedure which will be applied to all staff categories. The University reserves the right to commence disciplinary procedures at any appropriate level of formal warning depending on the seriousness of an offence or where there has been an earlier pattern of unacceptable standards with no satisfactory improvement. Warnings issued different reasons will be cumulative lxxxviii

Appendix 7. Data reporting and data analysis for Sweden

Data collection template 2: data per autonomy type (Sweden)

Staffing autonomy

Short description about the meeting:

Problem	Findings	Comments
/question		
formulation		
Capacity to	An analysis of the laws governing labour relations in the	Fundamental
decide on	higher education in Sweden shows that all institutions	normative acts
Recruitment	are free /autonomous as regards the right to set their own	regulating the activity
procedures.	recruitment procedures, taking into account the	of higher education
If there are	objectives of each institution.	institutions in Sweden
variances	That is the case including the Royal Institute of	do not contain
across	Technology (KTH) in Stockholm, which has developed	provisions relating to
universities,	its own internal procedures relating to the recruitment of	bodies responsible for
why is it the	the necessary personnel KTH opportunities to	the recruitment
case?	maintain the position of a successful technical university	procedure. Each higher
	at national and international levels largely depend on its	education institution
	employees. The goal of KTH Human Resource Policies	has the right to develop its own regulations.
	is to gain from the competence of its employees in the	its own regulations. For example, under the
	best possible way. Implementation of this policy is a	internal rules of the
	strategic issue that is the responsibility of all employees,	Royal Institute of
	or: KTH is a university where people from different backgrounds and with different experiences are working	Technology in
	together for a common goal: to manage, to renew and to	Stockholm – KTH,
	transfer knowledge. High levels of quality and ethics, a	schools /departments
	free and open exchange of ideas and opinions - this is the	are responsible for
	essence of KTH personnel policies at all levels. In this	recruitment and
	respet KTH is an employer where the desire to achieve	employment in their
	personal development and to accept human	field, and Faculty
	responsibility will be stimulated.	Councils are
	Recruitment policies target at filling positions at all	responsible for drafting
	levels with employees as competent and able to	procedural documents
	successfully perform their work tasks as possible. Any	together with the
	employment is intended to strengthen the overall	Human Resources
	competence of the institution. Any employment shall be	Department. Deans are
	made only after the testing procedures will be carried out	commonly appointed by
	and completed. Competence development and	the rector.
	knowledge transfer will take place continuously as a	
	natural element of work commitments. This balanced	
	competence management is achieved, by conducting the	
	recruitment of new staff both in the internal	
	environment, as well as in the external one. As	
	mentioned, recruitment of performant employees has no	

boundaries: the best will be employed, regardless of where they live and what nationality are; as long as they have the necessary skills demanded by the institution those employees will be among KTH staff.

The main laws governing higher education system are HE ACT (Higher Education Act) and HE Ordinance (Higher Education Ordinance). In principle, these laws establish the general conditions which the personnel hired by the higher education institutions must meet. It should be mentioned that both documents refer only to the academic staff, who participate directly in the teaching-research-knowledge transfer. KTH teachers are public sector employees and the appointment of teachers is the exercise of public authority. Some general provisions regarding the hiring of teachers can be found in the general labour legislation. Swedish Constitution states that administrative authorities operation is based on the equality of all before the law and that the authorities act objectively and impartially. It also states that employment in the public sector means that the selection of a candidate will be based only on merit and knowledge criteria. Transparency in the appointment procedure is guaranteed by the principle of public access to official documents. According to statistics, employees of higher education institutions make up 1/4 of public sector employees. During the study visit at KTH, it comes out that the university aims to create an institution of excellence through investment in the development of strong research environments in important areas. To achieve success, KTH must ensure recruitment of teachers in certain sectors considered of real importance for society. KTH has created a career system in order to attract prominent individuals. In order to achieve these aims, KTH adopted a personnel policy that rewards teachers who take responsibility for education and research, and for KTH relations with the outside world. This responsibility connects with the role and qualifications of the employee, being an important part of the overall evaluation of recruitment and promotion.

Capacity to decide on salaries.

1. Who is responsible for the salary policies? The HEI or another authority?

Salaries for all KTH staff except rector are determined locally. This includes both academic staff and administrative staff. KTH has clearly defined policy in the area of remuneration. The work is led by the rector. Salaries are reviewed on yearly basis and are defined as the result of negotiation of the rector and the unions.

Employer and employee representatives negotiate salary determining criteria for different groups of employees. Based on these criteria the

2. What is the salary structure? Are there any other supplements (scientific degree, working years)?

Upon negotiations, the level of the salary increase is determined for each year. The salary is individual and is being set annually on the base of a performance review. Each manager, who has responsibility for personnel is responsible for carrying out a performance review with the staff and decides on the level of the salary increase for each person.

3. Is the salary distinctive for distinctive academic position or is distinctive for particular persons?

According to KTH Salary Policy: "Salary shall be individual and differentiated". The salary is decided on the base of the requirements for the particular position and the person's way to comply with these requirements.

4. Are there established limits for the maximum amount of the salary for academic staff by the state? Other staff?

Swedish Government decides on the salary for the rector of the university. Decisions on staff salaries are taken locally.

Each full professor negotiates with the rector the salary on yearly basis. The amount of salary for every full professor is decided as result of negotiations between the professor and the rector.

5. How are the norms of staff's scientific and pedagogical work regulated?

Activities of the academic personal are to be carried out according to the internal instructions:

http://intra.kth.se/en/regelverk/personal/rekrytering/tenure-track-den-akademiska-karriarvagen-1.57367

According to this document there are no regulated norms for educational and/or research activities. The Tenure Track instructions only give guidance regarding the content of work on each academic position.

6. Is there any preferential tax regime for people working in HEI?

No, there are no preferences for the university staff in terms of taxation.

7. Does the payroll system for principals differ from one HEI to another? If yes what are the criteria?

As it was mentioned before, the rector's salary is decided by the government.

8. What kinds of incentives are paid to the HEI

school principal /head of department will evaluate each employee in order to establish the rightful wages. These criteria negotiated by the parties of the employment

relationship in higher education institutions will serve as basis for salary negotiation between the employee and the department head, etc.

Given the fact that every employee of higher education institutions is evaluated based on certain criteria, the salary will be individualized and differentiated one. The basic criteria for staff evaluation are referring to skills and work results obtained.

According to the Higher Education Ordinance work obligations of the academic staff include teaching, research, development and administration.

Similarly, according to the same act, employee's evaluation will account for its leadership skills and the possibility tocooperate with the local community and the environment. The great of majority institutions have developed their own

	staff? Procedures? There are no specific incentives for the staff. At the same time, in the framework of yearly performance review the manager shall decide on the salary of each individual person on the base of personal performance. There is also a possibility to apply for a special addition to the salary for a particular person due to his/her performance. 9. Is there any additional payment for using English in the work activity? No. Knowledge of English is the regular requirement for most of the positions.	criteria for the assessment of didactic staff in order to determine salaries.
	10. What social facilities are paid to HEI staff?It is the national system for social security.11. Is staff evaluation essential for the work retribution?Yes.	
Capacity to decide on dismissals.	 Is there any reason for the termination of an employment contract specific for HEI? If not enough students for the courses where a teacher is involved, his/her position can disapper which results in termination. For what legal reasons academic staff may be dismissed? In case if the funding of certain activities has finished. Are there any procedures for staff redundancies? The Head of Department reports to the Human resources that certain position is no longer needed. Human resources consider a possibility to move the person to another job. If this doesn't work out, the employee's contract is terminated. Is there the possibility for the academic staff to continue its activity if he fails self-evaluation? To be clarified. 	Higher education institutions in Sweden have freedom to decide on economic reasons underlying the termination of employment in case of workload reduction, but universities shall observe all agreed normative acts at country level regarding guarantees and compensations for employees who are in such a situation. Unions have a key role in exercising that freedom.
Capacity to decide on promotions (senior academic /senior administrative staff.	1. Is there any methodology for establishing the necessary number of posts (as for academic staff so for other staff)? This is decided on the School level. In case new positions are needed, the School Board applies to the Faculty Board in order to confirm the position. In certain cases when the position of professor becomes available (for example, due to retiring of a professor or moving to another institution) the Faculty Board reviews the situation and makes decision whether the position	According to the legislation of the higher education sector in Sweden every employee is entitled to be promoted during his/her career having the right to apply for a higher post if he/she meets the requirements

shall be filled or a new position for a professor in another subject area shall be opened.

2. Are number of posts regulated by any external authority?

No. The number of positions is decided internally by the university.

- 3. Are students involved in staff promotions? No.
- 4. Have students the right to select a particular lecturer for a particular course?

Usually no. Students have possibility to move to another group for lab works or seminars if a specific course is divided on several groups.

- 5. Have students the right to formulate complains on a staff behaviour? Is there any appropriate structure? Yes. It is available for each course and is strongly encouraged.
- 6. How is staff mobility regulated? Is it encouraged? Does a suspension of work contract operate in case of mobility? If yes in which cases and for how long?

A lot of possibilities for mobility are offered to the staff. All of them shall be approved by the Head of the Department.

7. What kind of procedures are used for promoting high level specialists?

See Tenute Track description on KTH web.

8. Is there any external structure for awarding the pedagogical scientific titles of professor and associate professor?

No. Everything is done internally.

9. Do academic staff from Sweden benefit of the so-called sabbatical leave?

Yes. But they have to raise their own funds for this purpose. Normally, the leave is 1 year.

10. What is the length of a usual annual leave? Is there any specific period to be used by staff?

For administrative staff it is 7 weeks -35 working days. For the academic staff it is normally during the summer period.

of the job submitted. Each higher education institution establishes its own procedures for employees's evaluation in case they want to advance in their careers.

The promotion procedure is similar to the one applied at employment. The body responsible for promotion the is Employment Committee which will verify the degree of compliance of the candidate with the position profile. Job description is developed for each position; it lists detail the employee's job duties as well as the requirements to position filling. Also, qualification criteria will be considered for the given position in order select the best performing candidate.

Decision on promoting or not promoting a candidate is likely to be appealed. Since promotion decision becomes final and irrevocable, the employment contract will be modified in order to promote and *implicitly* increase salary, and to define the period of employment.

Appendix 8. Data reporting and data analysis for Denmark

Data collection template 2: data per autonomy type (Denmark)

Staffing autonomy

Short description about the meeting:

Problem /question	Findings	Comments
formulation		
Capacity of	According to the Danish Act on	The Danish Act on Universities and
higher education	Universities, universities are	the Ministerial Order on the
institutions to	independent institutions, government-	Appointment of Academic Staff at
decide on	funded within the public administration	Danish Universities establish the
Recruitment	under the Ministry of Science,	structure of academic positions,
procedures.	Technology and Innovation. According	recruitment procedures for staff,
If there are any	to Art. 49 of the Act, the universities in	universities having the right to
differences across	Denmark should follow the rules	develop these provisions through the
universities, why	established by the Ministry of Finance,	adoption of internal laws, which will
is it the case?	regarding the terms of employment and	describe in detail these procedures.
	remuneration of staff in higher	It is obvious that mixed regulatory
	education institutions of Denmark. The	procedures are present both at
	Ministry of Science, Innovation and	central and institutional level.
	Higher Education in the Ministerial	
	Order on the Appointment of Academic	
	Staff at Danish Universities laid down	
	the rules regarding the employment of	
	academic staff. The purpose of this	
	Order is to establish a general	
	framework and to adjust to it the	
	internal regulations of each institution in	
	order not to violate the interests of the	
	employer/employee relationships. The	
	provisions of this Order refers to the	
	academic staff described in the	
	Memorandum on Job Structure for	
	Academic Staff at Universities and the	
	general framework of staff positions,	
	terms of position filling, evaluation	
	procedures, establishing that universities	
	have the right to set additional rules.	
	According to the Danish Act on	
	Universities, the University Council	
	(The Board) is the supreme authority of	
	the higher education institution, with the	
	role of protecting the interests of the	
	institution and determining its policies	
	related to the development and long-	

term activities. For example, University of Aalborg Board responsible for employing the rector and the top managers. Rector's employment procedure is preceded by a public announcement about the vacancy, and a fixed-term contract will be concluded with the person selected; the period of the fixed-term contract is decided by the University Council, with the possibility of its extension.

The University Council sets up a Committee in charge of employment. The Committee is composed of representatives of academic, technical, and administrative staff and students representatives, as well. The Committee will make an overall assessment of the candidates' profile and will carry out interviews with selected candidates only. The appointment Committee may recommend only three applicants for a position. The decision on who will be employed belongs to the Council. Chairman of the Board or its deputy is also Chairman of the appointment Committee. The University Council, on the recommendation of the rector, will employ one or more pro-rectors. The pro-rector should be a well-known and notorious person in the field of research. The Pro-rector shall be the Rector's deputy. If more than one Pro-rector is appointed, the Rector shall nominate one to be the deputy. The employment of pro-rector is preceded by the following procedure: The Rector will appoint a Committee consisting of representatives of academic, administrative and technical staff and student representatives, as well. This Committee shall assess the candidates' background and those selected will be recommended to take an interview. The Rector will appoint one candidate for a Similarly, the University position. Director employed on the recommendation of the Rector of the university (in the case of Aalborg University the Director undertakes administrative and financial responsibility of the University). Vacant position is advertised publicly, and the Rector sets up a selection committee, composed of executive management and administrative staff representatives, a dean and the director of another university. The Rector is the Chairman of the Committee.

Deans are employed by the rector. The vacancy is announced publicly and the Rector shall set up an appointment Committee, chaired by the Rector. The appointment Committee is composed of representatives of academic, technical and administrative staff and students' representatives, as well. employment of Dean is done for a fixed duration period determined by the Rector. subject to renewal. Committee will assess candidates' files and will recommend only one candidate for approval to the Rector. Deans, in turn, are responsible for hiring Heads of Departments at the proposal of the respective study board. The Dean may consult the department, involved in the respective study programme, regarding appointment of programme directors. At the same time, the Dean must be sure that the recommended candidates have the necessary skills for filling the given position.

Library director shall be employed by the rector, following public announcement. The Rector will appoint a recruitment committee chaired by the Rector, with representatives of the library staff and management and the faculties. The committee will also include external experts in the field of librarianship.

The other employees, including academic staff are employed by the

Rector.

Capacity to decide on salaries.

Employees with the same seniority and experience in labour activity who are employed in similar positions receive remuneration equal conditions. Collective agreement on wages in Danish universities is negotiated by the Ministry of Finance and the Danish Confederation of **Professional** Associations. The salary of each employee will be negotiated with representatives of trade unions. The basic salary of all academic staff, with the exception of professor, is established within a pay scale from level 4 to level 8. As a rule, to be employed at level 4, the employee must be holder of Master's degree or equivalent degree of Danish Master.

Pay scale rating will be made annually for a level. The remuneration of academic staff is not done with the account of seniority criterion in labour activity, but based on a distinct salary for this position.

At the employment of each representative of academic staff under the MoU on the job structure each employee will be awarded a bonus specific to each academic position.

In addition to the basic salary and bonuses for different categories of positions, the employees are awarded pay supplements to the wages set under collective negotiations between the University management and the negotiating employee organisation /representative.

Capacity to decide on dismissals.

of the academic Any member terminate community may resignation their employment contract on their own initiative. In this respect, there must be a period of notice. Usually a written notice is dispatched at least month before the date

According to the Danish Ministry of Finance Circular of 21.09.2009, regarding the Framework Agreement on the new pay system, the right to negotiate and conclude agreements on pay system is decentralized. The signing of these agreements is for the parties who are authorized to do so. Within the university these negotiations are held annually and refer only to salary supplements. Basic salaries are regulated by government acts. Negotiations are carried between two parties, employers' and employees' representatives. Representatives of the University management will participate in bargaining depending on the level subdivisions which to negotiations refer.

Managers who have the power to negotiate wages may appeal to the assistance of subdivision's manager where the employees, whose salary is subject to negotiation, work. The negotiator must be aware of the acts regulating and the state-of-art in subdivision.

The employees are represented by unions. Where there are no trade unions in the university, the managers of the institution will appeal to the sectoral trade union.

The University management is obliged to disclose information on financial resources intended for wages payment.

The Danish state offers limited autonomy as regards the freedom to decide on the termination of employment contracts. The university is free to decide on the opportunity of a motive or another one, to decide on the extension of

resignation.

Dismissal – termination of employment contract by the employer can occur in two situations:

- dismissal on the violation of labour discipline. It will operate only when several disciplinary violations on the part of employee were previously recorded and disciplinary sanctions have applied to the Disciplinary sanctions must be made with the prior approval of the departmental trade body union (subdivisions where the employee works and the employee must present a written explanation on the committed disciplinary offense).
- dismissal for economic reasons, which can occur either by reducing positions or under other institutional circumstances such as reduced budget financing, closing a program of studies etc. General conditions regarding non-discrimination on various criteria of employees subject to dismissal for economic reasons should be observed. The dismissal of employees on economic grounds will lead to awarding a dismissal bonus established under the laws in force.

In both cases the trade unions will be consulted within universities and the following periods of notice will be observed:

- 1 month for employees who have been employed for less than 6 months;
- 3 months if the employment period exceeded 6 months:
- 4 months after three years of employment. For each 3-year period of employment one month is added, but the period of 6 months will be not exceeded.

working agreements in case of their expiration or find solutions for retention of academic staff in higher education, but in all cases the institutions are required to comply with the established procedures for employees of the public sector and ensure guarantees provided for by law.

Capacity to decide on promotions

According to the Order of the Danish Ministry of Higher Education, Danish Act on Universities establishes minimum conditions

(senior academic /senior administrative staff.

universities set their rules on the academic evaluation of candidates for various positions within the organization.

The purpose of evaluation is to determine whether the candidate meets the requirements described in the job occupational description (job structure) and requirements for the position described in the employment announcement.

In particular the candidate competences research teaching, communication will be assessed. Evaluation results shall be recorded in writing and will be presented to the Rector. If the evaluation committee has a different opinion, it will necessarily be indicated the minutes. in evaluation composition of the committee is decided at university level. Generally. as members committee, experts in the evaluated field, holding at least the skills necessary for the assessed position, will be appointed. The members of the evaluation committee should hold at least the position of associate professor. The work of the evaluation committee is carried out by the chairman, secretary and ordinary members only. They are all obliged to operate under the principle of confidentiality and gender equality.

The activity of invited academic staff is not evaluated.

Appointment of Chairman and members of the evaluation committee is the competence of the Academic Council; the Rector will establish the deadline for submission of the evaluation report. The criteria for evaluation are set forth in the Memorandum on the Job structure.

The result of the evaluation, which will be qualified (when the candidate meets the requirements) or unqualified (when necessary for the evaluation of the academic staff. However, to fulfill the university freedom regarding its own criteria and procedures for personnel evaluation, universities establish their own regulations. State intervention in this area is minimal, given that performance indicators underlying the institutions accreditation involves a serious and rigorous assessment of staff.

the candidate does not meet the requirements), will serve as the basis for employment or where appropriate, promotion of employee within the academic career.

The purpose of the Evaluation Committee is to ensure an impartial, qualified and objective evaluation of academic skills of the candidates to academic positions presenting a detailed description of teaching, research and knowledge transfer and other relevant skills required for a certain activity. The Committee should not take prioritization of candidates for certain positions, and each candidate is assessed individually.

Students of Danish higher education institutions are encouraged to play a crucial role in learning and take responsibility for conducting research activity within a small group of colleagues. Teacher evaluation by students is part of the internal Quality management system, students are encouraged to address analytically both the quality of the course, as well as the quality of teaching.

Appendix 9. Data reporting and data analysis for Romania

Data collection template 2: data per autonomy type (Romania)

Staffing autonomy

Short description about the meeting:

Problem /question	Findings	Comments
formulation		
Capacity to decide	Procedures for recruitment	In Romania the National Education
on Recruitment	/employment in higher education	Law no. 1 of 5 January 2011
procedures.	institutions in Romania is in	establishes that university autonomy
If there are	compliance with the provisions of	is guaranteed by the Constitution,
differences across	the Framework Methodology for	and academic freedom is guaranteed
universities, why is	filling vacant teaching and research	by law. In this connection, it is
it the case?	positions in higher education,	recognized that the university
	approved by Decree no. 457/2011,	community has the right to establish
	published in the Official Gazette no.	its own mission, institutional
	371 of 26.05.2011. Higher education	strategy, structure, activities,
	institutions were required, within 60	organization and operation,
	days from the date of entry into force	infrastructure and human resources
	of this decision, to draw up their own	management, in strict compliance
	methodology for filling vacancies in	with the law.
	strict accordance with the provisions of	Selection, employment, periodic
	the Framework Methodology. Own	evaluation, training, motivation and
	methodology is approved by the	termination of employment
	University Senate and is published on	agreement are the responsibility of
	the website of higher education	the personnel department director,
	institution.	the head of the Doctoral school or
	In accordance with these normative	dean, according to the University
	acts, the proposal for organizing the	Charter.
	contest for a vacancy is made by the	Above-named law describes in detail
	director of department or head of the	the recruiting procedures, how to
	doctoral school in the structure of	conclude employment agreements,
	which the position is found, by	higher education institutions being
	reference approved by the Department	free to decide on the selection of
	Council or Doctoral School Board and	candidates.
	the Faculty Council.	
	The Recruitment Commission is the	
	body reponsible for recruitment	
	/employment procedures. The	
	composition of the Recruitment	
	Commission is determined after	
	publication of the announcement	
	regarding the vacant positions, for	
	each vacancy. For example at the	
	"Stefan cel Mare" University of	
	Sterair cer maie emiversity of	

Suceava, the Recruitment Commission is established and approved within 30 days since the publication of the announcement in the Official Gazette Romania. The Recruitment Commission may include deputy members. The Council of the Department or Doctoral School, announcing the vacant position, makes proposals for the nominal composition of the Recruitment Commission. The composition of the Recruitment Commission is proposed by the Dean, taking into account the proposals of the Council of Department or Doctoral School, and is approved by the Faculty Council. The nominal composition of the Recruitment Commission accompanied by the approval of the Faculty Council is submitted to the Senate University for approval. Following approval by the University Senate, the Recruitment Commission is appointed by the Rector's decision. Within two working days after the Rector's decision it is sent to the Ministry of Education, Research, Youth and Sports, and the nominal composition of the Recruitment Commission is published on the website of the contest. If positions of associate professor, professor, degree scientific researcher and I degree scientific researche announced then the composition of the Recruitment Commission is published in the Official Gazette of Romania, Part III. If higher education institutions of the defense system, public order and national security are recruiting its academic staff, Rector's decision is sent also to the relevant ministries.

Capacity to decide on salaries.

Responsibility for establishing the system and methodology of labour remuneration rests solely with the higher education institution. The University Senate is responsible for the

In Romania, the remuneration of academic staff and auxiliary didactic personnel is realized according to Law (no. 63 of 10 May 2011) on employment and wages of teaching

management, use and disposition of funds for labour remuneration of the university employees. The institution draws up its annual budget of revenues and expenditures, which includes expenses for wages. The accuracy and legality of the use of funds for wages is verified by the competent bodies empowered with this right.

staff and auxiliary didactic personnel in 2011. Thus, this normative act sets a maximum salary for a professor with an experience of over 40 years in education, which is situated between 3733 RON and 6971 RON. In contrast, a junior lecturer with experience up to three years will earn between 1123 RON and 1575 RON. Salaries in terms of support staff ranges between the minimum salary in economy and amounts exceeding 2000 RON, a Chief Officer Operating having best remuneration, believed to be part of the auxiliary personnel, the amount being between 1415 RON and 2790 RON. To these are added bonuses of various kinds, which together make up the basic salary.

Capacity to decide on dismissals.

Dismissal from the management position in education applies to the employee who committed serious and repeated violations, for which he was punished already, and which caused material injury or seriously affected the image of the University. Being the last but one disciplinary sanction before termination of the employment agreement, the application of sanction is done with the assumption that the correction of the person who was sanctioned still possible. Disciplinary termination of the employment agreement is the maximum penalty that can be applied both for intentionally committing particularly serious and repeated violations and for violating repeatedly the obligations of the employee, such as to seriously disrupt the work order and the University activity. The finding of serious misconduct or repeated violations of the rules of labour discipline will lead to employee dismissal by the University under Article 61, paragraph 1, letter a of the

Termination of employment relations of the teaching staff of higher education institutions takes place by law or at the initiative of the parties. The procedures are those of the general labour law, an exception being cases of staff dismissal from management positions. Besides situations as provided by the National Education the Law, institutions establish their own rules conditions. failure achievement of which lead to bad faith dismissal of the manager. University autonomy means public responsibility for managerial act.

Labour Code.

Capacity to decide on promotions (senior academic /senior administrative staff).

Results and performance of teaching and research activity of the academic staff in universities are evaluated periodically at intervals not exceeding 5 years. This assessment is made in accordance with a methodology approved and applied by the University Senate. The remuneration of the academic staff is done according to their results and performance. The employment agreements of teaching staff include and research assumption of minimum standards of teaching and research results and clauses regarding the termination of agreements in terms of non-fulfillment of those minimum standards. These standards are part of the policies referring to the quality of each higher education. For example at the "Stefan cel Mare" University of Suceava, the implementation of the quality policy by the institution management and the management of existing organizational structures envisages excellence. competence and responsibility. Their assessment is done through a set of indicators that allow their numerical evaluation. The indicators correlated with external requirements involve elements benchmarking. Their coverage achieved via the strategic plans adopted every four years and the annual operational plans developed. Indicators allow the development of internal quality control mechanisms to implement the quality assurance system approved by the University Senate. The following components are used by the "Stefan cel Mare" University of Suceava to assess quality: areas (teaching, research, international internships, relations, activities of administrative nature), criteria, own procedures, standards and

National Education Law no. 1 of 5 January 2011 establishes minimum conditions necessary for evaluation of the academic staff, and for the realization of the freedom of universities to establish their own criteria and procedures for the evaluation of personnel, institutions develop their own regulations, which are part of the quality management system. Regulations developed by the government donot contain performance indicators, these being elaborated by the institution; but the state monitors the fulfilment of assessment procedures via the Romanian Agency for Higher Education Accreditation and Certification.

performance indicators, found methodologies of external evaluation of standards, reference standards and list of performance indicators used by ARACIS. The evaluation of teachers is complex and integrating and involves self evaluation, peer evaluation, evaluation by the direct supervisor and student evaluation. Self-assessment /evaluation of academic staff provides information on teaching, scientific research, national and international recognition, work with students and work in the academic community, reported at various time periods. The evaluation results are open publicly for members of the department, faculty leadership and university governing bodies without imposing any restriction of access. Assessment applies only to teachers who have carried out tasks in the university according to the job description at least six months in a calendar year. Peer review seeks the fulfillment of professional ethics by each teacher and personal qualities manifested as a member of the department. Criteria for evaluation comprise peer quantification of the following activities: participation in departmental activities (engage in collective life, joint actions, respond to supplementary requests); participation in faculty and university actions; teamwork: participation in activities. joint of projects, programmes study, and research scientific activities; assuming responsibilities: consistency and promptness in carrying out tasks; promoting the image of faculty /university; professional attitude and behaviour: being objective, expressing views, but the language and attitude do not infringe the rights of others; communication skills: cultivating positive climate; showing respect for

colleagues: provide support colleagues, comply with the rules of group; promoting creativity: initiating and organizing performant actions in the department; concern for the quality of educational activities provided. Peer review activities will be organized over a period of up to six working days. All teachers are subject to peer review process once a year at the end of the calendar year. The procedure of peer review involves all members of the department where the evaluated teacher works.

The University Charter of many higher education institutions in Romania stipulates the right of students to participate in the evaluation of teaching work. For example, the students of "Alexandru Ioan Cuza" University of Iasi have the right to participate in the evaluation of courses, internships seminars. and education and/or related organizational aspects relevant to the study programs envisaged. These assessments serve as basis for evaluating the performance of these courses, seminars, internships, curricula and academic staff.

The assessment of academic staff performance by students is compulsory at "Stefan cel Mare" University of Suceava. Evaluation results are public information.

i .

ⁱ In this column provide just citation (e.g., von Prondzynski (2012), but in the end note provide full reference with the link; if the link is too long, use http://goo.gl/ to shorten the links; the link in end note ii coincides with the place where the documents are – so it is ok to use the link as it is – however, in most cases you need to provide exact link to the download of the document (using http://goo.gl/ to display the link)

http://www3.lrs.lt/pls/inter3/dokpaieska.showdoc e?p id=438419&p tr2=2

http://www.mruni.eu/mru lt dokumentai/apie mru/dokumentai/mru statutas 20120926 XI-2233 en.pdf

http://www.mruni.eu/mru lt dokumentai/apie mru/dokumentai/mru statutas 20120926 XI-2233 en.pdf

http://www3.lrs.lt/pls/inter3/dokpaieska.showdoc_e?p_id=187978&p_tr2=2

vi http://www3.lrs.lt/pls/inter3/dokpaieska.showdoc_e?p_id=287046&p_tr2=2

vii http://www.vu.lt/site_files/Adm/statutas/VU_Statute.pdf

viii http://www.mruni.eu/mru lt dokumentai/apie mru/dokumentai/mru statutas 20120926 XI-2233 en.pdf

http://www.mruni.eu/mru lt dokumentai/apie mru/dokumentai/mru statutas 20120926 XI-2233 en.pdf

```
x http://www3.lrs.lt/pls/inter3/dokpaieska.showdoc e?p id=438419&p tr2=2
xi http://www.vu.lt/site files/Adm/statutas/VU Statute.pdf
http://www3.lrs.lt/pls/inter3/dokpaieska.showdoc e?p id=438419&p tr2=2
http://www.mruni.eu/mru It dokumentai/apie mru/dokumentai/mru statutas 20120926 XI-2233 en.pdf
http://www.mruni.eu/mru lt dokumentai/apie mru/dokumentai/mru statutas 20120926 XI-2233 en.pdf
** http://www3.lrs.lt/pls/inter3/dokpaieska.showdoc_e?p_id=187978&p_tr2=2
http://www3.lrs.lt/pls/inter3/dokpaieska.showdoc e?p id=287046&p tr2=2
http://www.vu.lt/site_files/Adm/statutas/VU_Statute.pdf
http://www3.lrs.lt/pls/inter3/dokpaieska.showdoc_e?p_id=438419&p_tr2=2
xix http://www.mruni.eu/mru lt dokumentai/apie mru/dokumentai/mru statutas 20120926 XI-2233 en.pdf
** http://www.mruni.eu/mru_lt_dokumentai/apie_mru/dokumentai/2010-
2020 strategic activities plan of mru 20131119.pdf
**i http://www.mruni.eu/mru It dokumentai/apie mru/dokumentai/mru statutas 20120926 XI-2233 en.pdf
http://www3.lrs.lt/pls/inter3/dokpaieska.showdoc e?p id=187978&p tr2=2
http://www.vu.lt/site_files/Adm/statutas/VU_Statute.pdf
http://www.vu.lt/site_files/Adm/statutas/VU_Statute.pdf
xxv In this column provide just citation (e.g., von Prondzynski (2012), but in the end note provide full reference
with the link; if the link is too long, use http://goo.gl/ to shorten the links; the link in end note ii coincides with
the place where the documents are - so it is ok to use the link as it is - however, in most cases you need to
provide exact link to the download of the document (using <a href="http://goo.gl/">http://goo.gl/</a> to display the link)
xxvi http://www.strath.ac.uk/hr/recruitingatstrathclyde/assessmentofrecruitmentneeds/
http://www.strath.ac.uk/hr/careerpathways/academicprofessionalstaff/
xxviii http://www.strath.ac.uk/hr/careerpathways/supportstaff/
xxix http://www.strath.ac.uk/media/ps/humanresources/Academic Probation Guidelines 20130103.pdf
http://www.strath.ac.uk/media/ps/humanresources/promotion/Indicators of Requirements for Senior Aca
demic Promotions.pdf
xxxi http://www.strath.ac.uk/media/ps/humanresources/policies/Fixed Term Contracts Use Policy.pdf
http://www.scottishuniversitygovernance.ac.uk/
http://www.strath.ac.uk/media/ps/humanresources/pay/salaryscales/Salary_Scales_Web_Version_-
 01.08.2013.pdf
http://www.strath.ac.uk/finance/financialservices/payrollpensions/
http://www.strath.ac.uk/media/ps/humanresources/Academic Probation Guidelines 20130103.pdf
http://www.strath.ac.uk/media/ps/humanresources/adr/ADRPolicy.pdf
http://www.strath.ac.uk/media/ps/humanresources/promotion/Promotion Procedure for Senior Academic
Professional Staff.pdf
http://www.strath.ac.uk/media/ps/humanresources/promotion/promotionformsnew/Promotion_from_Lectu
rer A to Lecturer B Additional Guidance.pdf
http://www.strath.ac.uk/hr/learninganddevelopment/
http://www.strath.ac.uk/media/ps/humanresources/Regrading Policy for Non Academic Staff.pdf
xii In this column provide just citation (e.g., von Prondzynski (2012), but in the end note provide full reference
with the link; if the link is too long, use http://goo.gl/ to shorten the links; the link in end note ii coincides with
the place where the documents are - so it is ok to use the link as it is - however, in most cases you need to
provide exact link to the download of the document (using <a href="http://goo.gl/">http://goo.gl/</a> to display the link)
http://intra.kth.se/en/regelverk/personal/rekrytering/tenure-track-den-akademiska-karriarvagen-1.57367
http://intra.kth.se/en/regelverk/personal/rekrytering/anstallningsordning-for-larare-bilaga-3-anstallning-
som-bitradande-lektor-1.278756
xiiv http://www.uhr.se/sv/Information-in-English/Laws-and-regulations/The-Swedish-Higher-Education-Act
http://www.uhr.se/sv/Information-in-English/Laws-and-regulations/The-Higher-Education-Ordinance/
http://intra.kth.se/en/regelverk/policyer/personalpolicyer
```

164

http://www.uhr.se/sv/Information-in-English/Laws-and-regulations/The-Swedish-Higher-Education-Act http://www.uhr.se/sv/Information-in-English/Laws-and-regulations/The-Higher-Education-Ordinance/

http://intra.kth.se/en/regelverk/policyer/sprakpolicy-for-kth-2010-1.60909

http://goo.gl/S8JadS

```
http://intra.kth.se/en/regelverk/policyer/personalpolicyer
```

http://fivu.dk/en/legislation/prevailing-laws-and-regulations/education/the-danish-university-act.pdf/view http://fivu.dk/en/legislation/prevailing-laws-and-regulations/education/ministerial-order-on-theappointment-of-academic-staff-at-universities.pdf

http://fivu.dk/en/legislation/prevailing-laws-and-regulations/education/memorandum-on-job-structure-foracademic-staff-at-universities-2007.pdf

http://fivu.dk/en/legislation/prevailing-laws-and-regulations/education/annex-to-memorandum-on-jobstructure-for-academic-staff-at-universities.pdf

http://www.en.hr.aau.dk/forms/

https://www.workindenmark.dk/en/Find information/Til arbejdstagere/Naar du arbeider i Danmark/Ansa ettelseskontrakt/Det skal kontrakten indeholde

http://fivu.dk/en/legislation/prevailing-laws-and-regulations/education/ministerial-order-on-confermentof-the-titles-of-affiliated-professor-and-affiliated-associate-professor.pdf

http://www.en.hr.aau.dk/key-hr-performance-indicators/

Law on HE and Research

hxvii MRUNI Staff salaries description, MRUNI rector order staff payment conditions

lxviii The Statute of MRUNI

lxix The Statute of MRUNI

lxx Labor Law

lxxi The Statute of MRUNI, Law on HE and Research

Report of the Review of Higher Education Governance in Scotland, chaired by Professor Ferdinand von Prondzynski

^{lxxiii} University Regulations

Strathclyde University Strategic Plan 2011-2015

lxxv Strathclyde University Recruitment schedule

bxxvi Guidance on developing job descriptions and job descriptions templates

^{lxxvii} National Agreement on Procedure and Criteria for Probation

kxxviii Guidelines for probationary period at Strathclyde University

^{lxxix} Appointment of relatives

http://www.strath.ac.uk/media/ps/humanresources/pay/salaryscales/Salary Scales Web Version -01.08.2013.pdf

http://www.strath.ac.uk/finance/financialservices/payroll/staffpayments/#d.en.200708

Use of fixed term and open ended employment contracts Policy

lxxxiii Staff development policy

http://www.strath.ac.uk/hr/learninganddevelopment/

Promotion from Lecturer A to Lecturer B Procedures

lxxxvi Promotion procedures for senior staff

kxxxvii Regrading fro Research, Teaching, Administrative and operational services Policy

lxxxviii Disciplinary procedure

lxxxix Kungliga Tekniska högskolan (KTH) Human Resources Policy

http://intra.kth.se/en/regelverk/personal/rekrytering/tenure-track-den-akademiska-karriarvagen-1.57367

http://www.uhr.se/sv/Information-in-English/Laws-and-regulations/The-Swedish-Higher-Education-Act

http://www.uhr.se/sv/Information-in-English/Laws-and-regulations/The-Higher-Education-Ordinance/

http://intra.kth.se/en/regelverk/policyer/personalpolicyer

In this column provide just citation (e.g., von Prondzynski (2012), but in the end note provide full reference with the link; if the link is too long, use http://goo.gl/ to shorten the links; the link in end note ii coincides with the place where the documents are - so it is ok to use the link as it is - however, in most cases you need to provide exact link to the download of the document (using http://goo.gl/ to display the link)

http://www.en.hr.aau.dk/forms/